Believable Worlds:

The Rules, Role and Function of Magic in Fantasy Novels

A thesis

submitted in fulfilment

of the requirements for the degree

of

Master of Arts

at

The University of Waikato

by

Karl S. W. Guethert

THE UNIVERSITY OF
WAIKATO
Te Whare Wānanga o Waikato

2016

Abstract

Contemporary fantasy fiction is a genre that has captured the minds of readers and authors for many decades. It places stories about fantastical events and peoples in the realms of an imaginary world that follows its own set of structural rules. Authors delve into different facets of writing to deliver an engaging and immersive story for the readers, with fantasy tropes and narrative working together to build a compelling story. The worlds that authors write about include new twists on fantasy elements and invariably include some rendition of magic within a hyper exaggerated reflection of the real world, or a completely imagined world altogether

This thesis interrogates the role of magic in fantasy fiction. It argues that magic is fundamental to both the world-building of fantasy settings and the arc of fantasy narratives. At its best magic is fully integrated and explained, providing readers with a convincing immersive experience, although at times authors use magic more cavalierly as a convenient trope. By focusing on the fiction of the founding father of contemporary fantasy – J. R.R. Tolkien – and analysing the way in which more recent writers (in particular Brandon Sanderson, Terry Pratchett, and the creators of the Warhammer World) build on and at times challenge Tolkien's legacy I aim to highlight the series of challenges confronting authors of fantasy fiction. They need to firstly have a full understanding of how magic works in their own created worlds. Magic intersects with every aspect of fantasy fiction — narrative, setting, character — and authors need to be able to communicate sufficient understanding of how these magical systems work

without submerging their readers with dense descriptions and information overload. At its best, fantasy provides readers with a sense that the fictional worlds they enter are fully realised and, through suspension of disbelief, could possibly exist. Given that fantasy fiction is full of ever-recycling tropes (such as magical rings, magical beings, and seemingly impossible feats of courage and power), writers also have to navigate the tricky path of tapping into the tropes which readers expect and enjoy while attempting to create something new. Magic is such a fundamental building block of fantasy worlds that at times authors also draw parallels between this source of power and the hierarchies, constructs, and ideologies that dominate our own world. My argument throughout is that the best fantasy fiction achieves a deft balance between both action and explanation and entertainment and social critique.

I am a creative writer as well as a literary scholar and throughout my investigation is informed by my desire to critically examine magic in contemporary fantasy in order to hone my skills as a writer. This thesis has a creative practice element and my analysis is interspersed with extracts from my own fantasy fiction which form a dialogue with the critical elements.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. Kirstine Moffat, for all the help she has given me in getting this thesis to this final state. Without her input I would not have made it to this stage.

Also, a big thank you to Joshua Morris for his help with editing.

I would also like to thank both Erin Doyle and Melody Wilkinson for their help with editing the Creative Interludes.

Finally, to all the friends I had to ignore or otherwise refrain from spend time with in order to get this thesis done, thank-you all for your patience.

Table of Contents

Introduction

Magic is a core ingredient of fantasy. John Clute, in *The Encyclopaedia of Fantasy*, argues that 'The primary assumption is that magic is possible in the world of fantasy, and the exact nature of this ambient magic strongly influences the narrative'.[1] Yet magic manifests in different ways in the work of different authors. In J.R.R. Tolkien's seminal *Lord of the Rings* (1954) trilogy Gandalf defeats a pack of wolves by 'suddenly grow[ing]' and 'lift[ing] a burning branch' to create a 'white radiance like lightning'.[2] There is no explanation as to how Gandalf achieves this feat, or where his power comes from, it is simply presented as a useful ability that can be used to aid the protagonists in difficult and dangerous situations. In contrast, Brandon Sanderson provides extensive explanations about the place of magic in Sel, the fictional setting of *Elantris* (2005). The protagonist Raoden undertakes a quest to understand how magic works, and how it can be used to his advantage. The process of creating magic in this universe is identified as an Aon, which is described as the drawing of a symbol in order to cast a spell. This process involves tapping into the AonDor, the source of magic, which Sanderson describes as the 'unseen power – it is in everything, but cannot be touched'.[3]

This thesis interrogates the role of magic in fantasy fiction. It argues that magic is fundamental to both the world-building of fantasy settings and the arc of fantasy narratives. At its best magic is fully integrated and explained, providing

---

[1] John Clute, 'Magic', in *The Encyclopedia of Fantasy*, ed. by John Clute and John Grant (London: Orbit, 1997), p. 616.
[2] J. R. R. Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings* (London: HarperCollins, 1995) p. 291.
[3] Brandon Sanderson, *Elantris* (London: Gollancz, 2011), p. 266 and p. 276.

readers with a convincing immersive experience, although at times authors use magic more cavalierly as a convenient trope. By focusing on the fiction of the founding father of contemporary fantasy – J. R.R. Tolkien – and analysing the way in which more recent writers build on and at times challenge Tolkien's legacy I aim to highlight the series of challenges confronting authors of fantasy fiction. They need to firstly have a full understanding of how magic works in their own created worlds. Magic intersects with every aspect of fantasy fiction — narrative, setting, character — and authors need to be able to communicate sufficient understanding of how these magical systems work without submerging their readers with dense descriptions and information overload. At its best, fantasy provides readers with a sense that the fictional worlds they enter are fully realised and, through suspension of disbelief, could possibly exist. Given that fantasy fiction is full of ever-recycling tropes (such as magical rings, magical beings, and seemingly impossible feats of courage and power), writers also have to navigate the tricky path of tapping into the tropes which readers expect and enjoy while attempting to create something new. Magic is such a fundamental building block of fantasy worlds that at times authors also draw parallels between this source of power and the hierarchies, constructs, and ideologies that dominate our own world. My argument throughout is that the best fantasy fiction achieves a deft balance between both action and explanation and entertainment and social critique.

This introduction begins by defining three key terms. I will first examine the genre that is my focus — contemporary fantasy — and how it has been analysed and critiqued. I will also focus attention on an aspect of the genre fundamental to my discussion: world building and the creation of what has

variously been termed the imaginary world, the secondary world, and the fantasy world. Finally, I will then turn to my primary concern: magic within these fantasy worlds. While much has been written about fantasy, magic remains underexplored in comparison. Building on definitions from reference works and critical texts I will consider what constitutes magic and interrogate whether it has any definable boundaries. Having established these contexts I will then introduce the authors who will be my primary focus. I am a creative writer as well as a literary scholar and throughout my investigation is informed by my desire to critically examine magic in contemporary fantasy in order to hone my skills as a writer. This thesis has a creative practice element and my analysis is interspersed with extracts from my own fantasy fiction which form a dialogue with the critical elements.

Fantasy is a genre that has gripped readers' imaginations for many decades, and continues to do so today. The genre has received considerable critical attention, with the key scholarly texts on the subject tending to examine it from a single aspect: that of quantification. The declared goal of these critics is to define and quantify what fantasy is, what genre it belongs to, and how it fits into the overarching structure of "literature". Edward James and Farah Mendlesohn in *The Cambridge Companion to Fantasy Literature* discuss how much work has been undertaken by scholars, each aiming to define fantasy:

> Fantasy literature has proven tremendously difficult to pin down. The major theorists in the field – Tzvetan Todorov, Rosemary Jackson, Kathryn Hume, W. R. Irwin and Colin Manlove – all agree that fantasy is about the construction of the impossible whereas science fiction may be about the unlikely, but is grounded in the scientifically possible. But from there these critics quickly depart, each to generate definitions of fantasy

which include the texts that they value and exclude most of what general readers think of fantasy. Most of them consider primarily texts of the nineteenth and early twentieth century.[4]

The key scholars each refine their definitions of fantasy in different ways. Todorov, considered as one of the founding critics on contemporary fantasy, writes about the characteristics of a fantasy novel from a structural analysis perspective, defining verbal, syntactical and semantic aspects of the text, or the literary "signifier": figurative discourse, first person narrator, or syntactical aspect.[5] He also examines fantasy more from what it is not, presenting a flowchart of sorts broken down as: uncanny – fantastic-uncanny – fantastic-marvellous – marvellous, where fantasy as we would define it today lies roughly at the very centre.[6] He maintains that events with realistic explanations are uncanny, whereas mysterious or unexplained events are marvellous. Hume in *Fantasy and Mimesis: Responses to Reality in Western Literature* suggests that there is no overarching definition for fantasy, that 'each observation [of fantasy] is accurate for that part of the whole to which it applies, but none can stand as a description for the entire beast'.[7] Attebery in *Stories about Stories: Fantasy and the Remaking of Myth* seemingly challenges Hume, proposing a "fuzzy set" that views genres as 'categories defined not by a clear boundary or any defining characteristic but by resemblance to a single core example or group of examples'.[8] Attebery also proposed that readers and scholars:

---

[4] Edward James and Farah Mendlesohn, *The Cambridge Companion to Fantasy Literature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), p. 1.

[5] Tzvetan Todorov, *The Fantastic*: *A Structural Approach to a Literary Genre* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1975), p. 33, p. 76, p. 82, p. 86.

[6] Todorov, p. 44.

[7] Kathryn Hume, *Fantasy and Mimesis: Responses to Reality in Western Literature* (New York: Methuen, 1984), p. 5.

[8] Brian Attebery, *Stories about Stories: Fantasy and the Remaking of Myth* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014), p. 31.

view fantasy as a group of texts that share, to a greater degree or another, a cluster of common tropes which may be objects but which may also be narrative techniques. At the centre are those stories which share tropes of the completely impossible and towards the edge, in subsets, are those stories which include only a small number of tropes, or which construct those tropes in such a way as to leave doubt in the reader's mind as to whether what they have read is fantastical or not.[9]

And Jackson in her book *Fantasy: The Literature of Subversion* stresses that:

[l]ike any other text, a literary fantasy is produced within, and determined by, its social context. Though it might struggle against the limits of this context, often being articulated upon that very struggle, it cannot be understood in isolation from it.[10]

More recently, authors have shown a similar gap in collectively defining the genre amongst themselves. Brandon Sanderson comments that '[f]rom the beginnings of the fantasy genre, its biggest criticism has been that it has no consistency' and then quotes John Campbell, 'one of the most influential and important editors in the history of science fiction' as saying in the 1960's: 'The basic nature of fantasy is "The only rule is, make up a new rule any time you need one!"'.[11] Colin N. Manlove in *Modern Fantasy* reiterates this stance, arguing that modern fantasy 'often lacks the "inner consistency of reality"' and that it fails in 'keeping to [its] own terms'.[12] This shows that critics have been almost dismissive

---

[9] James and Mendlesohn, p. 1.
[10] Rosemary Jackson, *Fantasy: The Literature of Subversion* (London: Methuen, 1981), p. 14.
[11] Brandon Sanderson, 'Sanderson's First Law', (2007),
    <http://brandonsanderson.com/sandersons-first-law/> [accessed 12/5/2015]
[12] Colin N. Manlove, *Modern Fantasy: Five Studies* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press,
    1975), p. vii and p. 258.

of fantasy writing as it has poor internal writing – *The Lord of the Rings* was even once considered to have been of no literary merit on similar grounds.

Sanderson even notes that there are aspects about fantasy writing in recent decades that he thought were collectively understood cornerstones of fantasy, particularly writing about magic in fantasy. He says he had read 'Orson Scott Card's writing book […] and had used it as a rule of thumb for some time. It was the thing that I assumed was the first law of magic systems'.[13] Clearly, authors themselves still do not agree upon an overall clear set of defining rules regarding how to write fantasy, though through Sanderson's discussion, it is clear that there are at least some groupings of authors: those who strive to explain magic in their works, and those who suggest that defining magic leads one to 'lose your sense of wonder [because] [f]antasy is all about wonder!'.[14]

Mendlesohn also provides critical analysis that revolves around defining different modes of fantasy; these being portal quests (where the main character ventures through a portal to an unfamiliar location), immersive (a fantasy set in a world built so that it functions on all levels as a complete world), intrusion (wherein the fantastic intrudes on reality and the protagonists' engagement with that intrusion drives the story) and liminal (a form of fantasy which estranges the reader from the fantastic as seen and described by the protagonist).[15] The immersive fantasy is of particular interest for the purposes of this thesis, as all of my chosen examples involve authors creating complete, self-sufficient secondary worlds.

---

[13] Sanderson, 'Sanderson's First Law'.
[14] Sanderson, 'Sanderson's First Law'.
[15] Farah Mendlesohn, *Rhetorics of Fantasy* (Middletown: Wesleyan University Press, 2008), p. 1, p. 59, p. 114, and p. 182.

Manlove's definition of fantasy as a 'fiction evoking wonder and containing a substantial and irreducible element of the supernatural with which the moral characters in the story or the readers become on at least partly familiar terms' starts the examination by outlining that 'supernatural' and 'characters' are both key elements for the reader.[16] Another core aspect of fantasy is identified by W. R. Irwin in *The Game of the Impossible*:

> a story based on and controlled by an overt violation of what is generally accepted as possibility; it is the narrative of transforming the condition contrary to fact into "fact" itself.[17]

In other words, fantasy fiction presents a world that is seemingly impossible, but in such a way that the reader is asked to accept it as real, and to become familiar with that too. Mark J. P. Wolf argues in *Building Imaginary Worlds* that:

> imaginary worlds, which rank among the most elaborate mediated entities, have been largely overlooked in media studies, despite a history spanning three millennia. Imaginary worlds are occasionally considered tangentially, either from the point of view of a particular story set in them, or a particular medium in which they appear, but in either case the focus is too narrow for the world to be examined as a whole. Often when a world is noticed at all, it is only considered as a background for stories set in it, rather than a subject for study itself.[18]

Some critics have attempted to theorise and understand these imaginary worlds. J.R.R. Tolkien, in his essay 'On Fairy Stories', calls 'the secondary world,' an imagined world, be it an entire universe or simply a singular world, which is not

---

[16] Manlove, p. 1.
[17] W. R. Irwin, *The Game of the Impossible: A Rhetoric of Fantasy*, (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1976), p. 4.
[18] Mark J. P. Wolf, *Building Imaginary Worlds* (New York: Routledge, 2012), p. 2.

real.[19] In his essay *Tolkien and the Fairy Story*, R. J. Reilly elaborates on Tolkien's definition, writing of fantasy that 'the images which it describes are not extant within the "real" world.' [20] A fantasy setting is a place that only exists in the imagination of the writer and the readers.

It is essential at this stage to outline the key terminology defining the difference between the real world, and the fantasy world. The secondary world is the world created by the writer; the setting in which their fantasy story exists. A secondary world is one where 'peculiar qualit[ies] […] (if not all the details) are derived from Reality, or are flowing into it'.[21] These qualities include magic, as well as many other elements that have become fantasy tropes, such as elves and dragons. I will also be referring to secondary worlds as fantasy worlds, as not all writers base their stories in a secondary world; sometimes the setting is an alternate reality based on our own real world. Mark J. P. Wolf further expands on Tolkien's terms by drawing together a number of other scholars' descriptions:

> Imaginary worlds have been referred to in a number of ways; "subcreated worlds", "secondary worlds", "diegetic worlds", "constructed worlds" and "imaginary worlds". While these terms are sometimes used interchangeably, each term emphasizes different aspects of the same phenomenon.[22]

For the purposes of this thesis, the "secondary world" will be the primary term used to identify a fantasy setting. Conversely, the primary world is our own real

---

[19] R. J. Reilly, 'Tolkien and the Fairy Story' in *Tolkien and the Critics: Essays on J. R. R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings*, eds. Neil David Isaacs and Rose A. Zimbado (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968), p. 143.
[20] Reilly, p. 143.
[21] J. R. R. Tolkien, 'On Fairy Stories', in *Tree and Leaf* (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1964), p. 64.
[22] Wolf, pp. 13-14.

world; earth and the rest of the universe in which both the authors and their readers live:

> [Tolkien] referred to the material intersubjective world in which we live as the Primary World, and the imaginary worlds created by authors as secondary worlds. Tolkien's terms carefully sidestep the philosophical pitfalls encountered with other terms like "reality" and "fantasy", while also indicating the hierarchical relationship between the types of worlds, since secondary worlds rely on the primary world and exist within it.[23]

Readers, living in the primary world, create the secondary world, but within their own minds, their own imaginations. The secondary world does not, therefore, exist by itself independent of the primary world. That said, Irwin points out that these secondary, or fantasy, worlds exist within a setting and 'sequence and consequence of events, so clearly reported that there seems no doubt of their veracity'.[24] Therefore, despite being something fictional, these worlds tend to feel real to readers.

The exercise of world building is then the manner in which the author fleshes out the details about their secondary world, adding layers to things such as world histories, cultures, types of mythical flora and fauna native to the world, and details about what magic is and where it comes from. Where mythical creatures are drawn from history, or even other contemporary fantasy stories (especially drawn from Tolkien), this breeds familiarity for the reader, as they find solace in reading about Elves, Orcs, Dragons and Trolls, and know what these creatures are as soon as their names are mentioned in the text. They have become tropes of the fantasy genre, as has magic itself. Rosemary Jackson in *Fantasy: The*

---

[23] Wolf, p23.
[24] Irwin, p. 35.

Literature of Subversion writes that the creation of secondary worlds 'uses "legalized" methods – religion, magic, science – to establish other worlds'.[25] "Legalized" here refers to methods that readers and other writers have deemed acceptable within the tropes of fantasy, and magic is certainly one of those acceptable tropes.

As this analysis of world building highlights, in almost all fantasy stories, settings, worlds and narratives there is, if not an entire world setting dependant on magic, at least a small element of magic. However, critics writing about fantasy often neglect to spend significant time and space defining and understanding this crucial term. I hope to redress this gap in knowledge in what follows, drawing on relevant scholarship but also extending this to determine the core purpose and nature of magic in fantasy.

Irwin writes of the symbiotic nature of fantasy and magic, writing that the genre typically 'deals with … the supernatural, especially magic.[26] However, while magic is assumed to be a part of fantasy from the very outset, some authors chose not establish what it actually is, preferring to leave it as Brandon Sanderson notes, as something 'mysterious' for the reader so that they can feel like they are reading fantasy.[27] So how does magic fit into fantasy worlds, and how has the primary world influenced authors' understanding of magic?

There are many elements and tropes within the fantastic that could be seen to have magic qualities. Some such examples include fate, the supernatural, certain religious features and deities and their respective powers. Some might even term superpowers, as commonly found in comic books, as being magical in nature. So how does one separate magic from other fantasy tropes?

---

[25] Jackson, p. 173.
[26] Irwin, p. 5.
[27] Sanderson, 'Sanderson's First Law'

Magic is something that can, at first, be regarded as a nebulous term. For many, it might simply mean a form of trickery, sleight of hand, or something simply 'wondrous'.[28] For others it might include the supernatural, deities, and the ability to wield powers of destructive (or constructive) might. In a secondary world, the latter is more often the case. Wizards cast spells. Necromancers raise the dead. Witches enchant apples with poisonous magics. But not everything 'magical' in a secondary world can be deemed to actually be 'of magic'.

Magic, in a broad sense, can be seen as a source of energy, either internal or inborn to a person or creature (in that they are born with innate magical aptitude, or can naturally cast spells without needing to learn how) or external to a person or creature (in that they can access a source/reservoir/pool of magic that other people can also access, and that they need to be taught how to access this magic, and how to cast spells) to a person or other living being, that can be manipulated via methods such as spells, rituals, incantations, ceremonies and maybe even potions and psychology to produce 'surprising results'.[29] *The Concise Oxford Dictionary of World Religions* defines magic as:

> The production of effects in the world by actions, often ritualized, whose source of power is not open to observation; or by words, especially by incantation: chants or formulae, which may sound nonsensical to the outsider, may summon the relevant power, or may themselves effect the consequence: they may also be apotropiac.[30]

---

[28] Dennis O'Neil, 'Magic and Religion' (2006), <http://anthro.palomar.edu/religion/rel_5.htm> [accessed 23/04/2015]

[29] 'Magic' in *Reader's Digest Oxford Complete Wordfinder*, ed. by Sara Tulloch (London: Reader's Digest Association Limited, 1993), p. 918.

[30] John Bowker, 'Magic' in *The Concise Oxford Dictionary of World Religions* (Oxford University Press, 2000), <http://www.oxfordreference.com.ezproxy.waikato.ac.nz/view/10.1093/acref/9780192800947.001.0001/acref-9780192800947-e-4438?rskey=rbAA2k&result=5> [accessed 03/04/2015]

In a fantasy setting magic can be either passive (effectively a thing of nature – for example unicorns are passively magical because they *are* magical) or active (something that has a distinct source that can be tapped and manipulated – for example the Winds of Magic from the Warhammer Fantasy setting. A wizard trained in the Lore of Beasts can cast spells from that Lore, but not from any other Lore he is untrained in, and the energy required to cast those spells comes from the Amber magic portion of the Winds of Magic). Terry Pratchett's Discworld exhibits a prime example of both these terms. Induced Magic in the Discworld is magic, which comes from the power of belief, essentially active magic – the belief must be actively held and pursued for the magic to work. Intrinsic Magic is the background magic of the Discworld universe itself; much like passive magic, the magic is simply there, and while it keeps the world held together, it simply exists and does nothing by itself.[31]

Therefore, magic can be a law of nature unto itself, but it is neither a representation of the supernatural nor vice versa. However, magic may be able to replicate or imitate supernatural events or creatures, for example, magic could be used to materialize demons, and demons are often considered supernatural beings. The supernatural in closer inspection, can be defined as the forces that act outside of the laws of nature, such as ghosts and demons. These can be physical manifestations, or more energy based things, such as telepathic, or telekinetic abilities. Supernatural events or manifestations do not require a source of magic in order to exist, but sometimes can use magic, demons that cast spells for example.

From an anthropological perspective, magic and religion can be seen to have crossovers, or at least relevant referencing to each other. Some

---

[31] Terry Pratchett and Stephen Briggs, *The Discworld Companion: An Invaluable Guide For The Discerning Discworld Traveller*, (Glasgow: Victor Gollancz Ltd, 1994), pp. 270-271.

anthropologists, such as Dr. Dennis O'Neil state that 'most cultures of the world have religious beliefs that supernatural powers can be compelled' via the application of magic.[32] There is a supposition in these cultures then, that magic is real and not a form of trickery or sleight of hand, much like how there is an assumption that a fantasy story will in some manner include magic. In other cases, magic has a greater influence on belief and world views. For example, Sir James Frazer's *The Golden Bough* is cited as being a defining work that outlines "Laws of Magic" from our own real world historical beliefs in magic (categorized as Sympathetic Magic 'that things act upon each other at a distance through a secret sympathy'; Homeopathic Magic 'things which resemble each other are the same'; and Contagious Magic 'things that have once been in contact with each other are always in contact').[33] Sympathetic Magic is also known as the Law of Sympathy and is effectively the umbrella title for both Homeopathic Magic (Law of Similarity) and Contagious Magic (Law of Contact). Another strong feature of (especially medieval) anthropological magic is that the power for casting spells, or rites comes directly from God, and must be invoked in his name − especially if the intention is to bind demons to one's will, or to compel demons to do something. Morality is therefore another element in question regarding magic. Ghayat Al-Hakim's grimoire, *Picatrix*, written in 343AD, and derived from 224 books by "ancient sages", and even that far back in our own history he commented that magic itself does not follow any moral code. Gravity, for example, does not commit evil acts, but a person could use gravity as part of an evil act, for example, by pushing someone off of a cliff. Al-Hakim notes that anyone wanting to use magic should therefore be 'virtuous, pure in his mind and body from all sins and

---

[32] O'Neil.

[33] Sir James George Frazer, *The Golden Bough : A Study in Magic and Religion* (New York, Oxford University Press, 1994), p. 27.

then he will see it and observe it in its reality'.[34] Even so, magic and religion are still linked by moral codes, especially that of "doing the right thing", believing that magic is being used for the correct spiritual purpose. Randall Styers directs our attention to Claude Lévi-Strauss and tells us that 'magic is based on the fundamental belief that humanity can intervene in the order of the natural world to modify or add to its system of determinism' – religion is a '*humanization of natural laws* and magic [exists] in a *naturalization of human actions*'.[35] From this Lévi-Strauss extrapolates that there is interplay between religion and magic:

> The anthropomorphism of nature (of which religion consists) and the physiomorphism of man (by which we have defined magic) constitute two components which are always given, and vary only in proportion. As we noted earlier, each implies the other. There is no religion without magic any more than there is magic without at least a trace of religion. The notion of a supernature exists only for a humanity which attributes supernatural powers to itself and in return ascribes the powers of its superhumanity to nature.[36]

In the fictional framework there is a third component to the interplay between magic and religion. There is a system of belief whereby the practitioners of magic, or at least the recipients of magical influence, believe in the magic itself. This belief can be seen as a possible source for the magic, as it results in the magic having efficacy. In other words, because these people believe that magic works, it therefore *does* work. And vice versa, where people stop believing that

---

[34] Ghayat Al-Hakim, *Picatrix: The Goal of the Wise,* ed. by William Kiesel (Washington: Ouroboros Press, 2002), p. 57.

[35] Randall Styers, *Making Magic: Religion, Magic and Science in the Modern World* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), p. 7.

[36] Claude Lévi-Strauss, *The Savage Mind* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1966), pp. 220-221.

magic exists, it slowly loses its power and effectiveness. From an anthropological view, magic in the primary world had an element of this. Richard Kieckhefer, in *Forbidden Rites*, comments that a 'realistic awareness [of magic] was being practiced, and an almost universally shared conviction that it could work'.[37] More importantly, he contends, at least within the text of books of magic, 'readers and practitioners were asked to suspend their disbelief, or perhaps to entertain possibilities that would normally defy belief but within this ritual context might gain credibility'.[38] For example, in the Warhammer World setting, Savage Orcs adorn their bodies with magical tattoos of protection. These tattoos are only magical because the Savage Orcs themselves strongly believe that they are, therefore making the magic real.[39]

In our primary world, magic can, outside of a Judeo Christian framework, be seen as 'nature' magic, whereby the practitioner manipulates natural resources for the purposes of magical effect. Magic potions can often be described in such light, because they combine together 'magical' ingredients (often flora and fauna) for a desired effect. Kieckhefer suggests that the creation of potions 'rarely combines techniques of demonic with those of natural magic', implying that the two are therefore separate forms of magic.[40] Ghayat Al-Hakim in the *Picatrix* further reinforces this with the comment that 'an elixir can only be some sort of combination of animals, plants and metals'.[41] Other nature magic proclaims that the source of magical energies comes from the universe, or from within every human themselves. In this case, the human body (or soul) can be the conduit

---

[37] Richard Kieckhefer, *Forbidden Rites: A Necromancer's Manual of the Fifteenth Century* (Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1998), p. 10.
[38] Kieckhefer, p. 26.
[39] Rick Priestly, *Warhammer Armies: Orcs and Goblins* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 1993), p. 67.
[40] Keickhefer, p. 75.
[41] Al-Hakim, p. 12.

through which magic is enacted. Al-Hakim also notes that man 'does not reflect on the essence of his being, which is a microcosm of the larger world', in that we have the knowledge of magic ourselves, but the magic itself comes from a much larger source than just us.[42] It comes from the universe at large.

The author may also establish that the magic system in their world is bound by hard and fast rules, laws and boundaries, that they present to the reader that explain what magic can and cannot accomplish within the secondary world it is part of, as well as a thorough explanation of its source. For example, perhaps only people born with natural magical aptitude can become wizards, or conversely anyone can train to access and manipulate magical energies. Maybe a wizard has to memorize his spells in advance, and has to re-memorize them after they are cast. Perhaps a wizard might not be able to conjure real gold with which to pay off debts because magic in this world cannot recreate metals. In this way magic is controlled. These rules or laws dictate both to the writer and the reader what they can expect magic to be able to do within the fantasy world. Letting the reader understand these rules doesn't necessarily detract from accepting magic as being a natural phenomenon within the world in question. The author may even develop the laws and rules of magic's limitations but keep this knowledge to themselves. This could provide them with the tools to maintain a consistency throughout their writing, and not leave the reader feeling as if they have been bombarded by a long-winded exposition. Clute provides an all-encompassing assumption regarding magic in fantasy:

> Although notions of magic differ from writer to writer, there is a
> remarkable consensus among fantasy writers, especially writers of genre

---

[42] Al-Hakim, p. 55.

fantasy: magic, when present, can do almost anything, but obeys certain rules according to its nature.[43]

Frazer's "Laws of Magic" essentially outline a system for rules for magic within our own primary world. In the same way, secondary worlds have their own rules, but these are not always adhered to by writers. In some secondary worlds, for example, magic may only do something that the author has deemed appropriate for the occasion, rather than appropriate for the magic system itself. This is a distinction that Brandon Sanderson refers to as Hard and Soft Magic. Hard Magic, he suggests is 'the side where the authors explicitly describes [sic] the rules of magic', and conversely, Soft Magic is 'where the magic is included in order to establish a sense of wonder and give the setting a fantastical feel'.[44] In a similar sense, I wish to examine fantasy settings, and secondary worlds, that include what I term High Magic Saturation (where magic is an essential component of the setting – such as within Terry Pratchett's Discworld novels) and where one would therefore expect to find Hard Magic explanations. At the same time, I wish to look at what I call Low Magic Saturation (where magic is indeed a component of the fantasy setting, but seems to be more of a background element, rather than critically important – J.R.R. Tolkien's *Lord of the Rings* would seem to fit into this category), in which one would expect to be presented with a Soft Magic system.

While borrowing Sanderson's terms of Hard and Soft Magic for the purposes of examination, my adaptation of this terminology needs further definition. High Magic Saturation means that the use of, existence of and critical need for magic within the fantasy setting is indeed high. However, magic may or

---

[43] Clute, 'Magic', pp. 615-616.
[44] Sanderson, 'Sanderson's First Law'.

may not be clearly defined (as in what its sources may be, the means for controlling it, and whatever possible boundaries there may be regarding what magic can and/or cannot achieve). Low Magic Saturation refers to a setting where magic does exist, but within the context of the fantasy work(s) in question it does not assume a role of importance. The *Lord of the Rings*, for example, utilizes magic (especially via Gandalf and Saruman) yet it apparently seems to be utilized within its secondary world as a momentary aid, or useful tool rather than an underlying element of the plot, or the world setting itself. As pointed out at the start of this thesis, Gandalf merely performs certain actions that are described in a wondrous manner, leaving the reader to assume that he is indeed using magic. For example, when confronting Théoden and Wormtongue Gandalf 'raised his staff. There was a roll of thunder. The sunlight was blotted night. The fire faded to sullen embers'.[45] We are merely presented with the literary cues to indicate that magic is being used, and Gandalf uses it simply to strike down Wormtongue; 'There was a flash as if lightning had cloven the roof. Then all was silent. Wormtongue sprawled on his face'.[46]

The manner in which the author of the fantasy works presents magic and, in turn, shows magic's importance to its secondary world is found within the narrative of the story. Characters may, for example, discuss with each other where magic comes from, possibly with emphasis as to why it is important. On other occasions, the narrative may simply allude to magic being a part of the world, and show it being used, but never go into any further detail. One reason for this may be that many authors find it far easier to write about and develop the characters in their stories, rather than to build and develop the secondary world in which the

---

[45] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 503.
[46] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 503.

characters live. Any reference in regard to magic and its place within the secondary world would therefore come as the result of characters interacting with each other, and their specific actions. The author will show, through their work, whether they fall into Sanderson's Hard or Soft Magic categories via the emphasis they place, within the narrative, on magic. In turn, the same emphasis on magic within the narrative will also determine its importance in building the author's secondary world. World building efforts are important to the level that Wolf claims:

> [w]hen such worlds are well made, they can pull their audience in so skillfully that not only is one's imagination stimulated without much conscious effort, but the whole experience is a pleasurable one.[47]

Overall, fantasy is a form of escapism for the reader, and as such it needs to be believable or, at least, the secondary world in which it is set should seem to be so. If magic ceases to feel real within this boundary there is a chance that the reader will cease to be fully immersed and will therefore lose their interest in the world. As Mendlesohn states: 'If a character has to explain to the reader what is happening, then the world is not fully real'.[48] This suggests that an author creating a Fantasy setting in which magic plays a significant part needs to have a strong understanding of how magic works in the secondary world they are creating and not leave the characters to explain every detail of magic and how it fits into the secondary world. This can be further fleshed out through rules and boundaries applying to the interaction with, limits or applications of magic, but this does not necessarily need to be presented to the reader, so long as the author knows how magic works in the fantasy world.

---

[47] Wolf, p. 16.
[48] Mendlesohn, p. 62.

Where the authors themselves understand their world's magic, we can apply Sanderson's terms of Hard and Soft magic. Obviously, the authors who share the details of their magic system with the reader are working towards a Hard magic system. That does not mean, therefore, that a Soft magic system implies that the author has no system in mind, but it could be that they don't feel that it is as important for the reader as the story, or the characters. J. K. Rowling's *Harry Potter*, for example, appears to have no formal system 'no sense of what each kind of magic can achieve, the choice of potions versus wand spells versus magical objects is frequently arbitrary […] There may be a reason […] there are no rules'.[49] *The Lord of the Rings*, too, at first glance appears to have no formal system. But for each world setting, and each author, this might not be the case. Rowling may actually have justification for why a potion works better in a given situation, but this knowledge is never shared with the reader. Tolkien, on the other hand, has crafted Middle Earth into a Faërie setting, and as such it is implied that no explanation is required. His treatise *On Fairy-Stories* provides this explanation outside of the secondary world itself. Yet he too falls short of providing an explanation as to why magic, is important. Despite his description of the nature of elves, and the Faërie world, in 'On Fairy Stories', this still does not present us with a reason why magic is a key element in world building, even taking the inherent magical (Tolkien terms it more 'enchantment') nature of Faërie realms.

On the other hand, if the author has provided the reader with a seemingly fleshed out magic system, but the rules appear to contradict themselves, this may lead to a reader's loss of immersion. For example, if Rowling had indicated that a certain spell is only effective for a certain event, but then had a character use a

---

[49] Mendlesohn, pp. 63-64.

potion with the same efficacy, this breaks the rules of her secondary world's system. Additionally, if authors are simply using magic as a trope, that is, applying magic to their secondary world because it is expected to be included in fantasy, then this too can break immersion. Magic has become an important feature of fantasy based secondary worlds, and therefore it really should be approached by authors with an appropriate measure of understanding. Not only can it enrich the secondary world for the author's sake, but it can ease the reader into a more believable setting.

As a side note here, superpowers cannot (for the framework of this thesis) be defined as magic, or as supernatural. Whereas magic is something that can be harnessed by individuals, even taught or innately understood, superpowers are intrinsically individual to a being. Superpowers can be a trait expressed through a person from their birth (Superman's absorption of the Earth's sun's energy is part of his DNA) or gained through exposure to an outside force (Bruce Banner/The Hulk's experiments with Gamma radiation mutated his DNA), but they are not, arguably, transferable between people. Where a wizard can teach someone else how to cast spells, a Superhero cannot teach someone how to attain superpowers. In this fashion, superpowers, though fantastical in nature, are bound by a form of natural law (even where they might otherwise bend the laws of nature).

Having now established what fantasy worlds are, and what magic itself is, what kinds of fantasy story settings will this thesis cover? Mendlesohn's different fantasy types outlined earlier, those of liminal, immersive, intrusion, and portal quest fantasies each encompass a wide umbrella term under which fantasy stories fall, but for the purposes of this thesis, the immersive fantasy is of most importance. Fantasy stories set in the immersive fantasy are ones in which the

reader can feel they themselves are a part of the story, or the world itself. Everything relayed to the reader by the author as narrator, by the characters, by the secondary world itself has to seem believable. Mendlesohn determines that the immersive fantasy is the immersive fantasy is a fantasy set in a world built so that it 'functions on all levels as a complete world'.[50] Precise and accurate world building is therefore paramount for these settings, else readers' immersion will shatter, and they will no longer find themselves relating with the characters nor their story.

To present and dissect my argument, this thesis is broken down into three chapters, each relating to key aspects of world building, characters, and immersion. Throughout, I argue that magic does, and should, feature prominently in the evolution of all these aspects with the goal of developing a much stronger fantasy story.

The first chapter will focus on narrative and how writers can strengthen it by weaving magic into the world building and overall story rather than presenting magic as being almost an "in limbo" element of the world. Magic cannot be successfully enmeshed into a narrative arc without being fully explained. I seek to understand how magic can become part of the explanation of the fantasy story and not just a trope that helps the author to get the characters out of a dangerous situation, or a deus ex machina writing technique.

Chapter Two builds on the premise from Chapter One that magic needs to be integrated consistently and coherently into the narrative. Here the focus is on the source of magic, and I analyse how a fully developed knowledge of magical sourcs can give the secondary world credence and reality as a place that could

---

[50] Mendlesohn, p. 59.

actually exist. I link my discussion of secondary worlds to historical and cultural context from our own primary world, linking the importance magic has had on our world with why magic should be seen as an important part of the world building inherent in fantasy stories.

The final chapter highlights that if authors successfully create coherent and consistent fantasy worlds then they enable their characters to interact with magic in multi-dimensional ways, resulting in deeper immersion for readers. My discussion of the uses of magic in fantasy is not confined to the actions of characters within the texts. I also analyse the wider uses authors make of magic as a trope and a symbol. I consider how authors recycle and critique of tropes of fantasy —especially in regards to paying homage to Tolkien — and examine the way in which authors parallel their secondary worlds with real-world issues, thus grappling with the question of whether fantasy texts entertain or also critique.

This thesis endeavors to develop an explanation of the importance of magic in fantasy, drawing on the work of key scholars and the fictional works of J. R. R. Tolkien, Terry Pratchett and Brandon Sanderson as well as the Warhammer World setting as case studies for secondary worlds which are built on a strong foundation of fully realized magic. Tolkien as the father of contemporary fantasy is important because he demonstrated how to write about fantasy worlds, especially regarding myth-making and a fully realized secondary world. Pratchett's Discworld novels are set in a world that owes its very existence to magic, and through parody and satire Pratchett utilizes the structure of his magic to critique and expose primary world issues, such as gender inequality. His novel *Sourcery* goes into much detail as to the rules and sources pertaining to magic in the Discworld and his other books, such as *Equal Rites*, provide more social

commentary. Sanderson preaches the importance of developing magic systems, and so this thesis will examine his novel *Elantris* in particular to scrutinize whether he practices what he preaches. The Warhammer World, while including many novels written in its secondary world, is important because it has the most realized magic system of them all, due in part to the links to the tabletop wargame that the setting is written for, though it also acts as a guide to my own fiction writing, especially regarding the categorizations of magic. Using these authors and the highlighted works as primary examples, I will be able to specifically detail why an explained magic system is both important to and benefits an overall narrative and world building; link a deeper understanding of the sources of magic to a stronger secondary world in which greater possibilities are available to the writer; and finally discuss how writers utilize the framework of magic as a means for making a social commentary, as well as understanding how the secondary world's inhabitants view and understand magic themselves.

In order to achieve this, I will also present an element of my own creative fiction, with an aim to flesh out and develop the basis of magic within the fantasy setting of my own creation. This setting is one which I aim to further develop in fictional works, and therefore this thesis is a prime medium for honing some of this initial groundwork. The creative fiction presented here will draw on the research of this thesis and operate as a series of test cases that demonstrate how a strong understanding of the secondary world's magic can indeed broaden the exercise of world building, and provide the reader with greater scope for their own immersion into the world. There will be a single short "Creative Interlude" between each chapter, focused on representing the key arguments from the preceding chapter and demonstrating their relevance.

Chapter 1

Magic and Narrative: The Importance of

Believable Worlds

To enter a fantasy narrative is to enter a world of magic and wonder. Authors creating these worlds have a challenging task: that of unleashing their powers of invention in such a way that magic is a fully integrated and believable part of the worlds they create. This chapter explores two interlocking aspects of this symbiotic relationship between magic and fantasy. First, I draw on a range of scholars and textual examples to analyse the process of world building. I then turn to the ways in which authors interweave an understanding of how magic works in their secondary worlds into their narratives. This second aspect is particularly tricky as there are several major questions to contend with. Do characters need to fully understand the magic they interact with? How can sufficient information be shared with readers without drowning them in detail? At what point in the narrative does an aspect of the magical world need to be understood? Should everything about how the world works be discernible within the confines of the narrative or should authors siphon some of the detail into appendices and source books to reward engaged readers? Drawing on examples from Tolkien's *Lord of the Rings*,   Brandon Sanderson's *Elantris*, Terry Pratchett's Discworld and Games Workshop's Warhammer World, I will argue that magic needs to be presented to the reader in a coherent, consistent, and convincing manner.

In order to determine whether my chosen authors have successfully implemented magic in their stories I will follow John Clute's suggestion that:

stock fantasy elements are given a rationale that provides them with

internal consistency and coherence. In such works the laws of magic

may be carefully codified, often through elaborate systems of mysticism

found in ritual alchemy or in the Cabbala, or by using the "laws of magic"

devised by Sir James Frazer.[1] (bolding my emphasis).

The two crucial terms here are consistent and coherent. Magic cannot be something that is depicted as all powerful for the entire story, yet suddenly fail at a crucial moment unless the author has already outlined, or at least hinted at how magic works, therefore providing a guideline or framework for magic's boundaries and rules. The author should know the elements of where magic comes from (its ultimate source), how magic users are able to tap into this source, the side effects from using magic, the limitations on how magic can be used, how powerful (or weak) magic is within the secondary world, and what kind of effects different magics within the same world actually have (are potions weaker than spells, for example). There may be other features unique to each author's magic system, but these constitute the rules, or laws of magic within this author's fantasy world, and these rules should be applied as if they were actual laws; they cannot be broken without consequence. Breaks via inconsistencies or incoherencies will result in readers who have little investment in being immersed in the story they are reading.

Additionally, the reader must be able to believe that what they are reading is something that could in fact happen within the fantasy world setting they are reading about. Mark J. P. Wolf argues that magic should be more clearly developed within the world building function of the story: 'If a secondary world is

---

[1] John Clute, 'Rationalized Fantasy', in *The Encyclopedia of Fantasy*, ed. by John Clute and John Grant (London: Orbit, 1997), p. 801.

to be believable and interesting, it will need to have a high degree of invention, **completeness** and **consistency'** (bolding my emphasis).[2] I have emphasised completeness and consistency in the preceding quote because I feel that, regarding magic, these are both highly linked, and that together fantasy authors should endeavour to create and maintain consistent rules and functions surrounding magic in their secondary worlds and the novels set within them. Invention, in Wolf's terms, includes differing geography, history, physics, biology and an almost never-ending list of changes to, or additions to, the real 'facts' of our own world. In particular: 'believable design is especially important'.[3] Wolf states completeness is impossible:

> Completeness, then, refers to the degree to which the world contains explanations and details covering all the various aspects of its characters' experiences, as well as background details which together suggest a feasible, practical world.[4]

While completeness may not be possible (for example, we as individuals do not know all the details concerning our own real world), the author can at least provide enough details to completely explain the information they have provided to the reader. The practicality of the world is therefore derived from whether or not that world has a sense of "reality" for the reader, in so much as, where the secondary world differs from the primary world, the reader can accept that the differences could actually exist within the secondary world, regardless of whether they may exist within the primary world.

---

[2] Wolf, p. 33.
[3] Wolf, p. 34.
[4] Wolf, p. 38.

As Brian Attebery points out: 'the fundamental premise of fantasy is that the things it tells not only did not happen but *could* not have happened'.[5] Readers still wish to believe that, at least in the secondary worlds, these things could have happened, and they strive to seek some explanation as to how and why, preferably within the source text itself, or alternatively from close secondary source materials. In his essay 'The Quest Hero' W. H. Auden further reinforces these components of the creation of the secondary world and says it 'must be as <u>real</u> to the <u>senses</u> of the reader as the real world'.[6]

Not all authors and readers concur with this argument about the need for a believable world. As Brandon Sanderson found when attending a fantasy writers' discussion, there seems to be a prevailing consensus that magic must remain unexplained within secondary worlds. The reason given is to retain a sense of wonder for the reader, and to create mystery. As the other writers present at the forum expressly told Sanderson:

> If you have lots of rules and boundaries for your magic … then you lose
>
> your sense of wonder! Fantasy is all about wonder! You can't restrict
>
> yourself, or your imagination, by making your magic have rules!'[7]

To a certain degree this is a valid viewpoint. Readers, particularly ones who are being asked to take an active participation in reading fantasy, do indeed find pleasure in working things out for themselves, solving mysteries, gleaning their own truths from the clues in the narrative, and being in awe of the entire construction (both the secondary world, and the story written around it). W. R. Irwin goes a little further, suggesting that 'the reader must at all times feel

---

[5] Attebery, p. 4.

[6] W. H. Auden, *'The Quest Hero'* in *Tolkien and the Critics: Essays on J. R. R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings*, eds. Neil David Isaacs and Rose A. Zimbado (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968), p. 52.

[7] Sanderson, 'Sanderson's First Law'.

intellectually "at home" in the narrative and yet maintain his sense of intellectual alienation as a means of reflecting on the displaced real'.[8] Here Irwin refers to the state of mind where readers know that they are reading about impossible events in an impossible secondary world, but still feel as if they are nonetheless experiencing this impossible reality. Readers do not want to be led by the hand, or provided with all the explanation in a single block of exposition. At the same time, however, authors cannot present a mystery to the reader without providing at least some substance; telling them magic exists is one such mystery that needs more detail.

Conversely, authors should not have to feel obliged to restrict their world building for the sake of providing narrative as this could, of course, lead to complacency on the part of the author; including magic merely as a trope of the genre. Attebery notes that 'magic in fantasy is like diegetic music: if there is a string quartet playing in the soundtrack, the camera must at some point pan over to four players whose presence is justified by the occasion'.[9] In other words, if magic is included within the fantasy world, it must be there for a good reason, and not just "because it is a fantasy setting". On the topic of tropes, Clute even comment that 'much that was original to Tolkien has since become cliché', which is unfortunately true.[10] Fantasy novels, and their worlds, tend to overflow with elves, dwarves, dragons, magic rings, orcs and goblins, yet I feel that there is still room to expand on Tolkien's influence, especially where magic is concerned. Regarding authors' motivations, Irwin notes that many of them have a 'motive of

---

[8] Irwin, p. 76.
[9] Attebery, p. 49.
[10] John Clute, 'Lord of the Rings, The', in *The Encyclopedia of Fantasy*, ed. by John Clute and John Grant (London: Orbit, 1997), pp. 591-592.

propaganda' – in so much as they want to tell the reader something.[11] This might be something political, or social, but will be grounded in the fantasy setting in such a way as to almost come across as allegory, myth, or metaphor.

Fantasy authors also have, Irwin contends, a 'commitment to narrative as a means of demonstration' using the story and its characters to further drive home their message to the reader.[12] This might be further strengthened through non-narrative methods such as psychological drives, specific choice of syntax, and the manner of the chosen language style. This is articulated through Irwin's explanation of the importance of the narrative function of fantasy:

> The rhetoric of fantasy has a different purpose, to persuade the reader through narrative that an invention [the secondary world] contrary to known or presumed fact is existentially valid. The established fact and consequences thus displaced may never be mentioned of directly represented … The possibilities of creating within fantasy are limited by the conditions of the production, and thus the rhetoric is directed to asserting and maintaining the impossible.[13]

Irwin argues here that authors will use all manner of literary and sometimes psychological means to convince the reader that their secondary world, their imaginary creation, is viable; that even though it is impossible, it might somehow really exist somewhere. The 'fact' he refers to represents known features of our primary world – the laws of gravity, social norms are examples of such 'fact'. Where a system, or law, such as magic is introduced into the author's work, its function might therefore displace 'fact', but not ever be explained. Magic, for instance, could be the reason why certain races (such as the elven races in

---

[11] Irwin, p. 78.
[12] Irwin, p. 80.
[13] Irwin, p. 60.

Tolkien's Middle Earth) live for an unnaturally extended lifespan. This new 'impossible fact' does not, therefore, need to be explained, indeed the only in story reference to it might be nothing more than a line of text as simple as "Elves are a long lived race". These can act as 'catalysts of speculation', giving the reader something to puzzle over, and work out for themselves.

Tolkien himself indulges the reader with puzzles:

As a story, I think it is good that there should be a lot of things unexplained (especially if an explanation actually exists); and I have perhaps from this point of view erred in trying to explain too much, and give too much past history. Many readers have, for instance, rather stuck at the Council of Elrond. And even in a mythical Age there must be some enigmas, as there always are. Tom Bombadil is one (intentionally).[14]

Bombadil himself has been the subject of debate for a long time, with many theories as to his identity, including the suggestion that he is a god, or a representative of the reader, or even Tolkien himself. This does not create a greater understanding for the general reader, but it does generate a discussion through a wider community via online chat rooms and discussion forums. While he cites Tolkein's description of Bombadil, Wolf does not provide an explanation as to why Tolkien refers to Bombadil as an intentional enigma. He does, however, discuss the idea of enigmas in further depth:

Deliberate gaps, enigmas, and unexplained references help keep a work alive in the imagination of its audience, because it is precisely in these

---

[14] Wolf, p. 60.

areas where audience participation, in the form of speculation, is

encouraged.[15]

This is in reference to the conversations held in the chatrooms and other online

forums. The audience remains actively engaged, therefore the fantasy world is

continually being discussed and examined. For some readers, this collaborative

discussion may provide new light regarding vague areas of the text, but if there

are no clues to attempt to answer the mystery, the readers are really just

discussing the matter from various speculative angles, with no enlightenment

possible. Clute even suggests that 'generally ideas as to [magic's] nature are left

undefined. Attempts to write a system or define the rules … can produce shallow

and simplistic fantasies'.[16]

It might seem that I am attempting to disprove my own contention here;

quoting Tolkien and Wolf with such strong arguments as to why it is beneficial to

leave things unexplained, and Clute suggesting that explanations actually weaken

the story. However, my point here is to highlight how Tolkien's and Wolf's

arguments line up together alongside Irwin's and in fact strengthen my position. I

also wish to contend that Clute, although his position is robustly researched, fails

to explain why the fantasies are determined to be "shallow and simplistic".

A close examination of Tolkien's comments shows that, aside from

history, his focus is on narrative features, more aligned with telling the story,

rather than explaining all of the minor details: Tolkien therefore outlines the

Council of Elrond and the details behind its purpose and its importance to the

overall story, and he also develops Tom Bombadil as a character. Both of these fit

---

[15] Wolf, p. 60.
[16] Clute and Grant, 'Magic', p. 616.

with the idea that fantasy authors are focused on the story and the characters – and that therefore the readers must also be attending to the same focus.

The mystery of Tom Bombadil, however, works for the reader because he is not central to the overall narrative; he is more aligned alongside world building features, though his inclusion in *The Lord of the Rings* feels more like a function of "story telling". In fact, Peter Jackson's film adaptations remove him from the story entirely without loss of narrative.   Sanderson points out that 'from the beginnings of the fantasy genre, its biggest criticism has been that it has no consistency'.[17] How can the magic within fantasy novels be critiqued if fantasy itself is viewed as being inconsistent? This is in part due to the notion of maintaining a sense of mystery and wonder for the reader, which almost inevitably leads to the author not fully understanding their own secondary worlds. They may fully understand their characters, and those characters' motivations, but the internal selves of characters are generally self-contained and not the central motivation for the plot or overall narrative. Tom Bombadil, as an intentional mystery, may be an example of something not being complete enough, as there seems to be no way for readers to come to a consensus about his actual nature. If Bombadil were in fact part of the world's magic system, Tolkien would therefore be presenting an unexplained series of laws and rules that are too open ended, and a world where a simplistic "magic fixed it" can become too easy an answer. Or, as Sanderson asks: 'if the stories don't have rules and laws for their magic, don't they risk Deus Ex Machina (contrived endings) in their books?'[18]

---

[17] Sanderson, 'Sanderson's First Law'.
[18] Sanderson, 'Sanderson's First Law'.

The laws of magic, on the other hand, are not devices of character and almost never feature as the main point of narrative. Attebery comments that magic can be more symbolic than concrete within the fantasy world:

> Magic and symbolism are inextricably linked (Frazer's magical Laws of Contagion and Similarity match up neatly with C. S. Peirce's semiotic categories of index and icon and roughly with Freud's operations of displacement and condensation), and thus fantasy proves to be an inexhaustible generator of fresh symbols for death and desire.[19]

What the reader gets, is not a key element of narrative itself, but a series of representations of symbols, such as power and dominance.

There are exceptions: Brandon Sanderson's *Elantris* revolves around one of the main characters, Raoden, undertaking a quest to understand how magic works, and how it can be used to his advantage, thus becoming a driving force of the narrative. Raoden's frustration with the Aons failing to activate correctly trigger his quest to discover what was wrong:

> The Aon disappeared, its light fading from brightness, to dimness, to nothing. "It's not supposed to be like this." Every Aon he had finished properly had acted the same way, disappearing without producing any visible effect.[20]

This places magic squarely in both the realms of narrative and world building, therefore bringing its importance to the forefront of the reader's mind. It still, of course, represents Raoden's desires for knowledge and power, but it is no longer simply symbolic. The opening narrative in *Elantris* establishes that little is known about magic, a point that Sanderson stresses with the line 'the truth is no-one, not

---

[19] Attebery, p. 4.
[20] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 75.

even the Derethi priests, knew just what AonDor had been'.[21] This allows Sanderson an almost tabular rasa from which to begin the narrative-based discovery of magic through Raoden's research and experimentation.

The readers learns that the magical creatures called Seons are somehow linked to the AonDor and, much like Tolkien's Elves and nature symbiosis, as the AonDor has corrupted, and 'their association with the fallen Elantris, [they are] prevented from any further reproduction by the loss of Elantrian magics'.[22] In fact, this symbiotic nature seems to provide Raoden with a clue as to why AonDor itself is no longer functioning. As he comments 'I think I know what's wrong with him … His Aon isn't complete … there are tiny breaks in its line, and patches of weakness in its color'.[23] Despite Raoden's discovery of how to draw Aons, and how they are connected to the shape of the landscape ('to begin every Aon you draw a picture of Arelon'; 'the Aons were maps of the land'; 'the city was an enormous Aon') the reader does not get a full explanation within *Elantris* of the exact nature of Dor itself.[24] This results in a cursory explanation as to the important link between magic and the land but even this leaves the reader wondering a little. This may be Sanderson's form of a "mystery" for readers, though in other texts there is a hint that Dor itself is, in fact, the essence of a Goddess. Narrative-wise, as observed here, Raoden's discovery does not lead to an information dump for the reader, but actually builds on the features of narrative, character development and world building all at once, and in increments spaced out through the novel. Because Sanderson has fully realised the system in this sense we also find a strong consistency and coherency, that helps strengthen

---

[21] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 76.
[22] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 160.
[23] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 212.
[24] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 489, p. 504 and p. 592.

the notion that this secondary world could exist as it is presented to the reader. *Elantris* is full of internal consistency and coherency, and as a result the magic system within becomes rich and diverse; and the reader is not left with a half formed understanding of how magic fits into the secondary world, nor wondering it affects the story as a whole.

Consistency is therefore critical in regards to providing concrete foundations for understanding and presenting magic to the reader, and it follows on from completeness by being

> The degree to which world details [itself as] a plausible, feasible [place] and without contradiction … Lacking consistency, a world may begin to appear sloppily constructed, or even random and disconnected.

Magic as an element of the fantasy world should not be left as a mystery for the reader. It might not necessarily need to be explained in its entirety to the reader, but it must also not be left open to wide speculation, or wild assumptions. Expanding on Clute's concept of "rationalized fantasy", authors should even endeavour to develop a magic system that actually adheres to consistency and coherency. In fact, I would argue that when the magic system is presented to the reader as something either fully realised (within the single novel) or something that the author at least fully understands, but does not leave as a "mystery" for the readers to figure out for themselves, that this can in fact enrich the fantasy story, or secondary world.

Histories, as in our own primary world, are open to interpretation even when presented as 'fact'. The saying "History is written by the victors" is a nod to this, meaning that what many people consider to be historical 'fact', may indeed be nothing more than misinterpreted fiction. Even when an author is providing

readers with an historical 'fact' from within their secondary world, the same scrutiny can be applied; is this what historically happened here, or is this from one side's point of view? Inaccuracies and inconsistencies here can offer clues for the reader, and therefore allow them scope for an active speculation without questioning the validity of the world itself. If magic has the same inconsistencies and holes the reader may have reason to disbelieve the secondary world as being feasible and incoherent, therefore destroying their immersion and forcing them to seek other fantasy works with which to entertain themselves.

This circles back to one of Wolf's opening statements; that of why readers remain invested in secondary worlds:

When such worlds are well made they can pull their audience in so skilfully that not only is one's imagination stimulated without much conscious effort, but the whole experience is a pleasurable one.[25]

The more conscious effort the reader is exerting in order to maintain belief that the world can indeed function in the way the author is trying to contend, the less likely it will be that the reader is enjoying themselves. The world should exist, for the reader, in much the same way as the real world exists for them. They need to be able to "live" inside this world in their imagination, but they cannot do so if the world feels too incomplete, or contradictory. Of course, setting up the world in its entirety right from the start of the novel is far too much information at once, and is not that engaging to read. Nor is it enjoyable to read a novel where the details and explanations feel arbitrarily presented to the reader. Tolkien tells us that 'enchantment produces a Secondary World into which both the designer and the spectator can enter, to the satisfaction of their senses while they are inside'; in this

---

[25] Wolf, p. 16.

case enchantment is another term for the magic that creates, builds, and strengthens the secondary world.[26] The world should feel as if it is naturally evolving throughout the story and the entire narrative. Therefore, incremental revelation of coherent and consistent details is key.

In Pratchett's Discworld, for example, details about magic are presented as small comments throughout all the novels. At the start of *The Colour of Magic* (the first Discworld novel) a raging fire 'burned blue and green and was even laced with strange sparks of the eighth colour, octarine'.[27] Slowly, as the story unfolds there are further embellishments on magic and octarine, such as the wizard Rincewind having one of the Creator's eight spells stuck in his mind after reading the Octavo: 'the spell had leapt out of the page and instantly burrowed deeply into his mind'.[28] These two short excerpts begin to subtly link the importance of number eight with magic, and over the course of the novel other similar small comments slowly build up an understanding of the laws surrounding magic rather than being a sudden information dump.

Octarine is explained in a single sentence: 'the eighth colour is octarine, caused by the scatter-effect of strong sunlight on an intense magical field' and wizards' powers are discussed in a single almost throwaway statement made by the character Twoflower: 'I always though […] a wizard just said the magic words and that was that. Not all this tedious memorising.'[29] This memorisation also has a side effect that the spells stay in the wizard's mind until he says them, or he dies, at which point, as Rincewind says: '[they] will sort of say

---

[26] Tolkien, 'On Fairy Stories', p. 64.
[27] Terry Pratchett, *The Colour of Magic* (London: Colin Smythe Limited, 1983), p. 9.
[28] Pratchett, *The Colour of Magic,* p. 48.
[29] Pratchett, *The Colour of Magic*, p. 75 and pp. 78-79.

[themselves]'.[30] The creatures from the Dungeon Dimensions, however, are introduced to the reader in one of the "info dumps" later on in *Sourcery*, in a discussion between characters:

> The world … the reality in which we live … can be thought of as, in a manner of speaking, a rubber sheet … it is distorted and, uh, *distended* by the presence of magic in any degree, and if I may make a point here, too much magic potentially, if foregathered in one spot, forces our reality, um, downwards, although (because in no sense do I seek to suggest physical dimension) and it has been postulated that a significant exercise of magic can, shall we say, um, break through the actuality at its lowest point and offer, perhaps, a pathway to the inhabitants of, if I may use a more correct term, *denizens* of the lower plane (which is called by the loose-tongued the Dungeon Dimensions) who, because perhaps of the difference in energy levels, are naturally attracted to the brightness of this world. Our world.[31]

Unlike the single sentence comments that add minor detail, here there is a lot of major detail regarding magic and its effect on the fabric of the universe, as well as its potential danger, all in one large block of dialogue. However, this comes through as the overly-wordy explanation of a panicked wizard, rather than through authorial intrusion. Readers need to feel that the world could possibly exist, and when the characters themselves are describing their own world, this helps them feel like it indeed could exist somewhere.

Wolf wrote that 'to be able to live a moment in an imagined world, we must see the laws of its existence obeyed. Those broken, we fall out of it.' [32] Irwin makes a similar observation regarding the settings of Fantasy: 'A wide

---

[30] Pratchett, *The Colour of Magic*, p. 102.
[31] Pratchett, *Sourcery*, p. 237.
[32] Wolf, p. 22.

variety of possibilities may be found, as well as a range from the sparse to the highly detailed. But the same external realism, order, and clarity are imperative.'[33] The world can, in this case, be something filled with mystery for the reader, only barely hinted at and outlined subtlety. Or, it might be entirely chronicled from creation to its present state, with full histories of its civilisations and a detailed examination of its unique fantasy features.

The reader still needs to believe the world could possibly exist and magic that fails to be realistic, ordered, or clear can destroy this belief. As Wolf points out regarding world building in general: 'worlds can exist without stories, but stories cannot exist without a world'.[34] The story that tells us about how magic works and how it affects the world can only exist if the world itself has the internal coherency and consistency required to make it believable. Create a "realistic" secondary world, albeit one steeped in magic, and you can therefore establish enthralling narratives based there. If the stories fail to live up to the belief in the world, the reader is likely to no longer believe in the world's plausibility. I would like to add to Wolf's statement by suggesting that "Worlds cannot exist with stories that misrepresent the world's potential, and that under-developed worlds cannot provide stories with enough elements for adequate representation".

Now that I have established why magic is important to each feature of the narrative's setting, characters and overall plot, I will examine several texts that I feel represent the successful application of the theories I have just outlined. However, before discussing the texts in deeper context, I would like to emphasise that each novel (and in turn, fantasy world) develops a definition of magic unique

---

[33] Irwin, p. 73.
[34] Wolf, p. 29.

to itself, with little connection to other authors' works. *The Lord of the Rings* simply states that magic exists, and then provides the reader with examples of its use. *Sourcery*, working from readers' knowledge from the previous Discworld novels, continues to sprinkle the text with incremental details about magic. The Warhammer World expressly tells the reader where magic comes from, its effects/side effects, and every minor or major detail in between.

Much of the groundwork for explaining magic starts within the novels themselves, yet there is a common feature among these works: that of additional source material providing the reader with further insight. Although magic is developed and explored throughout the works of Pratchett as well as the collected Warhammer World novels and rulebooks, they share something in common with Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*. Pratchett provides detailed world descriptions in *The Discworld Companion*, *Science of the Discworld*, and to a lesser extent, the various world- and location-specific maps. The Warhammer World's collection of novels, rulebooks and short stories all, essentially, equate to sourcebooks on the subject of magic, as each of them brings some new element to the fore, or examines the matter from a slightly different perspective. The rulebooks are especially strong as sourcebooks, as they provide not only game-related rules for magic, but also a basic understanding of its role and function within the Warhammer World as a whole. These additional sources have their precedent in *The Lord of the Rings* itself, which contains several appendices that in turn rely on Tolkien's 'On Fairy Stories' to educate the reader about the finer points of magic, specifically by informing the reader that the fantasy secondary world is in fact a Faërie world, with all accompanying assumptions of those worlds.

The abundance of appendices and sourcebooks raises the question of their significance and relevance to the creation of consistency and coherency within the secondary worlds. Edmund Fuller in his essay 'The Lord of the Hobbits' comments that

> Though the appendices contribute to the pervasive verisimilitude of the tale, they are not necessary for such a purpose. They reflect Tolkien's own intensity of inner experience and total absorption in his act of subcreation.[35]

Neil D. Isaacs's essay 'On the Possibilities of Writing Tolkien Criticism' likewise states that

> A series of wholly distinct and separate problems are raised by the appendices. They are pertinent to and substantially integral parts of the created world of Middle-earth, the Secondary World; but the question remains whether they are parts of the artefact called *The Lord of the Rings*. Conceptions of art and definitions of genre need to be called in for question here; the presence of the appendices makes of rather large problems of aesthetics.[36]

Fuller and Isaacs suggest that the appendices are something outside of the story telling of *The Lord of the Rings*, yet at the same time are still a part of the world building exercise of the secondary world itself. In the same manner, The *Discworld Companion* and the Warhammer World's supplementary sourcebooks, rulebooks and various short stories all contribute material in the same manner.

---

[35] Edmund Fuller, 'The Lord of the Hobbits: J. R. R. Tolkien', in *Tolkien and the Critics: Essays on J. R. R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings,* eds. Neil David Isaacs and Rose A. Zimbado (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968), p. 18.

[36] Neil D. Isaacs, 'On the Possibilities of Writing Tolkien Criticism', in *Tolkien and the Critics: Essays on J. R. R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings*, eds. Neil David Isaacs and Rose A. Zimbado (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968), p. 11.

They are not an essential component of the story telling found within the actual novels set in their respective fantasy worlds, but something that enhances the reader's understanding of the worlds if they should choose to develop more in-depth knowledge of the worlds of which they are reading. In this sense, the supplementary materials become an extension of the author's secondary world, helping to shape it more coherently and clarify any inconsistencies that may have arisen through the story telling found within the various novels.

These extra resources also allow the author to provide greater in-depth descriptions of things that would, otherwise, come across as unnecessary exposition within the novels.

Further detail about the Creatures and the Dungeon Dimensions, for example, is provided in the *Discworld Companion*, with a description that reads, in part:

> The sad, mad things that dwell there have no understanding of the world but simply crave light and shape and try to warm themselves by the fires of reality, clustering around it with about the same effect – if they ever broke through – as an ocean trying to warm itself around a candle.[37]

There is an entire page in the Companion dedicated the same manner of description that fleshes out the Creatures' intents and desires, all information that is interesting, but which would sidetrack a story's narrative. While the author can provide examples and situations where the magic system is being detailed in their novels, for example, they can keep the information within the novel to a bare minimum required for understanding and believability, and later expand on this information in the supplementary materials in order to fully realise the rules and limitations of their magic system. This is not to suggest that authors can or should

---

[37] Pratchett and Briggs, p. 149.

leave their world building to their supplementary materials — as this can lead to readers being presented with far too little information with which to imagine the secondary world — merely that this can shift exposition to a more relevant source.

The crucial thing is that the supplementary materials should provide an *addition* to the secondary world, not an answer to questions that the text itself is too lazy to answer. Ideally the power of choice is put in the hands of the reader. Should the novel be sufficient, the reader can close the pages with a sigh of satisfaction. Should the reader be hungry for more, the additional sourcebooks provide extra information and the opportunity to continue to dwell in and think about the secondary world and how it works.

Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*, as stated earlier, is one text that on the surface seems to not adhere to my preferred demonstration of magic consistency or internal laws. Gandalf seemingly uses magic more as a tool when the narrative dictates, for example, fighting against wolves 'in the wavering firelight Gandalf seemed suddenly to grow […] he lifted a burning branch […] It flared with a sudden white radiance light lightning; and his voice rolled like thunder'.[38] The world itself does not seem to have a defined source for its magic, and Tolkien does little to explain magic to the reader.

Of course, this is evident when *The Lord of the Rings* is read in isolation. In and of itself, yes, magic is undefined within this text. However, after reading Tolkien's 'On Fairy Stories', it becomes apparent that *The Lord of the Rings* is an exercise in presenting the reader with a secondary world placed squarely within the realms of the Faërie. Here the fiction is insufficient on its own - for readers who want to learn about how magic works in Middle Earth the supplementary is a

---

[38] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 291.

44

necessity rather than optional. 'On Fairy Stories' reveals that the Elves are

immortal beings and that their power is tied to the lands. The more the lands

weaken and begin to die, the more isolated the Elves become, and the stronger

their desire to retreat to a safer place. The same is true in light of Frodo's task to

destroy the One Ring. Galadriel tells Frodo directly that:

> if you succeed, then our power is diminished and Lothlórien will fade, and
>
> the tides of Time will sweep it away. We must depart into the West, or
>
> dwindle to a rustic folk of dell and cave, slowly to forget and to be
>
> forgotten.[39]

Of course, should he fail in his endeavour, everyone will be destroyed by evil.

Nonetheless, the Elves in *The Lord of the Ring* are a weakening race, losing the

power in their lands, and therefore the power of the Faërie. John Rosegrant, in his

article 'Tolkien's Dialogue Between Enchantment and Loss', expands on the

symbiotic dynamic of power of the Faërie world and the Elves when he points out

that 'much of their power is invested in the three rings, and if the One Ring is

destroyed, the three rings will lose their power'.[40] In fact, the danger is that the

Faërie world itself will cease to maintain its power, causing it to retreat further; at

the conclusion of *The Lord of the Rings* this is indeed the case. The One Ring is

destroyed, and the Elves all sail away from the mainland.

The world itself is tied to magic, though Tolkien himself would term it

"enchantment", with "magic" being reserved more for the kinds of wondrous

powers displayed by Gandalf, Saruman and their ilk. As noted in the appendices,

there were only five people including Gandalf and Saruman, and they 'came in the

shape of Men, though they were never young and aged only slowly, and they had

---

[39] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 356.
[40] John Rosegrant, *'Tolkien's Dialogue Between Enchantment and Loss'*, *Mythlore*, 33.2, (2015),
    131.

many powers of mind and hand'.[41] This description does not even allude to magic, deliberately creating mystery as to what these powers might be.

The appendices are vital, providing readers with extra detail that is not otherwise received through the narrative of *The Lord of the Rings* itself. In terms of my analysis of whether authors present magic in a consistent and coherent way, the narrative of *Lord of the Rings* does not entirely measure up to these requirements; the text itself is simply insufficient for answering readers' questions about the nature of magic within this secondary world. Readers have to turn to the appendices and Tolkien's essays for answers. Here they learn that Gandalf and Saruman are of the same ilk, a detail that provides consistency in that only people like Gandalf can wield magic in the same manner, hence why Saruman is his equal. Tolkien is quoted as 'unhesitatingly' stating that 'Gandalf is an angel'; which, in itself, suggests that his magic is divine and "god-derived".[42] As Attebery reinforces, angels 'don't have to be explained. Everyone knows what an angel is – except that what "everyone knows" is not the same from one person to the next'.[43] Tolkien would therefore need to provide more detail about the nature of angels in *The Lord of the Rings*, yet he does not do so. Once again, this is an example of external information that explains (or at least suggests) a source of magic within *The Lord of the Rings*, rather than having any actual reference to it within the text. This is a mystery that the internal consistency of the narrative cannot ever answer.

The Lord of the Rings is also a world of both Soft Magic, and seemingly Low Magic Saturation. The reader is presented with magic as being part of the world, but very little is provided to explain how important magic really is to the

---

[41] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings* , p. 1059.
[42] Isaacs, p. 35.
[43] Attebery, p. 413.

entire world. There are hints that suggest to the reader that Tolkien understands the relation, with distinctions between magic and the Faërie. The Faërie, in this case, practically represents the world at large, almost the entire secondary world itself. In *On Fairy-Stories*, Tolkien expresses a distinction between *The Lord of the Rings* and *The Hobbit*:

> In *The Lord of the Rings*, the realm of Faërie that is the home and source of otherworld enchantment is more **internally consistent** and better integrated than it was in *The Hobbit*.[44] (bolding my emphasis).

Elves and nature are almost one and the same, with each reflecting the other. When the Elves are dominant, nature is strong. When nature is dying, so too are the Elves. Therefore, regarding the Faërie world of this setting, Tolkien states that the Elves are retreating, leaving the world to men, thus setting up magic, or enchantment in this case, as almost being background to the narrative, yet also central to the world building itself (although barely mentioned as being so important). Clute points out that 'the borders of Faërie shift according to the power of the land's magic and its balance with the encroachment of humankind's science and civilization'.[45] In *The Lord of the Rings*, the Elves are leaving and the lands are dying, and the civilization of humankind is growing. The years of the Third Age are outlined as being 'the fading years of the Eldar', and that 'the wisdom and the life-span of Númenorereans also waned as they became mingled with lesser Men'.[46] Tolkien does not expressly impress upon the reader (within the confines of the narrative) the idea that this world is a Faërie world, but the clues are all there; likely another one of his mysteries for the reader to work

---

[44] Tolkien, *On Fairy Stories*, p. 18.
[45] John Clute, 'Faërie', in *The Encyclopedia of Fantasy*, ed. by John Clute and John Grant (London: Orbit, 1997), p. 328.
[46] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 1059.

through alone. To this end, however, the world, due to its Faërie setting does indeed have a High Magic Saturation.

Another hint at the Faërie setting is presented to the reader when Sam and Frodo are talking with Galadriel about "Galadriel's Mirror". The Hobbits are discussing magic and Galadriel replies:

'For this is what your folk would call magic, I believe; though I do not understand clearly what they mean; and they seem to use the same word of the deceits of the Enemy. But this, if you will, is the magic of Galadriel. Did you not say that you wished to see Elf-magic?'[47]

Since, as Tolkien points out in 'On Fairy Stories', the Faërie realm is comprised of enchantment, rather than a more 'vulgar' magic, the reader must make the distinction between the two for themselves. As Tolkien states: 'magic should be reserved for the operations of the Magician'.[48] In this encounter with Galadriel, the reader, and the Hobbits as intermediaries for the reader, are presented with what could be classified, at least in the contemporary view, to be magic. That Galadriel cannot classify it in the same manner seems to be Tolkien's way of emphasising the point. Further, her contention that "magic" is a word for the 'deceits of the Enemy' once more reinforces the vulgarity of the term in this setting. Isaacs further explains this distinction:

Following the lead of Tolkien, I have avoided the word "magic" in relation to Elves. Not that it may not be used, but that it may confuse a fine distinction. Enchantment is not a technique that Elves use, rather is it the total natural mode of their being and action. The wizard commands magic

---

[47] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 353.
[48] Tolkien, 'On Fairy Stories', p. 64.

as an acquired technique and lore, consciously employed for specific effects, good or bad.[49]

Other parts of the narrative suggest that Hobbits know of magic, but do not study it ('Hobbits have never, in fact, studied magic of any kind'), and that men do know of and study magic, but that it is not something commonly undertaken, though it is utilised in weaponsmithing, as Aragorn notices weapons that are the 'work of Westernesse, wound about with spells for the bane of Mordor'.[50] So, magic is something "transferable" between the various peoples of Middle Earth, whereas Faërie enchantment is something natural to the world itself and especially to Elves. Gandalf even notes that he 'once knew every spell in all the tongues of Elves or Menor Orcs'.[51] Despite Tolkien's obvious intention to make such a classification distinct, authors following in his stead have since equated enchantment and magic; or at least fused the two into the same sort of catch-all title of magic. Magic, therefore, is now magic regardless of its narrative source.

The problem comes from the fact that the deeper explanation is not only external to the narrative itself, but also external to the other novels set in the same world (*The Hobbit*, *The Silmarillion*). In fact, Tolkien, in a letter to Milton Waldman even wrote the following regarding magic and the elves:

> I have not used 'magic' consistently, and indeed the Elven-queen Galadriel is obliged to remonstrate with the Hobbits on their confused use of the word both for the devices and operations of the Enemy, and for those of the Elves. I have not, because there is not a word for the latter (since all human stories have suffered the same confusion). But the Elves are there (in my tales) to demonstrate the difference. Their 'magic' is Art,

---

[49] Isaacs, p. 23.
[50] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings,* p. 1 and p. 405.
[51] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings,* p. 299.

delivered from many of its human limitations: more effortless, more quick,

more complete (product, and vision in unflawed correspondence). And its

object is Art not Power, sub-creation not domination and tyrannous

reforming of Creation.[52]

Elven "enchantment" thus differentiates itself from "magic" by being something

more nurturing, creative, and not destructive. The details as to what magic is, or

the nature of Gandalf as an angel, are found within slightly harder to source

materials, and not necessarily ones with obvious links to the main text. The

narrative itself is excellent, indeed it could not have spawned so many homages

and inspired so many authors if that were not the case, but it does not, perhaps,

attain the reader's desired level of internal completeness. Despite the world being

extensively detailed and creating a lasting impression on the reader, it still has too

much that remains unexplained. Unfortunately, many other novels by other

authors that have the same level of "mystery" fall short on the extensive world

building, likely leading to Clute referring to them as 'shallow and simplistic'.

What makes *The Lord of the Rings* a stand out, therefore, is not its attention to

detail regarding magic, but rather its attention to detail regarding real, relatable

world histories and the narrative of the tale itself.

Terry Pratchett's *Sourcery* presents the reader with a world that has

already been established as magical throughout the previous novels based on the

Discworld. However, in this instance Pratchett further expands our understanding

of Discworld's magic system by delving into the sources of magic itself. Prior to

this Pratchett had detailed the Creator and his/her involvement in making the

world, and leaving behind the tomes of creation that had a life all of their own.

---

[52] 'Letter 131' in *The Letters of J. R. R. Tolkien*, eds. Humphrey Carpenter and Christopher
    Tolkien, (Glasgow: George Allen and Unwin, 1981).

Magical books in the Discworld are sentient creatures of a sort – much the same as how books of magic were viewed in our own history. Richard Kieckhefer says that: 'one might say that it was common [to ascribe] to them a kind of personality'.[53] For example, Pratchett suggests, early in the narrative of *Sourcery*, that 'the everyday grimoires and incunabula on the main shelves were as restless and nervy as the inmates of a chicken-house with something rank scrabbling under the door'.[54] The wondrous nature of the world being borne aloft the back of four gargantuan elephants in turn supported on the back of an even larger turtle had also been examined, leaving Pratchett with room to examine where this magic actually comes from.

In the previous four novels in the Discworld series, magic had played its part; the wizards were explained in some detail and the world had been outlined, yet there is still little in the way of "This is where magic comes from". Of course, this is not a world where magic contradicts itself, since Pratchett certainly seems to fully understand his Discworld's magic system and as a result knows exactly what magic can or cannot do. The readers had a believable world, but as yet it had no completeness to its laws of magic. At the very start of *Sourcery* Pratchett provides an insight into how magic works through genetics:

> The eighth son grew up and married and had eight sons, and because there
> is only one suitable profession for the eighth son of an eighth son, he
> became a wizard … But against the Lore of Magic … he fled the halls of
> magic and fell in love and got married … and he had seven sons, each one
> from the cradle at least as powerful as any wizard in the world. And then

---

[53] Kieckhefer, p. 2.
[54] Pratchett, *Sourcery*, p. 11.

he had an eighth son… A wizard squared. A source of magic. A

sourcerer.[55]

This gives the reader an immediate connection to tie both magic and genetics

together, while also providing back-story about wizards (for example, in relation

to the rules surrounding marriage are concerned) and helping to further build the

world's magic rules system. At a later point in the narrative, the wizards are

preparing for a magic war, and the way in which magic can affect the world is

brought to the fore, specifically regarding why a Sourcerer generating new magic

can be a danger:

Two thousand years of peaceful magic had gone down the drain, the

towers were going up again, and with all this new raw magic floating

about something was going to get very seriously hurt. Probably the

universe. Too much magic could wrap time and space around itself…[56]

Not only does Pratchett show the reader how a Sourcerer generates magic; how

wizards have to store magic in their staffs before being able to use it; how magical

books are alive, and all other points about magic, but he also explains, simply,

how dangerous too much unchecked magic can be. In other words, Pratchett

knows both the rules and consequences surrounding the use of magic in the

Discworld, and consistently applies them to present a coherent world to the

reader.

The Discworld is also a setting where magic is fairly strongly linked to the

overall integrity of the entire world. Without magic, the world would not exist.

Invoking Sanderson's terms here again, Pratchett presents a world that is very

much Hard Magic. He at least knows how magic works in the Discworld, and

---

[55] Pratchett, *Sourcery*, p. 1.
[56] Pratchett, *Sourcery*, p. 196.

convincingly informs the reader of its rules. In fact, without magic, the stories would fail to resolve in the manner that they do, meaning that, in my terms, the world is also one of High Magic Saturation; it is everywhere and responsible for the world's events. Clute discusses this in detail, concerning the continuing trend from novel to novel:

> Discworld narratives are increasingly shaped by the interplay of belief and story. In *Moving Pictures* the movies compel belief, a source of power which threatens the world with monsters … Granny Weatherwax, whose laser-willed belief in herself makes her unstoppable, repeatedly works to derail stories whose impetus is being turned to bad ends.[57]

Despite ignoring that the "power" and Granny Weatherwax's own belief are forms of magic, Clute outlines one of the key features of Discworld narratives; that while characters and their stories take precedence over magic in Discworld narratives, magic certainly drives and guides the narrative as it unfolds. People start the events, but magic is still the root of, and answer to most of the world's problems.

In *Sourcery*, Pratchett lays the groundwork for explaining this further, especially regarding the nature of fate, and how magic can be used to determine someone's destiny rather than allowing events to unfold naturally. For example, Coin's father, Ipslore the Red, effectively creates the narrative of *Sourcery* by using magic to decide the future. In his conversation with Death at the very start of the novel the following is discussed:

> SOURCERERS MAKE THEIR OWN DESTINY. THEY TOUCH THE EARTH LIGHTLY.

[57] John Clute, 'Terry Pratchett', in *The Encyclopedia of Fantasy*, ed. by John Clute and John Grant (London: Orbit, 1997), p. 784.

Ipslore leaned on the staff, drumming on it with his fingers, apparently lost in the maze of his own thoughts. His left eyebrow twitched.

'No,' he said, softly, 'no. I will make his destiny for him.'[58]

Ipslore then proceeds to use magic to trap his soul inside his staff, which then becomes Coin's possession, and from there he directs Coin's life.

The Wizards of the Unseen University later try to intervene and stop Coin, but Coin personally uses his magic to overcome his father's influence, thereby ending the narrative of magical-directed destiny. He achieves this by destroying the magic staff in which has father's soul is bound:

Coin got to his feet in one movement and swung the staff over his head. He stood still as a statue, his hand lost in a ball of light that was the colour of molten copper. It turned green, ascended through shades of blue, hovered in the violet and then seared into pure octarine.[59]

Octarine — as outlined not only earlier in the novel, but indeed in *The Colour of Magic* — is the colour of magic itself therefore the ball of light indicates Coin's use of magic.

Surprisingly, although that spells the end of the narrative concerning magically induced destiny, the story still continues, and Coin, and the character Rincewind, are forced to defeat the creatures from the Dungeon Dimensions without using magic at all:

No magic, right? He said.

Yes, said the boy.

Whatever happens, you mustn't use magic?

---

58 Pratchett, *Sorcery*, p. 3.
59 Pratchett, *Sorcery*, p. 250.

That's it. Not here. They haven't got much power here, if you don't use magic.[60]

In a narrative all about the power of magic, and the important role it has for the world, the inability to utilise magic now becomes crucial. Coin, a character who has relied on magic his entire life, must now resolve matters in a mundane fashion. This essentially proves to the reader that the world functions with magic, and indeed needs magic to function, but that it still follows the natural order, and that issues can be dealt with in a human manner. Not only does Pratchett develop a world of magic, with certain laws and dangers outlined for the reader, but he also provides an explanation of how that same magic can be detrimental to the successful resolution of the narrative's arc. He makes magic important, but at the same time heightens the role that the characters take in solving their problems.

In later novels and narratives, much of the world building is left to smaller details (politics, people, and newly introduced places) because the essential explanation of magic's role and a strong understanding of how it works is provided early on in the series. For example, in *A Hat Full of Sky*, Pratchett has the character Miss Tick explain that a 'research witch':

> 'tries to find new spells by learning how olds ones were really done. You know all that stuff about "ear of bat and toe of frog"? They never work, but Miss Level thinks it's because we don't know exactly what *kind* of frog, or which toe'.[61]

This particular expands on the already established lore about witches, but is essentially a minor detail. *Sourcery* is the fifth Discworld novel out of a series spanning 41 novels, and as such it provided Pratchett with the right moment in the

---

[60] Pratchett, *Sourcery*, p. 264.
[61] Terry Pratchett, *A Hat Full of Sky* (London: Random House, 2004), p. 37.

series to produce an almost info-dump related narrative outlining how magic really works within the world. The story itself is not entirely an example of exposition, but it is dotted with plenty of details for the reader to gain a deeper understanding of magic. Pratchett built a world on a grand scale, but at first it was only examined in part. Since the overall world building was not developed hand-in-hand with laying the ground rules for magic, I feel readers were presented with an almost fluid evolution of the world, to a state where, post *Sourcery*, there was a fully formed fantasy secondary world. The additional source material (such as the *Discworld Map*, *Death's Domain* and *The Tourist's Guide To Lancre*) all provide substantial details about the world's geography (or Death's home dimension's geography) therefore cementing the Discworld as its own world.

The Warhammer World provides an example of a secondary world which, over the course of many years and many authors, presents the reader with a complete understanding of its own internal magic system. From the most basic "All Magic power comes from the Realm of Chaos" to the more complex "This is what magic does to a person's body and mind and soul" the authors for the Warhammer World present the reader with a comprehensive and consistent system. Magic plays one of the most important roles in maintaining the integrity of the Warhammer World. The reader knows exactly where is comes from: the magic was brought to the world by the Old Ones when they first arrived; they created a portal through which they came and Chaos, and magic, followed:

The Old Ones also created portals that allowed them to travel vast distances and move at will from this realm to the next. They knew not that, with these acts, they were cultivating their own demise.[62]

Most races are able to manipulate magic to their own desires, even though this information mostly comes via the humans of the world:

As Magisters see it, to use magic is to give shape to the stuff of raw Chaos. A Wizard uses his will and his very flesh to form a conduit between this world and the immaterial realm (known as the Aethyr and the Realm of Chaos), drawing power from the "winds" of magic.[63]

The reader knows that 'the Warhammer world is an intrinsically magical place, where mystical energy infuses the very land itself' and that without magic, the world would be a vastly different place'.[64] The world is under constant threat of destruction at all times as the forces of Chaos wish to engulf it (a narrative thread that the authors carried out in early to mid-2015 with their 'End of Times' and 'Age of Sigmar' narratives where Chaos did indeed succeed in destroying the world through sheer force of magic, and a new realm, also highly steeped in magic grew to take its place). Magic, while the final weapon of mass destruction that destroyed the world, was not the driving force of the narrative in the End of Times. The characters and story, including their motivations and end goals, was the main point of the End of Times story arc, but the threat that magic posed was consistently emphasised and maintained.

Even outside of the End of Times narrative, almost every description about magic in the Warhammer World underlines the threat that the Chaos Gods pose,

---

[62] Matthew Ward, *Warhammer: The Game of Fantasy Battles* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 2010), p. 158.
[63] Chris Pramas, *Warhammer Fantasy Roleplay* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 2004), p. 141.
[64] Ward, p. 28.

and their desire to use magic to destroy the world. Almost all the Warhammer World's texts emphasise that the High Elves are the only mortal race able to control all forms of magic, and that humans are too frail-minded to do so. In a very similar way as the Elves and enchantment in *The Lord of the Rings* are symbiotically linked, the High Elves of the Warhammer World also have a close relationship with magic. In fact, the Age of Sigmar narrative heavily features the High Elves, further highlighting their struggle against Chaos, and their link to defensive magics within the world. The Warhammer World is almost like a Faërie world, though enchantment is most certainly replaced with magic, and in this case, the 'debase form' of magic as Tolkien described it.

The Warhammer World therefore places magic at the extreme end of importance (Hard Magic, in Sanderson's terms, and High Magic Saturation in my own). Due to the wider marketable production of books for the Warhammer World (rulebooks, armybooks, novels, and other sundry publications) a common thread can be noticed: although not confined to a single text, nor to a small selection of texts, the world is still centred on magic. Over the course of many years (the Warhammer World was first devised in 1983), a multitude of authors have provided details on and expanded the world through subsequent publications. As Wolf points out:

> World-based franchises could be expanded beyond the lifespan and experience of any individual character, which gave them an advantage over other character-based franchises. The increased scale, size, and multimedia nature of these worlds would mean more worlds created by multiple authors (and their employees).[65]

---

[65] Wolf, p. 134.

What this means for the Warhammer World is that, with magic being such an important feature, the earlier noted important key narrative features of clarity, consistency, and realism must be evident. To this end, the world feels entirely real – we as readers have almost as much understanding of the nature and laws governing the Warhammer World as we do of our own real world.

As these three textual examples have shown, there is a very strong correlation between the internal consistency and coherency of the laws of magic governing each secondary world's magic system, which in turn build a stronger believability for the reader. Everything that is presented about magic, or enchantment in Tolkien's case, helps to build on the world's setting itself, while at the same time presenting the reader with elements that help to carry the story forward without overwhelming them with unnecessary detail, or in-depth explanation all at once. The characters' roles and their interaction with magic help to create people who are more fleshed out, and the plot of the story continues to develop without becoming simplistic. Indeed, the inclusion of a fully-realised magic system with its according rules and limitations actually enhances the story and provides further opportunity for plot points. The Elves' relationship with nature (and enchantment) in *The Lord of the Rings*, for example, shows that they care more deeply for the world than men do, therefore their role in helping to defeat Sauron becomes that of protecting the core element of the world's setting (protecting the Faërie).

Whether an author sets out to persuade the reader about a particular issue, or to expand on literary elements such as signs and signifiers, or Freudian theory for example, should not have any bearing here as to whether or not magic itself, as an enhancement to narrative components, has been handled successfully. The

believability of the secondary world is the key element, and if the reader does not believe that the events could have taken place within the secondary world setting, then the author has failed. With fantasy being a genre that relies on the reader's assumption that magic exists within the fantasy world, it is therefore imperative that it is not simply left as a mystery to be unravelled by the reader, as this can lead the author (even unintentionally) to present internal inconsistencies within their stories. It is likewise crucial that magic is not simply a convenient solution to characters' predicaments and difficulties — the deus ex machina to which authors resort if they write themselves into a corner — but that it is a coherent and consistent part of the laws and rules of the secondary world.

To exemplify how magic can be weaved into the narrative as part of the characterisation, plot development and the world building itself, I now present a piece of my own creative writing which is itself an excerpt from a longer piece of fiction. In this example I aim to show how the author can make magic feel more intrinsic to the world, and not just tacked on. In a similar vein to Sanderson's *Elantris*, where Raoden's discoveries about magic inform the reader about the significance of magic in the fantasy world, the following piece, 'The Pyromancer', follows a character learning where the energies for her magic come from, how to control her abilities, and the potential downfalls resulting from failure to control magic. Through this character's progression, the narrative itself helps to explain magic and its limitations without an excessive use of exposition. Fragments of the overall magic system are revealed through the character's actions and the comments from her companions throughout the piece, establishing a consistent and coherent system. This short piece does not explain the entire system that exists within the secondary world setting, but it shows how the magic

60

system can be used to enhance and add further detail to the characters' actions as well as the overall flow of the narrative. The longer piece of creative fiction includes further expansions on the magic system, though much of the system's greater detail will be explained in other pieces of creative writing. Before embarking on writing any actual narratives based on the magic system in my secondary world, I made sure I had developed a system of magic, complete with internal consistency and coherence as well as rules, restrictions and consequences built into this system, and it has guided my use of magic within my storytelling. Within the greater context of the full story, 'The Pyromancer' represents a single character's learning curve regarding their understanding of magic.

Creative Interlude 1

'The Pyromancer'

Ilessa was not like the rest of her Chronariad kin. She did not possess the time-controlling abilities of her sisters. She always insisted that this was nothing more than a temporary setback – that not everyone developed their aptitude at the same time. Sometimes she felt that Ranitan was the only one who understood – he was still a warrior in training and she was still waiting to learn. For the past week, she felt like this was changing – some new power was coursing through her blood, she could taste it. It didn't seem to be Chronomancy, but she relished it nonetheless. Besides, Chronariads don't only wield power over time; the other Streams of Magic are also open to their command.

Before the night's dream adventure could begin, she addressed the entire party.

"I have concerns about what is happening to me, and I want to you all to keep an eye on my actions."

"Spit it out woman, we can't hardly help if we don't know what we're looking out for." Hellioth replied. He leaned on the handle of his upturned warhammer, peering at Ileesa. "Ye look to be in fine health."

"I'm not ill. I think my magic is starting to begin. I'm not entirely certain that it's Chronomancy either. Since there are no other Chronariads around to guide me, I don't think I'd be able to control it otherwise."

"Do you forget that I have sorcerous powers?" Lorthar snapped a small flame into life at the tip of a claw. "I'll keep you in check."

"Thank you."

"No. If you lose control of whatever power you are developing, I will end you to save the rest of us. Remember that."

Her speech finished and the adventure began – a wizard's tower in the desert. The party stared up, craning backwards to see the top. Ancient stonework, jutting window braces, stairs, and wooden platforms corkscrewed around the outer walls of the keep. Crumbling and crack laced crenulations capped the occasional balcony bulwark.

"We will fly up and scout." Torvan offered, pointing at Vespith and Lorthar. Kellon and Borrag nodded, and the trio unfurled their wings for flight. They flapped, but never took to the air.

"Damnation!" Vespith rattled, clawing at the sand with his hooked toes. He wrapped his leather wings around himself, standing still. Torvan and Lorthar in turn furled their own wings.

"There is magic at work here. I will get us airborne." Lorthar growled. He closed his eyes, grumbling under his breath and rising onto his hind legs. With his eyes still closed, he curled his forepaws through the air before his chest. With a flourish he opened his eyes and held his paws far apart. Nothing happened. He dropped to all fours and spat a glob of flame at the sand. He growled.

"My dear Lorthar, there's nothing wrong with failing," Ileesa began.

"Do not call me a failure, timeless one."

"I didn't. Whoever owns this keep must have powerful magics, and you do not yet posses the strength to overcome them."

"Listen to her, Lorthar. We are defeated for the moment. But we shall bathe in victory come the end. Find a way into this place and we can continue to glory." Borrag pointed to both sides of the curved wall. "Some of us will go this way, and the rest, that way. We will meet around the other side of this tower and report. Go!"

The group split into two parties, each venturing in opposite directions around the base of the tower. This was nowhere near as easy a task as it sounded – the ground was uneven with shifting sand; there were wooden stakes arranged sticking out at odd angles from the wall which forced the group to veer deeper into the sands; tangles of desert flora pricked their skin and shredded their clothes.

"This is torture." Vespith wailed, his thick wading-bird-like feet dragging through the sand. "I can't bear this."

"Stop ye bellyaching. Aye, there's send a plenty, I'm not making a fuss."

"Why complain? Pleasant sun, soft sand. I like." Ranitan swished his tail over the surface of the sand and grinned at Vespith.

"See, that's more like it. Ye can learn a thing or two from Ranitan."

Vespith flapped his wings, batting a flurry of sand toward the others.

"All of you, please stop bickering, this isn't helping me. My head's feeling too light. I think something is interfering with my magic's development." Ilessa clutched her temples and dropped to one knee. Borrag put an arm around her shoulders and dragged her upright.

"Yes. Silence. All of you. Stay on task. We are not here to complain."

After another hour's slow slog, the two halves of the party reconvened. Borrag gave his report before Kellon.

"No doors and no windows within reach on our side."

"Well, that's unfortunate. No back exit then. We found a massive pair of wooden doors around this side. Come on, before we waste too much time here."

As soon as she stopped for a brief rest, Ilessa's stomach churned. She doubled over and heaved, but nothing came up. Everyone stared at her as the desert winds whistled through the tower's various accoutrements. A low hanging wind chime made from small thigh bones rattled softly.

"That was not a good sign. Did everyone else see her skin flash red then? You're a danger to us, girl. I wasn't lying when I said I'd keep you in check."

"What in the hells are you saying?" Kellon stepped forward, blocking Lorthar's path. "She's got sunstroke or something, can't you see that?"

"What I see is someone losing control of their magic. If she can't keep her concentration, she's going to force a stream of Raw Magic onto us all. I can live with her losing her soul spark to the stream, but I'll be damned if I let her kill me too."

"That's not going to happen. Teach her some control right now, and we can get on with entering this tower. We'll worry about anything taking matters further if, and only if, it gets to that. Are we clear?" Borrag took up a position next to Kellon, all three pairs of arms crossed over his chest.

"Clear. But you are being a fool."

Ileesa held one hand to her stomach and pressed the other against the wall. She could feel the thrum of magic in the stone; almost see it pulsing in the air. Her gaze was half crossed as she tried to focus. Lorthar caught her stare, and squinted.

"You can see it then? Maybe you're not too lost after all."

"I think I see something. Like a river of energy. Floating in the air."

"Speak up."

"I can see the streams of magic!"

"I am sure you can. I don't know how your kind trains its nascent mages, especially in the ways of Chronomancy, but know this: those streams are both your ally and your downfall. Don't let the stream drain your soulspark, or it will kills us all. If you feel a power surge inside your head, look to the streams of magic, and avoid them. Keep them at bay. Remember, I *will* strike you down if I have to save us all."

Ileesa nodded. She pushed off from the wall, staggering a little, and stepped across to one side. She looked, cross-eyed, at the faint glimmer of magic around her, and positioned herself in a clear spot. The pain in her stomach subsided.

"Thank you"

"Just watch where you're going."

Ileesa took a few minutes to settle her stomach and to catch her breath before Kellon signalled that it was time to press on. She placed every footfall with precise care, pausing any time she felt a rush of power, letting her body adjust to the streams of magic. It was only a ten minute trek around to the main doors, but to her, it felt like an hour. Lorthar kept looking back at her, a glint of suspicion in his eye. She didn't like it at all. This was the wrong time for this, her mother would know how to train her properly. She took a deep breath and held it in. She closed her eyes and pictured her mothers, her sisters, her kin. The rituals were different for each person, but the passage into mage-hood bore the same lessons. She tried to hold onto some of those lessons, the ones her mothers had taught to her sisters. The breathing, the rites, anything to keep herself focused. Nothing was

working. As she stood to one side of the party, almost in a trance, Borrag and Lorthar tore into the wooden doors. Half-rotted splinters arced through the air as the wood shuddered and groaned under the assault. Their work was short as the timbers collapsed, kicking up a dust cloud and a hollow echoed thud.

"Couldn't you have done that any quieter?" Elfor whined in a husky whisper. "Now they're going to know we're coming."

"Good. I need to tear into something more substantial than this rotten door." Lorthar licked his forked tongue across his lips. "Let's find something to kill." He pounced through the gaping doorway onto the cobblestones beyond. "There's got to be a staircase around here somewhere."

Ileesa opened her eyes and followed slowly into the tower, watching each footfall with careful precision. Eddies of magic swirled around everywhere. The dusty bookshelves laden with half ruined tomes. The worn wooden benches and tables. The doorway on the left of the hall in particular attracted a greater concentration of magical energies.

"I wonder what's behind that door?" she pointed to it.

"What door? There's nothing there ye dafty."

Lorthar turned to look where Ileesa's outstretched finger was pointed.

"Hellioth's right; what door? There's a concentration of magic here, but I don't see a door."

"It's as bright as a flame! How can none of you see it?"

Lorthar licked at the air. "Yes, Pyromantic magic is strong. Elfor, can you see anything?"

"No warpfires, if that's what you mean. Just a stone wall."

"I'm not insane. There's a door. Right. THERE!"

Lorthar lumbered over to the wall, and lashed out with one of his paws. The stonework exploded, showering everyone with dust and pebbles. When the destruction had settled, there, behind the ragged hole, was a short passage and the foot of a wide flight of stairs spiralling up the inside wall of a tall tower.

"Well now, the timeless one was right. Are you all just going to stand there gawping? Follow me."

"Lorthar, stop. No one is going anywhere until we make our plan."

"Come on, Borrag, what plan do we need? There's a wizard up these stairs, and we're down here. We go up and kill him. End of plan."

"No, Borrag's right. We came blundering in here without a plan, and we need to re-evaluate our situation. We can't take everything at face value anymore."

"Fine. You always want to spoil my fun, Kellon. Let's hear your plan then."

"Good. Ileesa, do you see anything else here that we might have overlooked?"

She looked around the hall, pointing out the tables, the bookshelves, the small stained-glass windows.

"Windows? Where?" She pointed them out, three in total, along the far east wall. The rest of the party followed Kellon's utterance – no-one else could see them.

"Lorthar, can you see them?" Kellon asked, the question coming through half-clenched teeth.

"No. No I do not." He growled from the back of his throat and paused. "Fine. You have my attention now, girl. Perhaps you are more able to control your power than I imagined." He curled a lip to bare his fangs.

"Stop that. You threaten her again, and I'll personally knock you down." Borrag shook a fist at Lorthar, who rolled his eyes in response. "You got that?"

"Ileesa, I want you and Ranitan to take the lead on this. If anything tries to ambush us on the stairs, I'm sure you'll both have an advantage that the rest of us won't. Borrag, you and Lorthar will take the rearguard. Hopefully, his magical insight will be enough to warn you of any threats. The rest of us will stay in the middle of the group. Go."

Ileesa peeked through the ragged hole, looking to either side of the wall beyond. There was dust and crumbled brickwork, but nothing else. There were streams of magic that swirled high above, nowhere near enough to pose any threat. Satisfied, she stepped through followed by Ranitan.

"You have my trust." He rapped the end of his spear on the floor.

"Thank you, Ranitan. That puts me at ease. A little, at least. I'm going to stay close to the wall. I'm still feeling queasy."

"If you fall, I will catch you."

The rest of the party trickled through to the stairwell. Lorthar heaved his way through the wall, demolishing the stonework as he went, followed by Borrag. Everyone had their weapons drawn, and kept their eyes fixed on Ileesa. The stairs were not steep, and were well maintained. They trudged on upward, spiralling the tower, but it was half an hour of slow progress before they came to their first stop. They paused on a stone platform that jutted awkwardly out from the wall, a

balcony of sorts, large enough for everyone. From here the stairs continued up, but there was a wooden door set into the wall.

"Do we go through, or continue up?"

"Don't rush me, Kellon, let me concentrate." She let her eyes unfocus and her vision swam. There were streams of magic angled upward. "It looks like the magic is being drawn to the top of the tower." She stumbled as a surge of energy rushed through her head. Her eyes felt like they were about to explode from an internal pressure. Lorthar roared and lifted a paw to swipe, but she held out a hand.

"No! I can control this!" She lurched aside, and pressed her head against the cold stone. She breathed deep and the pain subsided. "Look for yourself, Lorthar, and tell them what I saw."

Lorthar placed his paw back down and looked around.

"This door will lead us nowhere of value. If something above us is attracting magic, that's where we'll find our wizard. Can we get on with this? The longer we dawdle, the more she endangers us all."

"Lead on, Ileesa. Lorthar, you keep your paws to yourself. I don't want to see you using them against one of us unless there is no other choice."

"Fine."

"Borrag, you make sure he sticks to that."

"With pleasure."

They continued up the stairs. They encountered several more platforms as they climbed, each one enticing them with a door, but they followed Lorthar's magic sense and ignored these. The streams of magic were still being drawn upward, not through any of these doors. They continued upward, reaching one last

platform where the stairs ended at another wooden door. The base of the tower felt like it was several miles below them now.

"Behind that door. Can we get this over with?"

Torvan tapped his scimitar on the door.

"Without use of my wings, I fear this tower. Let's get through here before my courage fails me and I plummet down these stairs." Kellon and Borrag nodded, and Aevildûr pulled at the iron ring. The door refused to budge.

"Allow me the honour this time." Hellioth hefted his warhammer, twisting his body to ready the blow. Ileesa felt faint again, and closed her eyes. She jerked back as an image flashed through her mind. She saw Hellioth strike the door flush, followed by a bright red explosion.

"NO!" she screamed and opened her eyes. Hellioth almost tripped on his own feet as Ileesa's cry hit him. "The door's trapped! Don't strike it!"

"What're ye saying?"

"A vision. Fire. Explosion. Trap. Stop." She took two sharp breaths. She could feel her lungs burn. She dropped to a knee, her breathing erratic, and stared at Hellioth. Tears streamed down her face.

"Someone attend to her. Hellioth, hold back." Kellon barked.

"Ye can rest assured, I had no intention of carrying through after that display."

Aevildûr took a small potion bottle from his waistband.

"Drink. This shall ease the hyperventilation."

Kellon turned to Elfor.

"You've got some lock picking skill, can you give it a try?"

"Uh, yeah, though I'm not sure I like the sound of that trap."

71

"Lorthar, what can you make of it?"

"Without my full powers, I'm not sure. I think Ileesa has described a pressure spell though. Aevildûr didn't set it off when he pulled the ring. A lock pick should be fine."

"Good. You hear that?" He looked at Elfor "You'll be fine. A fireball shouldn't do you any harm anyway, right?"

"I'm glad you're so confident."

"Just do it. There's no point turning back now."

"Give me some space then. I can't do this with everyone staring over my shoulder." He took out a small wrap from his backpack and unrolled it on the floor. Picks, wires, lengths of metal clinked against each other. He looked at the lock, then grabbed two of the tools and set to work. Everyone stood back - Vespith and Shuul positioning themselves with Lorthar between themselves and the door. Ileesa tried slowing her breath, taking longer intakes of air. Elfor turned his instruments to and fro, rattling them in the lock. There was a soft click and he pulled the tools away, turning with a grin.

"There."

"Let me through." Lorthar barged forward. "I need to rend something limb from limb." He hooked a claw through the ring and tugged. The door swung open, barely even creaking. There was a book strewn chamber beyond. A stone altar took up the entire north wall; sigils drawn in the fresh blood of a sacrifice victim adorned the wall above it. A pair of alcoves were recessed into the east wall, strange carvings around their edges. A Snakeman dressed in purple robes rested before the altar, his lower body coiled underneath himself. In one hand he held the still beating heart of his victim, in the other, the blood dripping kris knife. He

hissed as the party swarmed into the room and another pair of Snakemen slithered out from the alcoves, scimitars raised. They were garbed in silk finery that marked them out to be of royal descent. Their family crests had been torn from their sleeves. The first Snakeman plunged the knife into the heart and thumped both down next to the altar. He held out his right arm, palm toward the party and fired a bolt of flame.

Ileesa leapt forward, a surge of magic propelling her, and reached out her left hand. The bolt of fire curled around her hand and twisted over her arm. She stood there, motionless, eyes closed as everyone took this sight in, dumbfounded. She could feel the heat of the flame as it licked the air around her flesh, but she was concentrating hard to keep it in stasis. Her powers were flowing through her with far more ease now. The Snakemen hissed something to each other, and the first one picked up his knife again. He threw it at Ileesa, striking her with the flat of the blade. She opened her eyes breaking her concentration. The flames were sucked down onto her skin, dropping her screaming to the floor. As she writhed and wailed, the others all bounded into action.

Aevildûr took to her side, dragging her away from the melee and administering to her burns with a salve from his pouch. Lorthar, though cramped in this chamber, leapt over Aevildûr and tore into one of the Snakemen. He lifted his foe into the air used his fangs to tear him apart, spraying hot gore over Vespith and Torvan as they stalked past into an alcove, chasing after one of the fleeing enemies. Ranitan let out a warcry, leaping fully across the room, to engage the first Snakeman in hand-to-hand combat as Hellioth stomped through the books to back him up, tearing ancient grimoires with every heavy footfall. Borrag, Shuul and Elfor stayed near the door, partly in wait for any sudden enemy

reinforcements, but partly also because there was little room for them to manoeuvre through the chamber and Kellon tip-toed and picked his way to the altar. Hellioth and Ranitan used their weight to pin their foe to the floor. He flicked his tail wildly, tossing a flurry of torn pages into the air. He tried to bite, but Hellioth butted his hammer into the open mouth, shattering the Snakeman's fangs. Vespith and Torvan returned a moment later, dragging the lifeless body of their quarry. The Snakeman's entrails were exposed, leaving a thick bloody trail draining away across the cobbles.

Kellon tutted.

"So I used my talons to gut him?"

"We spoke about this Vespith."

"You have nothing to say for Lorthar's ferocity?"

"You try reasoning with him. We're supposed to be more civilized."

"Eh." He shrugged and knocked more books onto the floor with his outstretched wings. "For what it's worth, there's another altar at the back of that alcove. Probably the same in the other one."

Kellon examined the victim on this altar.

"She's a Snakeman too, princess I think. Nothing we can do for her now. What do you have to say about this?" He turned to Ranitan and Hellioth's struggling prisoner, who spat a mouthful of blood. "Full of venom are we? Aevildûr! How's Ileesa doing?"

"She is as well as she can be."

"Good. Is she conscious?"

"For now."

"I'm fine." She croaked, taking Aevildûr's hand in hers. Her grip went tight and she passed out.

Chapter 2

The Source of Magic: A Case Study

Having established the importance for consistency and coherency when integrating magic into the construction of the secondary world and the unfolding fantasy narrative, I now hone in on a more specific aspect of magic and world building. All magic emanates from a source and this chapter explores the way in which J.R.R. Tolkien, Brandon Sanderson, Terry Pratchett and the creators of the Warhammer World provide readers with a comprehensive understanding of where magic comes from. The chapter operates in conjunction with Chapter One, forming a more specific case study of the principles of believability and cohesion in action. It also argues that in carefully detailing the sources of magic in their fantasy texts, my chosen authors are following in a long tradition of real world mages and scholars. Magic has been a part of many human societies and in each of the cultures and time periods in which a belief in magic has been strong both believers and critics have sought to pinpoint how to tap into magic as a force. This chapter begins by exploring these primary world contexts before turning to the fictional examples which form my case study.

Human history shows that magic — as a belief system and practice, as a way of explaining the unexplainable, and as a symbol of cultural fears and anxieties — is intertwined into the cultural background of many eras and geographic locations. It has been used to represent people's belief in and understanding of the supernatural, and can be seen as something that predates science or a scientific knowledge as to how things actually work. This is not a

phenomenon isolated to specific locations or cultures, but something that, in varying degrees and formats, can be observed in almost every culture, or culture's history.

Our own primary world history is filled with stories about magic and its prevalence and importance in everyday life. Books such as the second century Arabic grimoire *Picatrix* outline where this magic comes from, how to tap into its power, how to use it, and why. Other necromantic handbooks, such as the fifteenth century *Munich Manual of Demonic Magic*, were filled with detailed instructions on how to cast spells, what specific purposes they were for, and even included the author's own stories on how they had used the spells themselves. In the historical record, magic has frequently been regarded with suspicion. In the Renaissance, European witch hunts were fuelled by the publication of James I's 1599 *Daemonologie*, while social and moral panic resulted in the 1692-1693 Salem Witch trials. Richard Kieckhefer comments that 'virtually every magical technique one encounters appears so deeply rooted in tradition that magical practice seems essentially timeless and perennial'. [1] He argues that magic is something humans have practiced throughout history, and is therefore of high importance to our cultures.

Given this real world context, it is unsurprising that fantasy authors are so drawn to magic. It helps establish the fiction and its secondary world as being fantasy, and helps to strengthen the reader's acceptance of the world as "believable". The source of magic is one such vital ingredient.

Mark J. P. Wolf argues that:

---

[1] Kieckhefer, p. 11.

> For works in which world building occurs, there may be a wealth of details and events (or mere mentions of them) which do not advance the story but which provide background richness and verisimilitude to the imaginary world.[2]

When writing fantasy, especially where the world is steeped in magic, it is to the author's detriment to fail to understand where magic actually comes from within their secondary worlds. It does not, of course, have to be the focus of the narrative to delve into this correlation between magic source and the characters and the world, but it is something that should help to guide the motivations of the characters and the narrative. With writing *The Hobbit*, *The Lord of the Rings*, and the *Silmarillion* Tolkien appears to have been trying to reinvent a mythology-based writing of sorts, updated for a more contemporary readership; a form of mythlore. Patricia Meyer-Spacks in her essay 'Power and Meaning in Lord of the Rings' suggests that 'Tolkien is a modern myth-maker'.[3] Authors producing fantasy works post-Tolkien, on the other hand, seem to have diverged from this goal, and I think this is where we have run into an issue regarding the influence of magic within secondary worlds. Some readers even lament that magic in fantasy narratives far too closely resembles the systems of magic as found in fantasy role-playing games (such as *Dungeons and Dragons*), suggesting that in modern fantasy magic has become too pervasive and too powerful. They argue that if magic exists in such a secondary world, the author clearly makes its use overtly obvious. Magic in these secondary worlds becomes akin to a powerful, indiscriminate weapon, wielded for show and to cause as much destruction as

---

[2] Wolf, p. 2.

[3] Patricia Meyer-Spacks, 'Power and Meaning in Lord of the Rings' in *Tolkien and the Critics: Essays on J. R. R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings*, eds. Neil David Isaacs and Rose A. Zimbado (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968), p. 82.

possible (big explosions and plenty of fireballs, for example). Thus, critics argue that Tolkien's blend of myth and history and narrative, while (they argue), nothing more than simply the source for many authors' inspiration, should still instead be viewed as more of a benchmark for the representation of magic in fantasy writing.

Unfortunately, we no longer find ourselves in a world where readers understand the intention behind mythlore, or even the Faërie, and as a result, authors should be focusing on integrating magic into their narratives in a fluid manner, rather than the grandiose, almost ham-fisted manner in which magic is approached in games. Knowing where the magic comes from, therefore, can help the author understand how, and why, it is used by the characters in their narratives.

So, within these fantastic secondary worlds, where does magic actually come from? Is this something readers will always know? Or is this something that the authors keep hidden, maybe drip feeding hints? Since I have established that magic as presented to the reader needs to be convincing, coherent and consistent, it follows that the same should also apply for the presentation of the sources of magic. As I have already covered the reasons for coherency and consistency, I will not re-examine those terms for this chapter. Instead, I will delve into the sources I have found, and relate them to how the authors have represented each of them in the secondary worlds.

My research highlights that there are five key sources for magic, in both a real world anthropological sense, and in an imaginary secondary world sense. The sources of magic in fictional texts are very similar in their representation and depiction to the same sources as found throughout our real world human history. They are used, thought about, and conceived in much the same way, enough so to

suggest to me that authors — aware of how much of an influence magic has been on real human culture — choose to reflect this same level of importance in their secondary worlds.

The Faërie, while not a direct source of magic itself, is the most important feature to discuss first. This can help to establish what the difference between a magical secondary world setting, and a secondary world where magic exists. Tolkien sets the trend for magical secondary fantasy worlds with *The Lord of the Rings*, yet as I noted earlier, many authors have since diverged from his example, and draw upon other real world beliefs in magic The major sources for magic, outside of the Faërie, therefore, are as follows: God and/or Demons; The Planets; Nature; and Belief in Magic and each have some level of grounding within an historical framework. At some point in our own primary world's history these sources have been believed in by those who believed in magic. Magic that comes From Within One's Own Self is the fifth major source of magic I will outline, but this one is more commonly found in fictional texts rather than the real world.

Although it is not technically a direct source, the features of the classification of different magic sequences (as relating directly to the source of magic) is also something to consider at this stage, as it helps to determine what types of magic exist within the overall source, as well as justifications for differences between the types. In addition to the sources I will be examining, Clute provides a helpful description of magic as being 'a reservoir of power […] usually in some between-world, which can be tapped or stored by some individuals'.[4] This in itself is not a singular source for magic, as most of the major sources I have just outlined can be described as a 'reservoir'. What this quote does

---

[4] Clute, 'Magic', p. 616.

show is that magic, especially in a fantasy world, is largely seen as an energy that comes from somewhere else, be it the universe in general or even a parallel dimension, insomuch as the magical energy is stored somewhere else, and then transferred to the wizard for their own desired application.

As well as magic having its own source, objects can be imbued with magic for later use. The persistence of Talismans throughout historical culture is derived from this concept. 'A talisman is a spirit with a body… The letters of the word talisman in Arabic are "talsam" and when this combination is reversed, it becomes "maslat" which means domination, control.'[5] Books of magic, in medieval context, were consecrated by God's power and through this they contained the magic powers necessary for casting spells. '[A magic book] itself was a sacred object requiring elaborate consecration, and that its contents might lose their magical efficacy…'[6] Magical books therefore functioned as 'a repository of magical power and as a guide to magical process'.[7] In a secondary world example, Terry Pratchett tells us of the power of spell books when he states that:

> a spell is a spell even when temporarily imprisoned in parchment and ink. It has potency. This is not a problem while the book's owner still lives, but on his death the spell book becomes a source of uncontrolled power that cannot be easily defused. In short, spell books leak magic.[8]

Again, this is a fantasy author basing his fictional work on historic notions about magic.

In the Discworld, wizards must charge their staff with spells before they can use them. Once the spell is spent it is drained it must be imbued into the staff

---

[5] Al-Hakim, p. 11.
[6] Kieckhefer, p. 8.
[7] Kieckhefer, p. 13.
[8] Pratchett, *The Colour of Magic*, p. 101.

again for later use. This is a time consuming process, and advance preparation is therefore required, but it still shows the reader that magic is a storable quantity. Sanderson's *Elantris* also demonstrates magic (AonDor in this case) being stored within a physical form: 'the Aons still had their same effect regardless of whether they were drawn in the air or smelted from steel.'[9]

Despite any similarities that may exist, one type of magic is not the same as another type of magic. As pointed out in *Forbidden Rites* it was rare to 'combine the techniques of the demonic with those of natural magic'.[10] In this instance, Kieckhefer is discussing that demonic magic (power gained through demonic favour) was not also used for potion making, specifically since the magic for the potions came from the natural elements themselves (the flora, fauna, and minerals). The two magic sources are separate, despite being present at the same time. In this stead, despite not being a focus of this thesis, the different magic systems in Harry Potter's secondary world setting serves as a helpful example. The differing magic types in the Potterverse should not have been so easily interchangeable in their application, unless Rowling had a specific in-world reason for this to have been the case. A potion should not have had the same efficacy in overcoming a problem as a magic spell for the exact same problem. Different magic means different power and, consequentially, different results.

The Faërie as a Source of Magic

When *The Lord of the Rings* is set aside, and a deeper examination of Tolkien's other works is taken into consideration, there emerges a pattern for understanding the inherent magic within Tolkien's secondary world. In essence, Tolkien's 'On

---

[9] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 505.
[10] Kieckhefer, p. 75.

Fairy Stories' is the justification for the role and place of magic in *The Lord of Rings*. Here Tolkien explains why mythical stories — especially those outside of the traditional fairy story, and oriented more towards what we would, in a contemporary sense, accept as fantasy —are set within a Faërie world. He argues that writing fantasy involves setting stories in a world dictated by enchantment, 'otherness' and forces contrary, or outside those which exist within our own primary world. In reference to Faërie settings Tolkien writes:

> Fairy-stories, like myths, are the products of a potent sub-creative combination – human language and human imagination – responding to the surrounding world by recreating it in story.[11]

Where people have trouble understanding something that, to them, feels like magic, their stories will reflect this magical nature. Fairy-stories, which according to Tolkien are set in the Faërie, therefore always have a strong element of magic, or enchantment. *The Lord of the Rings* is set in a world that has magic, because it is, by nature, set in a secondary world that is itself a Faërie world.

The assumption, on Tolkien's behalf perhaps, was that readers would recognize that *The Lord of the Rings* was based in a Faërie world setting, and they would in turn accept the role of magic within this world. Elves are immortal because of their magical nature (I am debasing Tolkien's terminology a little here, as he separated enchantment and magic into two different notions, but it seems that in a more contemporary view readers would combine the two terms), the world around them is powered by its symbiotic relationship with the elves, and in turn, as the elves are their losing power, the world is dying. This dynamic underscores the manner in which magic affects the world, but it is indeed

---

[11] Tolkien, 'On Fairy Stories', p. 22.

important to note it here as background information regarding the source of magic. Further, Tolkien contends that:

> Even fairy-stories as a whole have three faces: the Mystical towards the Supernatural; the Magical towards Nature; and the Mirror of scorn and pity towards Man. The essential face of Faërie is the middle one, the Magical.[12]

Tolkien's argument here clearly places magic at the heart of Faërie-stories, and by extension, fantasy stories, and the fact that most modern authors include magic as a "matter of course", or a trope of fantasy merely reinforces this point.

Clute provides some further expansion on the nature of the Faërie world when he explains that 'Faërie was more closely associated with the Underworld where one passed after death, whether a heaven or a hell'.[13] Given that Heaven and Hell are both places of spirits, one could assume that they are also places with immense reserves of magical power of sorts. Since this power is part of the realm itself an entire world based in the Faërie (such as in *Lord of the Rings*), would, by extension, be rich with magical energies.

 Faërie is not directly a source of magic itself, yet it immediately places any world written with this setting in mind directly into a fantasy world inherently rich with magical energies. It is a structure for fantasy settings in which magic is possible, so any world based in a Faërie setting should already be assumed to contain magic, or at the very least, "enchantment". Whether the author capitalizes on the setting's magical nature comes down more to their depiction of the world and its inhabitants, rather than simply placing their story within this kind of setting. Tolkien manages to represent the Faërie and magic at the same time,

---

[12] Tolkien, 'On Fairy Stories', p. 44.
[13] John Clute, 'Faerie', in *The Encyclopedia of Fantasy*, ed. by John Clute and John Grant (London: Orbit, 1997), p. 328.

mostly because he is providing the reader, and other authors, with an example of a Faërie world and how to write stories based in this kind of setting. It is world that is already established with a rich history and its inhabitants interact with the Faërie in a manner which is subtle and not reliant on exposition to explain the setting.

Tolkien is consistent throughout the narrative in providing instances where magic works, without providing detail on where the magic was sourced. This is not a fault in any way – *The Lord of the Rings* feels like a fully realized world, and since the reader can be readily able to accept that magic really exists in this world, they do not require, in this instance, to be told where it comes from. It simply works. In *Rhetorics of Fantasy*, Farah Mendlesohn further discusses the idea that 'Tolkien's technique […] is to present the landscape as a participant in the adventure'.[14] I would expand on this by saying that in The *Lord of the Rings* the land is almost anthropomorphised to the point of being a living creature and character in its own right, and this helps to express to the reader that magic (or in this case, "enchantment") is an important feature of the world.

The link between the land and the Elves here is so strong that their symbiosis becomes evident. For example, when the Fellowship of the Ring are leaving the Lothlórien, they are presented with elven robes as gifts. Pippin asks if the garments are magic, to which the elf replies:

> They are fair garments, and the web is good, for it was made in this land.
> They are Elvish robes certainly, if that is what you mean. Leaf and branch,
> water and stone: they have the hue and beauty of all these things under the

---

[14] Mendlesohn, p. 35.

twilight of Lórien that we love; for we put the thought of all that we love into all that we make.[15]

The elven love and connection to nature comes through just from the reverence inherent in the Elf's tone, and the robe as a representation of elven culture engenders qualities of nature, emphasizing this same connection between the Elves and their environment. Although the land is represented as a part of a living culture the magical (enchantment) element is otherwise highlighted indicating that the world's magic comes from nature itself. The combination of elements and fauna, in this setting, comes about as a result of the symbiosis between the land and the Elves. As Elves lose their dominance and domain to the growing civilization of mankind, the land loses much of its enchantment and power also. This is almost enough to suggest that elven magic in *The Lord of the Rings* is sourced from nature, but that is in fact not the case; elven magic "enchantment" derived from the Faërie, and the Faëire is, in simple terms, the catalyst that allows the secondary world to sustain magical effects. There is magic within *The Lord of the Rings* that is not drawn from the Faërie, and their sources can fall into the sources I will outline next.

Magic Derived From God and/or Demons – Divine Magic

At its most simple form, this is divine power that a magician gains via the invocation of a deity's name, or power otherwise bestowed upon a person by their deity. Demons, often bound by invoking God, can also bestow power, but not necessarily as much as a deity can offer (spiritual beings, as noted earlier in the quote from the *Oxford English Dictionary*). God- or Demon-given power can be

---

[15] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 361.

seen as a pure form of magic, or corrupt when derived from demons, since it is magic that is given to an individual so that they may perform a spectacular feat:

> If [the magician] called upon celestial or manifest natural powers it was not magic, but if [they] appealed to demonic or occult natural powers [such as god] it was magic.[16]

Magic is pure insomuch as it is divine power that god has bestowed upon His faithful observer. Since demons are considered evil creatures with wicked intentions to harm and mislead, any magic solely provided by them would therefore be untrustworthy and likely insufficient for the magician's needs.

As outlined in *Forbidden Rites*, historically, a magician would draw magic circles on the ground, and then cast their spell by invoking the name of god a number of times beforehand. This ritual itself was not considered to be the source of magic, more so it was the conduit between the magician, god (or the demons), and the desired outcome of the spell being cast. Even magicians wanting power from demons would invoke god's name to 'adjure [the demon] in the name of all that is holy to come in non-threatening form' so that the demon would cause 'no harm' and could tell 'only truth'.[17] For the most part, these magicians were known as necromancers who 'perceived their art and office as sacred and saw themselves as invoking the sacred powers of heaven'.[18] Even though they were dealing with unholy demons, they still did so with god's blessing, and in His service. Today, conversely, and especially within fantasy texts, necromancers are seen as wholly evil beings who deal with raising the dead and demonic pacts, using the dark arts for selfish purposes.

---

[16] Kieckhefer, p. 15.
[17] Kieckhefer, p. 16.
[18] Kieckhefer, p. 26.

In a world that is far more secular than the Middle Ages it might be surprising that authors might still want to draw upon god-given magical powers for characters within their secondary worlds. However, when the secondary worlds are examined, gods and demons seem to be another trope of the fantasy setting, hence their inclusion does not feel out of place. The examples I have found, however, do not draw direct parallels to god-given power as outlined by Kieckhefer, but take slightly different angles on the subject.

In the fictional texts, there are powerful examples of divine magic within both *Elantris* and the Warhammer World. The AonDor, in texts written after *Elantris*, is implied to be a source of magic derived from the essence of a goddess that is trying to force its way into the world. She can be presumed to be a dead goddess called Aona, who once possessed one of the Shards of Adonalsium, or the pieces of the power of creation itself. In *The Way of Kings* two epigraphs outline Aona's fate:

> One need only look at the aftermath of his brief visit to Sel to see proof of what I say […] In case you have turned a blind eye to that disaster, know that Aona and Skai are both dead, and that which they held has been Splintered.[19]

The essence of the Shard can be used as a source of magic; AonDor in this case being that source. In Sanderson's *The Hero of Ages* another epigraph indicates the ability for the Shards to be used as a magic source:

> each power has three aspects: a physical one, which can be seen in the creations made by Ruin and Preservation; a spiritual one in the unseen

---

[19] Brandon Sanderson, *The Way of Kings*, (New York: Tom Doherty Associates, LLC, 2010), p. 323 and p. 312.

energy that permeates all of the world; and a cognitive one in the minds that controlled the energy.[20]

In the case of AonDor, that energy is the spiritual one. As Sanderson explains in *Elantris*, the magic acts 'as if a river of light were trying to force its way through the small crack' and the 'Dor is the unseen power – it is in everything, but cannot be touched'.[21]

Describing AonDor as a force that is in everything highlights that link to the spiritual aspect, and thus as a magic source derived from a god. It is a force, unlike in our primary world (where divine power is asked for), which dictates its usage, rather than simply facilitating it. It is a power that constantly wants to be released upon the world, as opposed to a power that a human specifically asks for. Drawing on its power can be equated to beseeching a god for magic, since the power comes directly from this god, though it is far more eager to manifest itself in the world than magic derived from most other gods. The need for AonDor to be released into the world reflects Raoden's urge to uncover its secrets, therefore driving the narrative forward in a mystery-solving direction.

Following his research, Raoden finds out exactly how to access and manipulate magic within the world of Sel. This process effectively follows the primary world's act of drawing magic circles to invoke the goddess which in turn will tap into the pool of AonDor. As with magic circles the ritual has to be precisely enacted and only then will the magic work. Depending on the Aon drawn, this will then result in different effects, the Aon Ehe will produce fire, for example, and altering the length of certain lines within the Aon will conjure anything from a small flame, to a pillar of fire, or even an exploding fireball.

---

[20] Brandon Sanderson, *The Hero of Ages* (London: Victor Gollancz LTD, 2010), p. 507.
[21] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 266 and p. 276.

Sanderson also presents the reader with the symbiotic relationship between magic and nature – neither will function correctly without the other, nor will they function correctly where one of them is damaged. In these instances magic is almost regarded as coming from Nature as its source. In this fantasy setting, therefore, the divine power is strongly linked to the land and nature as the means for accessing the power, and this power initially comes from another realm, much like Clute and Grant's 'reservoir' of power.

Magic, known as the Winds of Magic, in the Warhammer World is a force with great destructive power. It is the raw essence of Chaos and is derived from a place known as the Realm of Chaos – a sort of parallel dimension where daemons are created and thrive in great number. The Gods of Chaos live within this Realm, essentially both born of the energy and responsible for it, and they grant magical powers to their followers and disciples. This magic also flows across the Warhammer World by means of a great portal known as the Chaos Gate, located at the northern pole of the world. This gate was created (roughly 8500 years before the setting's current time) by a race called the Old Ones – beings who came to the Warhammer World via starships. 'Then came the Old Ones, a mysterious and near-omnipotent race who plied the depths of space in silvered ships and star-spheres just as men would one day ply the oceans'.[22] The Chaos Gate was made so that they could safely land on the planet. 'The Old Ones also created portals that allowed them to travel vast distances and move at will from this realm to the next. They knew not that, with these acts, they were cultivating their own demise.'[23] This ties in strongly with Clute's suggestion that magic can be a sort of reservoir of energy from some between-world, a sort of parallel dimension known

---

[22] Ward, p. 158.
[23] Ward, p. 158.

as The Realm of Chaos, in this way becoming both a natural phenomenon, as well as a deity-derived energy. This magic comes through to the Warhammer World in a manner aligned to god- or demon-sourced magic, especially since the worshippers of Chaos beseech their chosen god of Chaos for magical influence and power, a power which naturally saturates the universe from the Realm of Chaos. This is the ultimate source of magic for the Warhammer World, and the Chaos Gods themselves are responsible for its power.

Over time, the Old Ones also saw to the evolution of a primitive race native to the Warhammer World, a race that would later grow to become the High Elves. These elves' ancestors were highly adept at learning magic and when the Old Ones were no more (no one knows if they died, or simply left the world entirely) they continued to practice and perfect the art. 'Of all the races introduced to the world, the Elves had the greatest affinity for the primal energy known as Magic'.[24]

The Winds of Magic themselves are a dangerous power to manipulate, as Rick Priestly explains in the *Warhammer: Rulebook*:

> All magic comes from the alternate dimension that sorcerers call Chaos. Its natural inhabitants are daemons - creatures made of pure magic - and its greatest powers are the mighty gods of Chaos. These are immeasurably potent entities given life and form by the nightmares, subconscious terrors and insane ambitions of mortal creatures. In places where the fabric of the universe is weak raw magic leaks into the Warhammer World. Some mortals seek to bind and control this force, believing that they can use magic to gain wealth, power and prestige. Such individuals are either very

---

[24] Ward, p. 200.

wise or utter fools, earnest scholars or dabblers in things that are better left

untouched.[25]

In one sense, the magical prowess of the Elves comes as a direct evolutionary path

that the Old Ones helped initiate, essentially another form of god-given magical

ability. Additionally, all wizards within the Warhammer World are born with the

ability to manipulate the Winds of Magic in order to cast spells. If you are born

without this ability, you can never become a wizard.

Magic Derived From The Planets – Celestial Magic

This magic can be defined as Astrology and celestial magic that utilize the

constellations, positions of the planets relative to each other, and the divine

celestial sphere. The magic draws upon the energies stored within the shape and

position of these astrological bodies, thus powering the wizard's spell, ritual, or

incantation. As explained in *Picatrix*:

> the science of magic deals with knowing the positions of fixed planets, the
>
> location of their pictures, the manner by which they cast their light on the
>
> orbiting planets and the astrological ratios.[26]

Further, man is considered to be linked to the celestial in so much as 'his head

resembles the celestial sphere', an important note as the celestial sphere is said to

be the perfect representation of magic, because 'this perfect shape is the circle'.[27]

Talismans were made in the shape of circles in order to capture this power, and

the 'maker of the talisman must [have been] knowledgeable of the astrological

ratios and formulas' in order for the talisman to work.[28] Centuries after *Picatrix*

---

[25] Rick Priestly, *Warhammer: Rulebook* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 1996), p. 92.
[26] Al-Hakim, p. 12.
[27] Al-Hakim, p. 51 and p. 15.
[28] Al-Hakim, p. 19.

was written, magicians in the Middle Ages were still drawing magic circles as a key element of their spell casting procedures, despite their goal of invoking the name of god, rather than celestial magic:

> The magician is in every case expected to use images [such as magic circles, or talismans], not so much aids to sympathetic magic, but as channels of astrological power; the astrological conditions for use of these images are thus of paramount importance.[29]

It was of utmost importance that magicians knew when to cast spells associated with certain astrological signs for the desired efficacy. For example, a spell associated with the constellation of Pisces would need to be cast when the constellation was in the correct place in the night sky, otherwise, it was said, the spell would not work at all.

Terry Pratchett's Discworld with its series of sources — Intrinsic Magic, Residual Magic, and Induced Magic, as well as a distinction between Wizards' magic and Witches' magic — presents the reader with another source of celestial magic.[30] In Discworld, celestial magic is otherwise known as Intrinsic magic. While Residual magic has an inconsequential likeness to celestial magic, it has far more in common with magic that comes from within an individual. The power to generate magic from the point of Residual magic does come from the universe at large, but Intrinsic magic is a magic that simply exists as magic in a raw form; it is 'the magic that derives from the very nature of the Discworld universe itself'.[31] It is said to have 'a certain similarity to some of the matters discussed in quantum physics' and that it is 'responsible for the slowing down of light but at the same

---

[29] Keickhefer, p. 70.
[30] Pratchett and Briggs, pp. 270-277.
[31] Pratchett and Briggs, p. 270.

time makes it impossible to see light coming'.[32] The raw magic is the background energy that makes up the universe and therefore the planets within that universe, not by way of interacting with constellations, but through being the energy that allows the constellations to even exist. The Discworld universe has magic, because it has always had magic. Without this magic, the Discworld itself would cease to be.

Nature Magic

Nature magic is not the same as celestial magic, though there are some similarities. Nature magic is something that is part of the world at large, and that can be accessed and manipulated by anyone with applicable knowledge. Nature magic is primarily induced through the combining of elements, flora, and fauna to create potions and poisons. Nature magic can also provide power via natural influences. In medieval times, women were apparently more likely to have been practitioners of nature magic, as it seems that 'women's natural magic was being interpreted as if it were similar to the demonic magic more often practiced by clerics and at times by other men', hence the association with woman magicians and the title of witch.[33]

Witches are still a common feature in fantasy texts and are generally considered evil; likely due in part to the incorrect association with the demonic. There can also be links between fictional representations of nature magic and concerns about environmentalism, especially where Nature Magic is used by characters or races that have strong connections to nature. Fictional magic systems that include nature magic still focus on the combination of elements to create

---

[32] Pratchett and Briggs, p. 270.
[33] Kieckhefer, p. 82.

something else, such as the stereotypical "eye of newt and leg of frog" kind of witch's brew. Of course, between authors, this may differ, and the magic might actually be something directly related to the land or nature itself, almost like celestial magic.

Initially, Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* appears to be, as Sanderson would call it, a Soft Magic system where magic is unexplained. The world itself clearly does has magic, however: Gandalf, for example, displays its existence when he uses it, and the One Ring and all the other rings of power clearly have some sort of magic interwoven into their construction. Within the construct of the story itself no explanation is given to the reader for where magic comes from. Gandalf casts his spells when they are needed (as indicated in Chapter 1) when he interacts with Wormtongue, rings of power are mentioned, but there is little specific detail about the power (for example: '[Fëanor] wrought the Three Jewels, the Silmarilli, and filled them with radiance of the Two Trees, Telperio and Lauelin'), Gandalf is said to have 'many powers of mind and hand', and Sauron's powers 'bewitched the King' and enabled him to become 'master of counsel'.[34] Yet these descriptions explain nothing of how the wizards actually wield power, nor where the power came from. Rather than being a Soft Magic system, I would argue that, in my own terms, *The Lord of the Rings* is a world with High Magic Saturation; it is everywhere and in almost all things. Nature, elves, and wizards all have a strong background of magic to them, and even men and hobbits are said to either know certain spells, or at least know about magic in general.

Sanderson's *Elantris*, presents magic that is tied to the world, at least to a specific geographic location, and therefore also falls into a similar category to *The*

---

[34] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 1009, p. 1059 and pp. 1012-13.

Lord of the Rings. The readers are, however, told outright about this relationship during the story, so they understand that magic is an inherent feature of this world. As they progress through the narrative's overall storyline the readers, along with the characters, learn more about how this magic is accessed and how it relates to the geographic location. This is established in various lines in *Elantris* about the nature of spellcasting, specifically the comments that: 'to begin every Aon you draw a picture of Arelon'; 'the Aons were maps of the land'; and that 'the city was an enormous Aon'.[35] The combination of geography and the drawing of magical symbols therefore invokes the magical properties of nature itself, providing the key element for accessing magic. The energies within the main source might be god-derived, though in this instance, a specific connection to geography is needed in order to first access it. Although it is not clear within *Elantris* whether the magic cast by people of other geographic locations accesses the same source, or reservoir, of energy, it is apparent that only people from those specific locations can use those magics. The Jindonese ChayShan and the Derethi Monks are both examples from outside of Arelon, leading Raoden to 'suspect that there was more than one way to access the Dor', the significance is that their ability and methods for accessing magic comes first from their geographic heritage, and second from whatever the reservoir of energy may be.[36]

In the Warhammer World, although magic is ultimately derived from a celestial source and the Realm of Chaos, there are also physical manifestations of magic in this setting. Warpstone, also called Wyrdstone, is said to be the raw stuff of Chaos condensed into solid rock form. 'A peculiar quality of this occult energy is that like attracts like, and places of anguish and death eventually accrue so

---

[35] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 489, p. 504 and p. 592.
[36] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 611.

much Dark Magic that it crystallises into the evil greenish-black crystal known as warpstone'.[37] This dangerous rock is full of magic and can be used for many purposes. 'If such tales are to be believed the sick were cured, the blind could be made to see, tall trees would grow from the ground in a single day, and the very dead could be raised and made to speak again. Most telling of all was the successful transmutation of lead to gold'[38] Those in close proximity to it can be mutated and those who consume it can further their own magical prowess.

Skaven Grey Seers and Warlocks tend to be the only ones foolhardy enough to consume it as, other than risk of mutation, the side effect is instant death. Skaven also make use of Warpstone for more nefarious purposes: 'Clan Moulder […] uses the mutating effects of Warpstone to create and breed an array of horrific fighting beasts'.[39] Nature, therefore, is one of the more potent sources of magic in the Warhammer World as Warpstone can found as a form of mineral in natural deposits, or in the detritus left behind by meteors, and can in turn be combined with flora and fauna in order to produce magical effects, most notably with Skaven Warlock Engineers utilizing Warpstone for the express purpose of creating genetic mutations.

To a much lesser degree, the Discworld also includes a form of nature magic known as Elemental Magical Force, or the Old Magic. Significantly, this magic reflects elements of real-world magic, as well as the Faërie. It is mentioned in *The Colour of Magic* where a group of 'fifty or so of the [dryads] formed a tight cluster, joined hands and walked backwards until they formed the circumference of a large circle'.[40] This generates a field of raw magic which then

[37] Ward, p. 247.
[38] Tuomas Pirinen, *Mordheim* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 1999), p. 9.
[39] Alessio Cavatore, *Warhammer Armies: Skaven* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 2002), p. 7.
[40] Pratchett, *The Colour of Magic*, p. 92.

culminates in the appearance of a shaft of octarine. The formation of the circle once again ties in with the historical influence of magic circles, although through the element of nature rather than the celestial.

Belief in Magic

In worlds where magic exists, or even where magic is merely thought to be possible, simply believing in something with enough conviction can result in magical effects. Often, these effects are brought about as a result of the power of suggestion and self-assuredness, for example, convincing someone that they are going to be affected by magic can cause said affect to come to pass. The *Picatrix* describes that one's belief in magic will bring about magical outcomes by stating that 'there should be preparedness and readiness for acceptance, acceptance must already be there [and then] the sought action will exist and emerge'.[41] If you accept that belief will result in a magical effect, you will in turn receive the desired outcome. While our primary world is increasingly promoting autonomy and greater power of self, this kind of magic could have two different outcomes. First, you might not believe in magical effects at all or that someone else can wield power over you using magic. Second, you might strongly believe that your magical power is stronger than someone else's. In either case, the power of belief, especially in one's self is an appealing focus for authors to explore, and the way in which this belief can manifest in magical effects may vary between authors, but the intent is much the same: strong belief results in strong magical effect.

The Discworld's Induced Magic is the perfect representation of the belief in magic as it is in short 'the magic potential created in an object, or even a living

---

[41] Al-Hakim, p. 28.

creature, by usage and belief'.[42] The power of belief, if strong enough, will create

a magical effect that in turn makes the belief a reality. As exemplified in Chapter

1, in Pratchett's *Moving Pictures*, people go to watch the films (a brand new

technology on the world) and collectively start believing that these films will

bring monsters to threaten the world. This is not a story of a self-fulfilling

prophecy, rather this is mass-hysteria brought into physical manifestation via

belief-fuelled magic. The more people that believe in an outcome, the stronger the

magical energies that force that outcome into being.

Of the Orcs and Goblins of the Warhammer World, Savage Orc Shamans

are known to adorn their kin with protective magical tattoos which are a blend of

both magic and superstition. The tattoos themselves are not magical, but it is the

Savage Orcs' determination of will that imbues the tattoos with power. In effect,

these tattoos protect the Savage Orcs because they believe that the tattoos will

protect them:

> In battle they believe so strongly in the power of the Orc gods Gork and
>
> Mork to protect them that enemy arrows and swords blows really can be
>
> deflected by the Orcs' aura of self-generated arcane power. It is also
>
> possible that the tribal tattoos which Savage Orc Shamans paint onto the
>
> Orcs' bodies protect them in some way. This is a very mysterious and
>
> wondrous thing, and confirms the Savage Orcs' strong belief in their old
>
> and trusty ways. [43]

The Savage Orcs believe so strongly in the power of their tattoos that this in turn,

in the same vein as with belief in the Discworld, becomes a form of magic.

---

[42] Pratchett and Briggs, p. 227.
[43] Rick Priestly, p. 67.

This belief in magic is in addition to the magic that already exists in both the Discworld and The Warhammer World, yet it is an entirely unique and separate form of magic. It does not tap into any of the sources of magic (such as Clute's "reservoir" of magic), but it generates its own magical effects due to the strength of conviction from the believers. Belief in magic (particularly in the Discworld and The Warhammer World) therefore takes the form of someone (or many people) putting their faith in something (or someone) outside of themselves and therefore imbuing that person (or thing) with power. Where it is directed towards oneself, it becomes something of a confidence or ego boost that contributes to generating further strength.

This belief strongly resembles the belief in magic that existed in our own primary world, where people had a 'realistic awareness [it] was being practiced, and an almost universally shared conviction that it could work'.[44] When a sizeable proportion of medieval Europe believed in magic, magicians therefore felt bolstered that their efforts were producing a real effect, and people would believe that they were, in turn, being affected by magic. Oftentimes, the incantations for a spell, especially a psychological-based one, would instruct the magician to threaten or warn their intended victim that they were going to be cursed, or otherwise magically influenced. If the victim later fell foul of some misfortune that seemed to be linked to the spell that was cast on them, this would further bolster the belief that magic was real.

---

[44] Kieckhefer, p. 10.

Self-Generated Magic

The magic literally comes from within the person, be they a direct producer of magic, or simply born with innate powers. The cliché "power corrupts" is apt for this particular source of magic, as one who generates magic themselves can, if not controlled properly, ends up being dangerous to those around them. The person themselves is the reservoir of energy where magic comes from, which presents authors with an interesting character to deal with. They could be anything from a slave whose power is harnessed by others, to a madman who thinks they control the world. This particular source of magic seems to be native to fiction, and not based on precedent from the primary world.

As outlined in Chapter 1, the Discworld has a form of wizard known as a Sourcerer; the eighth son of the eighth son of the eighth son of who is 'a wizard squared. A source of magic. A sourcerer'.[45] In *Sourcery* this particular wizard is Coin, a young man who can create raw magic himself without needing to tap into the Intrinsic or Induced magic that saturate the Discworld and its universe. Rather, Coin makes use of Residual Magic, which is effectively magic that can be created from nothing. Pratchett states that a Sourcerer can 'create and destroy by a mere thought' using Residual Magic.[46] In the same manner as wizards call forth the power for casting spells, sourcerers simply wish for, of think of a particular magical outcome, and then it comes into being, through him rather than an outside source of magic. When Coin is approaching the Unseen University, there is a build-up of sourcery energies, which the Wizards are able to tap into at will, drawing on this rather than directly casting spells: 'Carding waggled his fingers,

---

[45] Pratchett, *Sourcery*, p. 1.
[46] Pratchett and Briggs, p. 271.

and grasped the tall cool glass that appeared in mid-air'.[47] Magic also simply radiates from him, almost like a self perpetuating source of energy, he does not even have to concentrate on it happening: 'Where his feet touched the cobbles blue sparks crackled and evaporated the early evening dew'.[48]

Coin confronts the Wizards of the Unseen University and uses his magic to assert his dominance over them. The issue, however, is that because he has never received any real training, outside of the misguided teachings from his father (who has bound himself to Coin's wizard staff to avoid Death), and as a result he has little control over the repercussions of his magical powers, nor the dangers he is invoking. He even wishes to challenge the gods themselves with his powers, asking:

> "Are we not more powerful than the gods, then?" said Coin.
>
> Some of the wizards at the back of the crowd began to shuffle their feet.
>
> "Well. Yes and no," said Hakardly, up to his knees in it now.
>
> The truth was that wizards tended to be somewhat nervous about the gods. The beings who dwelt on Cori Celesti had never made their feelings plain on the subject of ceremonial magic, which after all had a certain godness about it, and wizards tended to avoid the whole subject. The trouble with gods was that
>
> if they didn't like something they didn't just drop hints, so common sense suggested that it was unwise to put the gods in a position where they had to decide.[49]

Coin's sourcery heightened powers and therefore his compromised ego are a danger to the entire Discworld.

---

[47] Pratchett, *Sourcery*, p. 108.
[48] Pratchett, *Sourcery*, p. 21.
[49] Pratchett, *Sourcery*, p. 273.

Because he can make literally anything he can think of, his magical power is extremely dangerous and has, by this point, gone to his head, making him believe that he is dominant and that everything bends to his will. Prior to his outburst against the gods he even states that:

"We can fear nothing," he said, and it sounded more like a command.

"What of these Dungeon Dimensions? If they should trouble us, away with them! A true wizard will fear nothing! Nothing!".[50]

When it finally dawns on him that the creatures from the Dungeon Dimensions are far more dangerous and powerful than he is, and that they latch onto and draw further strength from Coin's magical ability, then he acquiesces and is subsequently saved by Rincewind, the most inept wizard in the Discworld.

Orcs and Goblins of the Warhammer World generate magic themselves. This energy is known as Waaaagh! magic, and is a build-up of collective excitement from the green-skinned creatures themselves. When fighting in combat, the greenskins give off a raw power that surrounds them. When they generate their Waaagh! Energies, they cannot utilize its potential for themselves; it has to be siphoned off through a Shaman so that it does not result in a negative backlash of magical destruction for the Orcs and Goblins who generated the energy. Furthermore, these Shamans are only capable of drawing on this Waaaagh! energy in creating and casting their spells. In essence, this is nothing more than channelling the raw energy through their bodies and releasing it in various destructive ways. This is not without danger, as a Shaman who draws in too much power too quickly, or doesn't release it quick enough, will explode in the most grisly way imaginable. Night Goblin Shamans are also adepts in

---

[50] Pratchett, *Sourcery*, p. 272.

consuming a variety of fungus dubbed "Magic Mushrooms" that give them even more potent powers (in much the same way as consuming warpstone). The greenskins themselves generate their magic, despite the world being filled with its own source, and Orcs and Goblins are therefore an example of two sources of magic; belief in magic, and one's self as a source.

Sequences of Magical Classification

Clute makes a distinction about magic that observes that, from the source of magic, there follows a sequence or spectrum of classification. For example, magic can be broken down into the sequence of 'white magic, green magic, grey magic, black magic / or benevolent, neutral, evil sequence'.[51] Despite the terms betraying a certain moral leaning for spell-types, it is a common feature of historical discussions on magic to stress that magic itself does not have a moral leaning, rather it is the intention of the magician that defines the morality. For instance, magic might allow a magician to influence another person but the act of attempting to 'manipulate another person's mind or will is a hostile act'.[52] Willy Hartner in his 'Notes on Picatrix' points out details about the morality of magic, deeming it 'thoroughly amoral, in the sense of making no distinction between good and evil', once again leaving morality to be defined by the magician's intent.[53]

Magic flows across the Warhammer World in eight distinct spectrums, and also as a raw force. Human wizards can utilise this magic, but not in its raw form – only High Elves and the forces of Chaos can do so without destruction or corruption. In fact, Clute provides us with a further link here, stating that 'elves

---

[51] Clute, 'Magic', pp. 616-617.
[52] Kieckhefer, p. 76.
[53] Willy Hartner, 'Notes On Picatrix' in *Isis*, 56.4 (1965), 441.

use magic either not on these two scales, or as it were, into the infrared and ultraviolet'.[54]

> The Elves teach that the eight Lores of Magic are but a fragmented version of the high powers wielded by their mages. Confronted by the raw power of Chaos, human minds are apt to crack and shatter, leaving even the stoutest of men naught but a gibbering husk. To guard against this, the Orders of Magic look upon just one face or aspect of magic, and channel all their understanding through this. [55]

Humans, therefore, only specialise in a single Colour of Magic, and there are eight schools of magic (commonly referred to as the Colleges of Magic) in the human Empire devoted each to teaching a different Colour. The different colours of magic are: The Lore of Fire, The Lore of Beasts, The Lore of Metal, The Lore of Light, The Lore of Life, The Lore of Heavens, The Lore of Shadow, and The Lore of Death.[56]

> There are also other distinct forms of magic, such as Ice Magic, Necromancy, and Dark Magic. These are either magics natural to a specific location, or race – Ice Magic for example is only practiced by the Tzarinas of the Warhammer World's equivalent of Russia, a place called Kislev. Dark Magic is a sort of concentration of raw magic:

> Gales of magical force spew from the ruined gateway of the far north, and most of these divide into the eight Winds of Magic as they gust and disperse across the globe. These are the etheric forces channelled and wielded as spells by the Battle Wizards of the Empire. Some of these forces, however, remain as Dark Magic, pooling and eddying in places of

---

[54] John Clute, 'Magic', pp. 616-617.
[55] Pramas, p. 141.
[56] Ward, p. 491.

great emotional disturbance. The greatest concentration of Dark Magic

gathers at mass graves, battlefields and plague-ridden settlements. Even

murder houses and abattoirs attract reservoirs of this invisible force,

causing all manner of freakish disturbances and hauntings to manifest in

the middle of the night.[57]

The distinction between Dark Magic and the other forms of magic reflects

early modern Europe's view on witchcraft. Stuart Clark in *Thinking With Demons*

explains how this works:

> The difference between "light" magic and "dark" magic, or as also known,
>
> by encyclopaedist Johann Heinrich Alsted "philosophical magic" and
>
> "diabolical magic", was that the former was based on piety, and the latter
>
> was "worked by the same physical means but irreligiously and
>
> wickedly".[58]

Even though the magic energies come from the same direct source, in this case the

Realm of Chaos, the wizard's own intended usage of the magic can determine its

inherent morality. The Lores of Life and Death are not, in themselves wicked or

good, but their applications can imply the intentions of the wizard.

The determination of where magic itself comes from therefore presents the

author with so many options for their characters and worlds to interact with,

enriching the entire story, building the secondary world, and producing much

more rounded characters and goals. The sheer fact that our own real world history

revolves around so many stories about, and belief in, magic implies that magic in

fantasy worlds should be something of equal, or greater significance to its

reception in our own real world. If people in a fantasy world where magic really

[57] Ward, p. 247.

[58] Stuart Clark, *Thinking With Demons: The Idea of Witchcraft in Early Modern Europe* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), p. 234.

exists do not have an understanding of how that magic works, nor where it comes from, then this is likely a reflection of the author's own lack of knowledge in this field.

Each of the secondary worlds I have selected for research are fine examples of how the wider understanding of the source(s) of magic within that world further expand the possibilities for future storytelling opportunities, and enrich the readers' experience at the same time.

The Warhammer World and the game surrounding it almost feed off of each other regarding the magic system. The rules themselves are written for game-play purposes, and are fairly rigid in their presentation; mostly formulaic and structured (requiring dice rolls to determine effects for example, and only allowing for certain effects to occur within the ruleset), but the stories around the world itself expand on what magic actually does and presents it in far more of a fluid manner. For example, in the Warhammer 6th Edition *Orcs and Goblins* Armybook there is a short story where a shaman casts a spell, with the description: 'As they closed the last few paces, bolts of green energy lanced towards the humies, charring those they touched'.[59] In the Warhammer 7th Edition Orcs and Goblins Armybook, there is a listing for the spells, with their in-game rules, with the following description for the spell 'Gaze of Mork': 'Mork (or possibly Gork) gives the Shaman the ability to project beams of coruscating energy from his eyes'.[60] The accompanying rules themselves state that the player 'extend a straight line, 4D6" in length, within the Shaman's forward arc and directly away from his base. Any model whose base falls under the line suffers

---

[59] Rick Priestly and Jake Thornton, *Warhammer Orcs & Goblins* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 2000), p. 79.
[60] Jeremy Vetock, *Warhammer Orcs & Goblins* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 2010), p. 72.

Strength 4 hit'.[61] The game rules are directly represented in the depiction within the short story, but without the formulaic presentation as found in the rules themselves. This expands on the magic system by showing players and readers what the spells are and what kind of threat level they pose.

Characters in the Warhammer World, while important "historical" figures, are not always the driving force of the narrative. The overall feel of the story, and the bigger picture is generally the focus, and the stories (especially the short stories) usually depict mass combat in more of an action scene manner. Where magic spells are utilized in these stories, their description makes it easy for readers to immediately understand the spell, and its associated abilities, based on the rules behind those spells.

Sourcery builds a strong understanding of magic, and its overall importance to the world and narrative, and then blocks the main character from using it to prove to the reader how, in the end, the characters are the most important focus of the narrative. The Discworld in general also focuses heavily on characters and their role in driving narratives, but there is often a strong element of magic behind their actions or motivations. Granny Weatherwax's self-belief (itself a form of magical energy) keeps her alive in dangerous situations. Rincewind has a living, breathing suitcase (The Luggage) made from Sapient Pearwood; a highly magical material that saves his life in numerous situations. While it does not drive the narrative as such, magic is otherwise very important to its strength and structure.

Elantris builds upon the magic system in the world, making it something both easily understandable for the reader, and something "real" for the secondary

---

[61] Vetock, p. 72.

world setting itself. Once Raoden has learned how to utilise magic, the narrative refocuses on the resolution of the overarching plot (the invasion of Arelon), and then rounds off the story by further building the characters of Raoden and Sarene. Magic serves its purpose in bringing the characters to their roles in concluding the narrative.

The Lord of the Rings, of course, is driven by the importance of character throughout, and has magic as more of the backdrop for the setting, albeit an extremely important backdrop. Magic plays its role in all of these narratives, alongside characters, and strengthens, rather than 'simplifies' the story; especially where it is explained along the way. The nature of magic versus enchantment as defined by Tolkien may no longer remain in the readers' psyche, but magic overall is still an integral feature of fantasy worlds, and needs to be treated just as importantly as the characters in the narrative.

The author's selection of the source for each type of magic that exists within his secondary world therefore determines so many other features of that world. Cultures, individual characters' motivations, even the influence of and interaction with other sources of magic all help to build a more comprehensive, and if done correctly, coherent secondary world.

With the intention of building such a comprehensive secondary world for my own fiction, the Warhammer World has been a key influence on my own writing when it comes to certain elements of defining magic within my secondary world of Epykrosia. 'The Pyromancer', included earlier, is set within this world, and is in fact an extract from a larger work currently (at the time of writing this thesis) in production. The key elements of the Warhammer World's "Colleges of Magic", and by extension Frazer's "Laws of Magic", and Clute's "scales of

magic" have been influential in providing me with a template of various successful ways of categorising differing streams of magic. The following piece, *Thauramancy*, not only outlines these streams, but also explains where magic comes from. Set in the same world as 'The Pyromancer', this stand-alone work also provides the reason for why magic can be dangerous to use. *Thauramancy* does not, however, link the secondary world's magic to magical traditions in our primary world, as it shares almost no links with these rituals, although it does outline the secondary world's categories of magic.

While 'The Pyromancer' is an excerpt from a longer piece of fiction, *Thauramancy* deliberately describes the source of magic in a manner similar to that of "source material" texts. It does not seek to provide an ideal explanation on the sources of magic within the narrative of an actual story, but rather belongs to the encyclopaedic or other world building material external to the storytelling structure and so popular with fantasy writers. The intentional misuse of exposition highlights how intimately the author can understand the sources of magic and its interaction with all manner of aspects of the secondary world, thus building a more fully realized fantasy setting.

Creative Interlude 2

Thauramancy: A Treatise on the Rites of Magic

Any fool with no understanding of the world can tell an aspiring Thauramancer (Wizard, Mage, Magician if you're unfamiliar with the term) that "The magic comes from in you". To the uneducated couth this notion would seem to grant them some sort of empowerment. But this is a dangerous, and deathly, incorrect assumption. I aim with this tome to inform you, the aspiring Thauramancer, where magic actually comes from, how to access its raw energy, the rites through which you may attune your soulspark and more beyond.

A dire warning is necessitated herein, as none who dabble with magic should take it lightly. Every time you draw upon the natural reserves of power you risk your very life. Even the smallest of rites can blast your soul asunder. If, that is, you do not understand how to control it. For the strongest of Thauramancers, the weakest of rites can still destroy him, just as a pin, if applied to the weakest of spots can still slay a warrior. Do not despair, for though the danger is real, the rites I will outline here will later see that you are protected. It is up to you to ensure that you invoke them correctly, thus mitigating much of the danger. I simply   insist on forewarning you.

Magic, in all forms, comes directly from Thaura, the Realm of Magic. Hence the title "Thauramancer". In its raw form it is invisible to the eye. But Thauramancers can train themselves to see the various 'streams' of magic, as we

call them. Some are born with the sight, or develop it over time, but almost anyone can deduce for themselves the skills required for Thauramancy. The source for magic itself cascades throughout all of Thaura and we call this the 'Sea of Raw Magic'. As we all well know, it is where our soulsparks come from, and where they return upon our deaths. Because of this essential tie, this is the reason all magic risks destroying a soul. When we draw from the streams, we must expose our soul to its original source. Like a magnet to an iron sword, the soul will be seduced home. Through rites and incantations Thauramancers can steel themselves against losing their soul – the mental exercises are meant to bind it to your body. Therefore, you must never consider that the spoken spell words are creating a magic, nay you must remember that these words are focusing your mind and soulspark. Each spell attunes you to manipulate the streams of magic differently, and every variation of manipulation means a different method for your soul to escape. Do NOT forget this. A flippant casting of a spell could end you, and potentially also those in your immediate vicinity.

The Sea of Raw Magic powers Thaura and in turn in leaks out into all the other Realms. There is a stream of Magic for each of the other ten Realms of Epykrosia:

- Red Magic (often, basely, referred to as Fire Magic) flows through the Realm of Fire.

- Chronomancy fuels the Realm of Time.

- White Magic powers the Realm of Harmony.

- Dark Magic is shadows the Realm of Discord.

- Chaos Magic ravages its way through the Nightmare Realm.

- Sensory Magic finds sanctuary within the Realm of Knowledge.

- Amber Magic sustains the Realm of Earth.

- Magokinesis blows strong throughout the Realm of Air.

- Aquamancy bubbles forth into the Realm of Water.

- Biomancy helps to shape the forms of things within the Dream Realm.

Do not, however, assume that the Realms only posses their corresponding stream of magic. Each Realm is affected by all ten streams, but as I note in the list above, each Realm is dominated and sustained by one in particular. I should note here too that though these are the official streams, there are many smaller tributaries and it is also possible for skilled Thauramancers to blend magics together, though most Thauramancers only ever learn how to manipulate one, perhaps two streams of magic. Some of the lesser streams include Harmonics (for the most part this is most commonly bound to musical instruments), Linguomancy (some spell books may use Linguomancy to contain the power of a spell on its pages, thusly making it easier for a reader to cast), Oneiromancy (a rather specialised magic, as it only focuses on Divination within Dreams), and others.

Some blendings include Necromancy (a debased form of Biomancy, intermixed with Dark Magic) and its lesser form of Voodoo (which also mingles Amber Magic), Alchemy (a form of blending Amber Magic with Chronomancy), and Empathics (which is a very weak mix of Sensory Magic and Biomancy). Last, within both the Dream Realm and Nightmare Realm there are forms of natural Dream Magic. These streams occur only within these two realms and are a

uniquely strong current of Biomancy and Sensory Magics. Don't trifle yourself with learning how to utilise them, however, as they are only used by the Dreamweavers in shaping Dream States.

The streams pass through all of the Realms via the Gateways – rifts between the barriers that keep the Realms from forcing themselves onto each other. Any inter-realmic geographer can tell you that all the Realms are largely geographically identical to each other. This is a side effect of Thaura, because the Realms all exist in the same space, albeit on their own planes of existence – eleven worlds all directly on top of each other. The Sea of Raw Magic exerts a bubble of sorts, called the Ether, surrounding each Realm, keeping them in place, but divided. Outside of these bubbles you will find what is known as Warpfire – a roiling space of magic flame, eternally burning and helping to keep the Realms separate. The Gateways traverse this Warpfire, allowing the streams of magic to flow everywhere. Where a Gateway exists, there will be very small rifts, barely open enough for a pin to pass into. Yet this is sufficient for magic to surge through.

In times gone past, the Gatekeepers could safely open these wide enough to allow travel between Realms. Sadly, their race is all but dead, though there are Thauramancers who know the secret rites. There are also Steamworkers in the Realm of Knowledge who are dabbling in mechanical means for opening the Gateways. Stepping through one side of a Gateway will lead you, via a very brief, almost split second diversion through the Warpfire, directly to the Realm from which the originating stream came from. You will emerge in exactly the same location from where you left. Each Gateway only, therefore, links two Realms together. The Library of Alzandria is one of the few locations where you can find

Gateways leading to multiple Realms. In the heart of the library you will find the Hall of Portals - the convergence site of five different streams of magic, which allows travel between different Realms (Air, Earth, Knowledge, Time and Harmony). One can venture from Realm to Realm via any Hall of Portals Gateway, without ever needing to return to their home Realm in the process.

And that, reader, is a brief summary of the source of our Magic. The libraries in the steed of the Chronariads can give greater insight into the wheres and hows – more specifics and histories if you so please, but for the purposes of this manual I feel that I have provided you with a sufficient grounding. Although, I'm sure you probably already knew much of this anyway. Now that you know where magic comes from, the remaining chapters of this tome will focus on teaching you the necessary rites for attaining control over its power.

Chapter 3

The Uses of Magic

Fantasy authors have created an enormous variety of fantasy worlds and in the creation of these worlds each author has shown that magic can be utilised for many different ends. Not only is magic something for the inhabitants of the secondary worlds to manipulate, interact with, or be affected by, but the author can use the theme of magic as a framework to depict and discuss real world issues, albeit by basing them in a secondary world setting; that is to say that the authors tackle a social commentary through the proxy of a fantasy story.

The characters within the stories might engage with a social issue from the primary world, but will do so from their own culture, their own secondary world's approach. The issues can be examined in the fantasy setting by the author presenting them 'at a different intensity [...] at [their] maximum'.[1] Distancing a social issue like this, placing it in a fantasy setting, allows the author to freely discuss the issue and not necessarily present a clear message as to which side of the argument is "right", taking the commentary beyond the realms of real world debate and placing it in a hypothetical nexus where the outcome is not determined by contemporary social bias. To take a science fiction example here for a moment, the warring factions of the Bajorans and the Cardassians in *Star Trek's Deep Space Nine* represented the Israeli and Palestinian cultures and their well-documented clashes throughout our primary world's history. There was never any

---

[1] Todorov, p. 93.

concrete evidence to tell the viewer which fictional culture represented which real culture, thus permitting the viewer to relate to either side as they chose.

Returning to fantasy, the social issue can also provide the author with a means through which to show the reader how the different cultures of the secondary world view and use magic themselves. Here Clute provides a simple, over-arching definition for the use of magic:

> The most one can do when trying to pin down the use of magic in fantasy is to follow certain lines – certain *sequences* or *vectors* – of ideas. There are two kinds and concern: what magic is seen to be; and what is done with magic.[2]

The ways in which magic is seen within the secondary worlds, and what is done with it can be broken down into a number of themes: Perception and Power, The Faërie and Representation. Each of these themes has a different focus, and the manner in which the Faërie is represented, from this perspective, is different again from its representation as a source of magic, as outlined earlier in Chapter 2. Culture, individual values, and the role magic has in shaping or supporting a person and their ideals results in the freedom for the author to show the reader what magic can really achieve in their secondary world. Fantasy allows the author to push the boundaries and discuss matters that otherwise might not get discussed, and hopefully leave the reader thinking on the issue.

Some authors follow Tolkien's comments that:

> It is the mark of a good fairy-story, of the higher or more complete kind, that however wild its events, however fantastic or terrible the adventures,

---

[2] Clute, 'Magic', p. 616.

it can give to child or man that hears it, when the "turn" comes, a catch of the breath, a beat and lifting of the heart, near to (or indeed accompanied by) tears, as keen as that given by any form of literary art.[3]

Tolkien argues that the issue or social commentary should be resolved with an enjoyable, miraculous, or positive outcome. This viewpoint can lead to unrealistic narrative or world building conclusions, and may even alienate the reader if they feel that the author is clearly biased toward supporting a particular outcome for a real world issue. The secondary world's characters and their own approach to the matter in hand should dictate how the issue is resolved.

This chapter begins by examining characters and their direct interaction with the magic systems of the worlds they inhabit, analysing how authors can use this to strengthen the secondary world. The section on Faërie explores the recycling of fantasy tropes and how these too reflect or subvert common readers' assumptions about the genre or the role of magic. Throughout, I touch on the place of social commentary within fantasy fiction, a theme that becomes the primary focus in the third section of this chapter: Representation.

Perception and Power

From a narrative point of view, the theme of Perception is that of how the peoples of the various secondary worlds perceive magic. They might see magic as a tool to aid them in minor tasks or day-to-day life, such as pre-Reod Elantris where the Elantrians 'could make almost anything' and they used this to create everything in

---

[3] Tolkien, 'On Fairy Stories', pp. 62-63.

their city.[4] They might see it as a weapon or power of domination with which to defeat their enemies, such as Coin threatening the gods of the Discworld. It might be something that entire populations fear, like the citizens of the Empire in the Warhammer World, hence their reliance on Witch Hunters and anti-wizard naysayers. Knowing what peoples' perception of magic is helps to shape the secondary world's inhabitants views on magic and the tales they form about it help to shape how they react, or interact with it throughout the story. If they take magic to be something of a threat (such as in the Warhammer World), the characters will treat it with fear, or try to use it to defend themselves against the worst forms of it. The fear is justified as their enemies do make use of magic as a powerful weapon. If it is something inherent to the nature of the world (such as 'enchantment' in *The Lord of the Rings*), then some characters may see it as part of everyday life, while others, such as Frodo and Sam when they encounter Galadriel, may idolise, or misunderstand it.[5] It might then become something which, for the characters and preferably not the readers, is nothing short of a mystery, something for them to learn about, perhaps in the same manner as Raoden and his investigations into how AonDor works.

In each secondary world, what magic is seen to be directly influences both the peoples' behaviours, as well as their cultures. The wizards of the Discworld are said to feel self-important because they rule over magic, and in turn, idealistically rule over the entire Disc. They do not, however, actually possess this rulership, they merely feel that they do. Coin even asks the wizards of the Unseen University: 'why is it that wizards do not rule the world?' to which the answer is a very vague and esoteric 'we have domains beyond the ken of the temporal power

---

[4] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 90.
[5] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 353.

[…] magic can surely take the mind to inner landscape of arcane'.[6] Because of their frame of mind, all of the wizards are therefore described as lazy, self-indulgent, highly political, and considering themselves more important than non-magic people. (This evolves in later novels with a new regime change, where the wizards take a more active and caring role). In this respect, magic is therefore extremely important from a world building perspective, and how the author handles its representation can have strong implications for whether the reader believes the secondary world. It also impacts whether the reader believes the people who populate it.

Power follows on from Perception by the magic itself being the energy to create or to manifest something into existence (regardless of its source, as outlined in Chapter 2). It can also mean something more along the lines of domination or control. Power is therefore usually presented to the reader as all three: control; domination; and as a destructive force, but to varying degrees, and with different intents. In many cases, power like this can be presented as a part of a balance; where magical power has the force to destroy a world, the characters and peoples of that world have the conviction to defend themselves (often using magic against itself). The peoples of the secondary world perceive magic to be something of great importance, and the wizards who wield this magic can take advantage of this for their own purposes, using magic as an outright weapon to take what they want, or using it more subtly to manipulate and coerce themselves into positions of domination and control.

In our own history, as pointed out in *Picatrix*, humans have been consumed with understanding magic for many centuries: 'magic is, in fact,

---

[6] Pratchett, *Sourcery*, p. 86.

everything that absolutely fascinates minds and attracts souls by means of words and deeds'.[7] How people perceive magic is therefore through the way in which it is described to them, through myth, tales, and so-called first hand experiences. Even Keickhefer notes that authors of magic books, even at a time when belief in magic was seemingly high, provided readers with 'depictions of magic [that] often tease the reader with uncertainties about the boundary between illusion and reality' and also asks 'Are we to assume […] experiments […] were intended as entertainment? […] What one writer will write tongue in cheek another may intend as fact'.[8] Magic has therefore, for many centuries, been presented to the reader in a story-telling manner, with the underlying intention to intrigue the reader and to get them to want to know more, or to sway their opinion so that they fully believe the story being told to them. What, historically, was done with magic, on the other hand, was to use it to generally affect other people, or to generate influence intended to benefit oneself. Kieckhefer again tells us about 'magic intended to bend the minds and wills […] the power of suggestion', in that many spells were cast with the intent to persuade someone, or to convince them that they had been cursed, or otherwise afflicted by a spell.[9] Hence, power and perception are combined with the widespread belief in magic: telling someone outright that they are, or are to become, cursed would have proven sufficiently effective in apparently bringing the spell's power into action. Carrying out the ritual, telling someone they are now cursed, and then seeing them suffer ill fortune will have also fomented further belief in magic's efficacy, thus providing further source material for authors to describe 'first hand experiences' of magic, and to continue the cycle of evidence and belief.

---

[7] Al-Hakim, p. 11.
[8] Kieckhefer, p. 43 and p. 46.
[9] Kieckhefer, p. 69.

The level of coercion and domination are tied quite strongly to each other here; the magician is seen to be in command of magic and their victim does not, and so the victim accepts their domination, and believes that whatever mishap later befalls them is the result of a magical effect. What then occurs is a state where, as Kieckhefer again explains:

> readers and practitioners [of medieval magic] were asked to suspend their disbelief, or perhaps to entertain possibilities that would normally defy belief but within this ritual context might gain credibility.[10]

This results in magic being believed in because the magicians now appear to wield a real power, even if they really have no magic at all, and society was asked to accept that the impossible was in fact possible. In the same manner, authors of contemporary fantasy should ideally be showing their secondary world's inhabitants to be using magic in a way that makes the reader believes in magic within this context. It should also be presented that the inhabitants within that secondary world believe in its power and appropriately act upon its influence on their culture and personal values. This is important because, as Rosegrant points out: '[p]eople who do not believe in magic as something that actually physically affects the material world may nevertheless find much of what is of value in life to be metaphorically enchanted'.[11] Readers are placing their own personal values on the metaphors inherent in fantasy magic systems, and as a result are able to more greatly enjoy not only the fictional story but their own values. Further, fantasy stories that link the readers' values with metaphors built into magic compels readers to continue reading the fiction because of the nature of the art

---

[10] Kiechefer, p. 26.
[11] Rosegrant, p. 130.

itself: '[the fictions are] enchanting not only because of the truths they address but because of the art with which they address them'.[12] The skill with which the author has written the fiction can compel further reading.

The believability of the reality of magic in the secondary world therefore equates to the satisfaction about their own values, especially when fictional characters that the readers relate to share these same kinds of values, and using magic as a metaphor to enhance this connection gives the reader a sort of "safe" distance between themselves and the secondary world. They can empathise with the peoples of fantasy world without feeling like they themselves are also trapped within that world. Readers do take an active participation when considering the issues faced by characters within a secondary world. As Todorov states the reader experiences a form of 'hesitation', or internal conflict in analysing a secondary world issue that is:

> between a natural and supernatural explanation of the events described
> […] this hesitation may also be experienced by a character; thus the
> reader's role is so to speak entrusted to a character, and at the same time
> the hesitation is represented, it becomes one of the themes of the work – in
> the case of naïve reading, the actual reader identifies himself with the
> character.[13]

If the reader can be coerced into accepting the fates dealt out by magic, then they can just as readily accept that the characters of the secondary worlds can accept (or fight) these fates as well. It is the characters' own internal struggles to use or

---

[12] Rosegrant, p. 131.
[13] Todorov, p. 33.

overcome their perceptions of magic, or the influence of the power of magic that invests the reader in the characters' lives.

Magic in Todorov's example lies in an in-between position between natural and supernatural, so if the outcome of the events is too closely written to resemble the real world, this would be detrimental to the aim of framing a real issue against a background of magic. Conversely, if the connection to magic is too insubstantial, and there is no obvious in-world explanation, then it no longer remains fantasy, but borders on the realm of the uncanny, or the gothic, again an unsatisfactory outcome for the fantasy author, and inconsistent with the notion of magic.

In *Sourcery* magic is shown to be a powerful and dangerous force that should only be used by those who know what they are doing with it. The wizards of the Unseen University are the ones, at least in their view, who are in charge of keeping a watchful eye on magic's use, and they regard themselves as the authority on all the knowledge pertaining magic. Through the course of the story Coin both awakens and manipulates the wizards' lust for control and dominance, increasingly pushing them to first take rulership of the city of Ankh-Morpork and then further beyond. Coin incites the wizards to challenge ownership of the Discworld itself when he asks: 'Who rules the Disc? Wizards or gods?' where the wizard Harkedly responds: 'Oh, wizards. Of course. But, as it were, *under* the gods'.[14] This misuse of power as the wizards increasingly control more and more magic proves the adage that "power corrupts" and Coin's power is the most corrupting of all. Reader should perceive source-based magic the same way that the wizards themselves should have: that magic and political/world domination

---

[14] Pratchett, *Sourcery*, p. 280.

make for a dangerous combination and it should not be something dealt with by those with no idea what they are actually doing.

Outside of *Sourcery*, Pratchett also presents magic as a variety of other classifications. Headology is one such form, predominantly utilised by Witches. Headology is much the same as applied psychology, and in *Lords and Ladies* Granny Weatherwax talks about how the witches she and Nanny Ogg are waiting for make use of this:

> "They'll be here in a few minutes."
>
> "No she won't," said Granny. "She'll be late."
>
> "How d'you know?"
>
> "No good making an entrance if everyone isn't there to see you, is it? That's headology."[15]

The power a witch exerts over someone else is reliant on their acceptance that the witch is performing magic, when in actual fact, it is simply psychology. Power and domination both take form through Headology, in this case by way of people seeing a witch, knowing witches perform magic, and in turn believing what a witch tells them. Especially strong belief can become a form of magic too; the more people there are who belief in something, and the stronger their belief is, the more likely there is to be a magical effect.

In the Warhammer World, magic is the most powerful force, constantly on the verge of destroying everything, and always, either in the background or foreground, a major influence on all events. It is rarely a subtle means for

---

[15] Terry Pratchett, *Lords and Ladies* (London: HarperCollins Publishers Ltd, 1992), p. 37.

manipulating people's minds, rather it is a heavy-handed weapon used for outright domination. It is the stuff of Chaos, a fact that is known to both the inhabitants of the Warhammer World, and the readers. It is the raw power that threatens to engulf the world and destroy it completely and is feared by most rational beings, although the power it can provide is sought after by the maniacal and deranged. The reader, especially through the various rulebooks for the tabletop game that this secondary world is written for, sees all the reasons, schemes, ideals, and machinations of the magic system itself, and has a far greater understanding of how magic works in this world than even the peoples inhabiting it have (save for the High Elves, and possibly also the Slaan).

The sheer destructive power of magic was showcased in 2015 by the authors behind the Warhammer World narratives when they enacted The End Times; the storyline ending for the secondary world's overall setting, where Chaos unleashed the full force of magic and it finally overcame all defences completely destroying the world:

> And so the mortal world fell away into oblivion. The gnawing rift at the heart of mankind's domain devoured reality. Slowly it spread at first, but then with the hunger of ravening wildfire. Invigorated, great polar rifts slipped their ancient bounds and joined their younger sibling in its feast. The peoples of the world beheld their doom, and screamed in despair [...]
>
> That terrible act of uncreation might have taken the blink of an eye, or unfolded across millennia. The Dark Gods were not fettered by the flow of time, and let it pass unmarked. Already tired of their victory, they

turned away from the ruin they had wrought and began the Great Game

anew in other worlds and other creations.[16]

The gnawing rift refers to a tear between the material realm and the Realm of Chaos, and the polar rifts, naturally, the Chaos Gates in the north created by the Old Ones. The Chaos Gods had the Realm of Chaos, raw magic itself, devour the Warhammer World as their final victory over the forces of Order who fought to survive. The power to act as the catalyst for this planetary destruction was granted by the Chaos Gods to Archaon the Everchosen, the champion of Chaos. He led a great army of Chaos and the forces of Destruction into the heart of the Empire where this war initiated the end of the world. The authors then created a brand new setting as a result, one that is still constantly dominated by magic, albeit essentially still a continuation of the previous narrative, but aimed now at the Chaos Gods' new Great Game.

In *Elantris*, the Elantrians themselves, due to their affinity with magic, are perceived by the non-magical citizens of Arelon to be gods. For example, Arelon is said to be 'the home to people transformed into magic-using demigods by the Shaod' and when Raoden is affected by the Shaod Sanderson tells us that 'ten years ago, the Shaod would have made Raoden a god'.[17] The power over magic equates here to power over non-magical beings; control; and domination, yet at the same time, this is not born out of lust for power, but the misguided placement of belief. The people of Arelon viewed the Elantrians as gods, and the Elantrians came to accept and believe this themselves. When the Elantrian magic became corrupted and failed, belief quickly turned to disgust and fear , yet they still hold

---

[16] The Games Workshop Design Studio, *Archaon: The End Times - Volume V* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 2014), p. 256.

[17] Sanderson, *Elantris*, 4th cover, and pp. 4-5.

out belief that the Elantrians will become gods once more: 'irrational as it may be, the people *want* to believe Elantris will be restored'.[18]

The Derethi priest Hrathen takes advantage of this religious "crisis of faith" and uses it to try to supplant the Arelon religion with that of his own (in order to convert the city rather than destroy it through invasion). It also seems to represent a desire to go back to the old ways of monarchy and ruler ship where someone else does all the ruling, and supplying the nation with the means of life, since: 'while they didn't give it away for free, they [the Elantrians] could provide many materials at far cheaper prices than the merchants'.[19]

Essentially, the average citizen became reliant on their 'gods' and complacent to their own need for progress. This complacency is also reflected in the Elantrians themselves, who built a large walled city, yet: 'only people supremely confident in themselves would craft such an amazing fortification, then place a wide set of stairs on the outside leading to the top'.[20] The power is therefore doubly a manifestation of the actual magic: the AonDor itself and the abilities it grants to the Elantrians being one manifestation. An internalised and shared belief system among the Arelon people that the Elantrians are gods who have fallen but could once more rise being the other. Since gods hold domain over their followers, the inherent power dynamic is that "those with magical ability are our superiors, and therefore must be the ones to rule us". The role of class structure and magic is readily apparent.

---

[18] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 112.
[19] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 90.
[20] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 100.

The Faërie

My examination of the Faërie in this section is more focused on how it has

become a representation of how various fantasy worlds, post Tolkien, reflect or

alter the idea of the Faërie world fantasy setting. Authors may base their

secondary worlds in a Faërie setting following Tolkien's tradition, or they may

simply pick and choose certain tropes from the example of *The Lord of the Rings*

and instead shape them for a different secondary world. Tolkien 'set a new

standard for world building' a part of which was to establish the Faërie as a

secondary world setting for much of contemporary fantasy.[21] It is now of interest

how authors have since maintained Tolkien's example or diverged from it. Where

authors clearly indicate connections to Tolkien-esque notions of Faërie the reader

can encounter either direct homage, or even parody and subversion. Many other

authors may simply ignore the role and function of "enchantment" within their

secondary world, instead preferring to supplant it with magic in general, though

even then fantasy tropes such as Elves may be present within these worlds and

their representation may still be a shadow of Tolkien's elvenkind.

Pratchett's Discworld and the Warhammer World both contain Elves that

reflect aspects of Tolkien's Faërie, but not in the same form in which he originally

presented it. The Warhammer World retains clear links to Tolkien in a way that

pays homage to and builds on tradition, while Pratchett employs these

recognisable tropes to deliberately subvert them. Though Elves have become a

fantasy trope, and the Elves of the Warhammer World are representative of this

trope, the world still maintains a link to the Faërie by way of elvenkind's methods.

The High Elves are the most highly magically attuned race that are native to the

---

[21] Wolf, p. 131.

Warhammer World (the Slann are arguably more capable, but are from another planet), and they protect the world from magic's harmful effects (their home of Ulthuan is designed to capture and contain errant magic:

> Ulthuan itself acts as a focal point for the winds of magical energy which
>
> blow across the known world from the Northern Wastes […] Ulthuan
>
> drains magic out of the known world and prevents the tide of magic
>
> overwhelming everything and turning it into a seething realm of Chaos.[22]

They are the only race that can channel the entire range of magic without harm; everyone else is too weak of mind, or of body. Their kin the Wood Elves are almost copies of Tolkien's elves. They are heavily attuned to nature, living a very symbiotic life with the forest by interacting with woodland spirits, treemen (Tolkien's Ents), and other forest-bound fauna.

The forest where they live is named Athel Loren, and it is said that when the Elves first came to the forest they 'were inexplicably drawn to Athel Loren, and learned to treat it with great respect'.[23] After many years of dwelling at the outskirts of the forest, the Elves eventually began to move deeper into the woodland and:

> It was then that the Elves, always respectful of all things natural, truly
>
> embraced Athel Loren as their home, for that was when Athel Loren truly
>
> embraced the Elves. More than that, they treated Athel Loren with the awe

---

[22] Andy Chambers and Bill King, *Warhammer Armies: High Elves* (Nottingham: Games
      Workshop Ltd, 1993), p. 5.
[23] Anthony Reynolds and Matthew Ward, *Warhammer Armies: Wood Elves* (Nottingham: Games
      Workshop Ltd, 2005), p. 8.

and reverence it deserved and demanded, seeing the essence of their ancestral gods in its seasonal cycles.[24]

The Tolkien-esque relationship between Wood Elves, nature, and magic (enchantment) are very clearly outlined in this context, leaving the reader to understand the symbiosis, and to infer that the Warhammer World's Elves represent Tolkien's Faërie in much the same way as the Elves in *The Lord of the Rings*, so much so that the name Athel Loren even strongly resembles Lothlórien from *The Lord of the Rings,* placing Elves in the Warhammer World as quite the homage to Tolkien, though not entirely following his example on how they interact with the secondary world as a whole.

The Warhammer World's Wood Elves are also morally ambiguous, having no desire for destruction, nor any urge to protect the world outside of their forest home. They may not be guardians of magic in the same sense as the High Elves, but they are very similar to Tolkien's elves nonetheless. They will help when they see that help is needed, but they will also stonewall and refuse to offer assistance when they feel it would be a detriment to their safety or their ideals. The Wood Elf mages also heavily rely on the use of magic from the Lore of Life, further reinforcing their similarity to Tolkien's Elves, in that they use more benevolent magic to protect themselves and to help those around them. In the Warhammer World, therefore, the reader is shown that magic is still an evil force and that the Faërie exists to help balance out, or defend against its approaches. The entire world itself may not be a Faërie setting, but key locations within the world certainly are.

---

[24] Reynolds and Ward, p. 10.

Pratchett's Discworld novels initially ignore anything wholly elf-related, aside from a recurring pun in *Soul Music* where a musician is referred to as being "Elvish"; a clear play on the name Elvis. When they finally become an established part of the Discworld canon, Pratchett takes the opportunity to twist Tolkien's intentions. Elves in the Discworld (introduced in earnest in *Lords and Ladies*, the fourteenth Discworld novel) essentially epitomise the Faërie, in so much as their own world (a pocket dimension parallel to the Discworld) is heavy with enchantment magic, the Elves themselves are described as "glamorous" and are able to manipulate people with this glamour, and their features are otherworldly. As pointed out in a more condensed form in the *Discworld Companion*: 'their power derives from the use of a mental ability that could be described as 'glamour' to confuse and overawe people'.[25] However, Pratchett exaggerates the Faërie-ness of his Elves to the point of sheer evil; the polar opposite of Tolkien's Faërie. For Pratchett's elves: 'when they get into a world, everyone else is on the bottom. Slaves. Worse than slaves. Worse than animals, even. They take what they want, and they want everything'.[26] Pratchett even presents the reader with a short series of verses which portray how one can twist the truth to misinform, and to show how elves are evil:

Elves are wonderful. They provoke wonder.

Elves are marvelous. They cause marvels.

Elves are fantastic. They create fantasies.

Elves are glamorous. They project glamour.

---

[25] Pratchett and Briggs, p. 156.
[26] Pratchett, *Lords and Ladies*, p. 65.

Elves are enchanting. They weave enchantment.

Elves are terrific. They beget terror.

The thing about words is that meanings can twist just like a snake, and if you want to find snakes look for them behind words that have changed their meaning.

No one ever said elves are nice.

Elves are bad.[27]

Where Tolkien's Faërie is far more benevolent, protective, and nurturing in nature, Pratchett's is destructive, power-hungry, and cruel.

What the reader is shown, therefore, is that magic is something completely different to Faërie in the Discworld, it is subverted and flipped about its poles when compared to Tolkien, so that magic is the life-giving, world-protecting force, and the Faërie is the malign and evil force, even though Pratchett does refer to the link between elves and enchantment. This gives Pratchett the means to play with the tropes of the fantasy genre, and use them to frame issues for the reader in an unexpected way. Compared to Tolkien, in the Discworld, what magic is seen to be, therefore, is pure and essential rather than vile and debase. In an interesting addition to the Discworld lore, the reader also finds out that the only time when the elves can enter into the Discworld is at a time known as 'circle time', a time when crop circles frequently appear in fields:

The air sizzled and was filled with an angry buzzing. Then, in the center of the field, rustling as it bent, the young corn lay down in a circle [and

---

[27] Pratchett, *Lords and Ladies*, p. 67.

barriers are weakened] when the walls between this and that are thinner, when there are all sorts of strange leakages… Ah, then choices are made, then the universe can be sent careening down a different leg of the well-known Trousers of Time.[28]

Relating this back to magic in our own primary world, the reader is again presented with a representation of the magic circle, as outlined in both *Picatrix* and *Forbidden Rites*, as being the perfect form, and being the image through which magic can be drawn. Power and magic are again intrinsically connected. The circle is something supernatural in this instance, drawn by forces intent on fulfilling themselves, rather than as something a person may draw in order to ask for magical energies. Another subversion, this time on the way magic works in the primary world, though with appropriate links to real practices. It is, of course, also a poke at the conspiracy theorists' contention that crop circles are formed by alien visitors to Earth, here twisting it to mean something completely different, and far more sinister.

Representation and Real World Issues

Fantasy authors often draw parallels between their secondary worlds and the primary world. Likewise, readers bring to texts their own biases and experiences. Roland Bathes's theory on "the death of the author" explains that the author's intent does not factor into what messages readers get from reading the work of fiction. He talks about writing in the following manner:

---

[28] Pratchett, *Lords and Ladies*, p. 9 and p. 47.

> It is language that speaks, not the author; to write is, through prerequisite
> impersonality […], to reach that point where only language acts,
> 'performs', and not 'me' […] language knows a 'subject', not a 'person',
> and the subject empty outside of the very enunciation which defines it,
> suffices to make language 'hold together', suffice, that is to say, to exhaust
> it.[29]

Barthes argues that 'a text is not a line of words releasing a single 'theological' meaning (the 'message' of the Author-God)', which means that authors' intentions should not be taken as the only meaning of a piece of writing.[30]

For the purposes of this thesis, I argue that this theory has both value and limits. Readers do impose their own meanings on the texts they read and all the interrogations of texts I refer to in this thesis are framed by my interpretations of their content and meaning. However, at times authors do make their intentions discernible and overt. I aim to explore the way in which fantasy texts use magic to engage with real world issues with this duality in mind, acknowledging that my interpretations of these issues define the context of the following discussion. Some authors appear to be writing about a primary world concern, or topical issue by framing it on the foundation of magic within their secondary world. The message that readers interpret is still individual to those readers, but the fact that the author uses their magic system as the basis for initiating discussion is the key point of relevance.

---

[29] Roland Bathes, 'The Death of the Author' in *Twentieth Century Literary Theory: A Reader*,
   ed. K. M. Newton (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1997), p. 121.
[30] Bathes, p. 122.

In that light, in the secondary worlds examined in this thesis, magic is seen to be very much the same as the author's commentary presents it. Attebery even notes that 'magic and symbolism are inextricably linked […] and thus fantasy proves to be an inexhaustible generation of fresh symbols for death and desire'.[31] Of course, other symbols are relevant, such as symbols about gender equality, though there is ground to argue that this might be another form of desire. For example, the powerful weapon-nature of magic in the Warhammer World is also something well known among all its inhabitants, and there is a Cold War feel to the way in which humans in particular view magic as both a weapon of mass destruction and a tool for salvation, especially regarding how the authors chose to represent magic overall. In *The Lord of the Rings* there are the elves who marshal the forces of enchantment to protect nature, and to become one with it, and they understand that this enchantment magic is the key force for maintaining the environment, which can be interpreted as Tolkien's views on environmentalism, or indeed anti-industrialism. There is sufficient evidence to argue that the near anthropomorphism of nature and the symbiotic relationship it has with the elves clearly highlight's Tolkien's view.

The people of Arelon in *Elantris* view the AonDor as something that, before the Reod, created a clear distinction between classes of people; the Elantrians were gods because they had magic, and as such they were revered as gods and this can come across as a debate that Sanderson wishes to raise about class structure.

Discworld's clear split between witch magic and wizard magic is no secret, and people are either ambivalent to this distinction, or wish to overcome

---

[31] Attebery, p4.

this split in order to progress equality. Pratchett's personal aim, on the other hand, may be to highlight this same inequality in our primary world, as well as his own dig at the separation of gendered roles in our own society.

When magic is represented as something that the author is using as a tool with which to critically examine real world issues, the reader can either accept this discussion as being a part of the secondary world, or view it as an examination of real issues from a fictional perspective.

The authors responsible for the Warhammer World do not seem to be expressly focused on forwarding any particular commentary or social issue that magic is being used to address within this context, other than perhaps commentary on the arms race. Magic could be equated here as being equal to nuclear weaponry in our primary world; in so much as the more that magic is used to threaten destruction, the greater the need to contain the magic (through the High Elves), or the greater the desire to use equal or greater force against the foe. With the Age of Sigmar narrative culminating in the destruction of the Warhammer World via the outright force of magic as wielded by the Chaos Gods, this commentary stands to reason. However, this is merely conjecture on my part, as there is little outside research into the topic to make any solid conclusions. Fictional texts do not always have to have an agenda to push onto the reader, yet as Bathes explained, readers will interpret the writing and find their own meaning: '[t]he reader is the space on which all the quotations that make up a writing are inscribed without any of them being lost: a text's unity lies not in its origin but in its destination'.[32]

---

[32] Bathes, p. 123.

If anything, however, much of the way in which magic is handled by the common citizenry of the Empire is to fear and avoid it. Witch-hunters are a common sight, and much of the fear and suspicion reflects our own primary world's history. Much of the Witch Hunters' activities are based within the Empire where they:

> prefer to seek out Chaos cultists, Mutants, and heretics that have insidiously hidden amidst the cities of the Empire. However, they will travel far indeed if they think they can strike a meaningful blow against the forces of evil.[33]

The Salem Witch Trials between February 1692 and May 1693 are a similar example of the fear of witches in our own history. Since a great proportion of the Warhammer World's world building reflects our own history twisting certain facts to place them within a different secondary world, where magic is actually noticeably real, and in which fantasy creatures such as elves, goblins, trolls and dragons are not only real too, but also commonplace can alter the reader's interpretation.

Another possible social commentary presented to readers revolves around a certain manner of class-based magic, or "the chosen few", in that all magic-users within the Warhammer World are born to the art; no-one can use magic if it is not in their genes:

---

[33] Pramas, p. 87.

wizards have little say in whether the world of magic touches them or not. They are born with second sight and to them the world of magical energies and spells is much more real than the mundane world of normal mortals. [34]

Many of the human wizards are male, but this feature is not something that is emphasised within any of the Warhammer World's narratives as being an important trait of wizards overall. The exception being the Bretonnians (a sort of France-cum-England culture) where all the men aspire to knighthood and chivalry, and all the culture's wizards are women. As with the humans of the Empire, Bretonnians fear the gifted children; ones who display differences such as 'eyes of different colours, milk may sour in their presence or they may be able to predict events before they occur.[35]

The Bretonnians have a mystical Lady of the Lake who magically protects the people of Bretonnia. She also known as the Fay Enchantress (which is a link to Tolkien's Faërie, in the most simple of terms because "fay" is another word for Faërie) and before the Bretonnian gifted children reach puberty 'she takes them with her to the Otherworld, and they are mourned by their parents as if they were no longer living', but while 'nothing is ever seen of the boy-children again, sometimes the girl-children will return to Bretonnia years later as damsels and prophetesses'.[36] These damsels and prophetesses are Bretonnia's wizards, all highly attuned to nature magic. These chosen few, being represented by an entirely female demographic not only represents the historical context of knights

---

[34] Prinen, p. 56.

[35] Anthony Reynolds, *Warhammer Armies: Bretonnia* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 2003), p. 47.

[36] Reynolds, p. 47.

and chivalry being the aspiration of men, but also reflects the understanding that women in our own history practiced nature magic.

As stated, much of the Warhammer World history draws heavily from our primary world's history. The largest human civilisation, the Empire, is noticeably based on early modern Germany, roughly sometime between 1500-1800AD. This influences much of what the authors present, as it is drawn from real world examples, though with a fantasy spin. Any social or political commentary is probably simply lifted from our history books and set into this secondary world without any intention for further discussion.

Outside of the humans all the other races of the Warhammer World also have their own various wizards, but while the ratman race called the Skaven have wizards known as Grey Seers, they also have Warlock Engineers. These Warlock Engineers, mostly from the Skaven Clan Skryre are not natural born wizards, more 'self-made' wizards. They use science and mechanics to access the winds of magic. They have a mechanical device they have dubbed warp-power accumulators which they wear on their backs. 'They pick up and concentrate the energy of the winds of magic […] They also include an eyepiece that allows the Warlock to see the mutable ebbs and flows of the magical energies in the ether'.[37] Within the Skaven culture, magic is therefore seen as something to manipulate, to use to further scientific research or outcomes, and something to be controlled.

Besides the Skaven, and the followers of Chaos, most races have a different view on magic. Humans, for example, generally fear the use of magic, and those who do not end up being trained in the Colleges of Magic to become

---

[37] Cavatore, p. 34.

wizards fighting in the Imperial army are shunned by society, branded as witches, or even hunted down by Witch Hunters. 'Humans born with magical talent are dangerous and feared individuals. Daemons and disaster gather about an untrained Wizard' and '[f]or this reason the Witch Hunters eagerly track and execute these unfortunate folk who all too often unconsciously invite daemons and disaster into the world'.[38] What the various authors of the Warhammer World stress, is that magic is used by the military of the human races, especially the Empire to wield great power against the foes of humanity (usually Chaos) to protect the weak and to aid the soldiers in battle. Other races use magic for similar purposes, wielding it as a tool with which to fight their enemies, yet also fearing its destructive nature. Since, for the most part, magic in the Warhammer World is a destructive force; it is almost always presented to the reader in such a manner.

Rather than using magic as a major feature of the stories set in his secondary world, Tolkien appears to be using magic and enchantment (by way of the Faërie) as more of a background world building utility. This world building exercise also overrides any overall commentary on world politics, or any other issue, as it becomes a background feature and not something for the reader to focus on. Certainly, the symbiotic relationship between elvenkind and nature can be seen as a reflection on environmentalism, yet there exists an undercurrent of something slightly different to political commentary here. The Ent, Treebeard, talks about elves protecting nature and states: 'Elves began it, of course, waking trees up and teaching them to speak and learning their tree-talk', before lamenting about the 'Great Darkness' and the thinning of the forests: 'there was all one

---

[38] Pramas, p. 31 and p. 40.

wood once upon a time'.[39] Thus Tolkien presents some history about how elves

began a nurturing relationship with nature, but malign forces interfered. As Isaacs

writes, 'a mythographer might well show how Tolkien has used existing myths,

reshaped (abused?) others and forged new ones'.[40] Yvette Kisor in her essay

'Totemic Reflexes in Tolkien's Middle-Earth' opens by saying that 'J.R.R.

Tolkien took inspiration from *Boewulf*, among many other medieval works, in

writing *The Lord of the Rings* […] and his other tales of Middle-earth'.[41]

The suggestion here, as touched on in Chapter 2, is that Tolkien was

writing *Lord of the Rings* as a new myth, or an example of such, and therefore his

selection of setting the world in a Faërie realm represented both the fantasy and

historical elements of storytelling. Fantasy, because the events are improbable and

unlikely to have occurred in our own primary world, but likely enough to have

occurred in a secondary world. Historical, because the events are framed in a

similar manner to myth and legend from our own primary world. R. J. Reilly

states in his essay 'Tolkien and the Fairy Story' that *The Lord of the Rings*:

> would seem closest to "myth", except that we generally think of myth as
>
> some sort of adumbration of what was once either fact, or felt to be fact, or
>
> desired to be fact. But here this is no question of fact at all

However, at the same time that 'the trilogy accords generally with the

specifications that Tolkien laid down to the fairy story'.[42] This is therefore an

examination of *The Lord of the Rings* as a myth of its own secondary world, a

world which is Faërie. Magic, therefore, sets up the world as being separate to our

---

[39] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 457.
[40] Isaacs, p. 6.
[41] Yvette Kisor, 'Totemic Reflexes in Tolkien's Middle-Earth', in *Mythlore*, 28:3/4, (2010), 129.
[42] Reilly, 'Tolkien and the Fairy Story', p. 132 and p. 137.

own primary world, and therefore gives further credence to the likelihood of the events' veracity, or at least, the likelihood of their veracity within their own secondary world. As Attebery states about myth:

> fantasy "makes' myth only in the sense that a traditional oral performer makes the story she tells: not inventing but recreating that which has always existed only in performance, in the present.[43]

Here, Tolkien is both telling and creating the story that he writes about, but in a manner that feels like it could have possibly always have existed, at least in the history of Middle-earth, in the history of its own secondary world. The heroes of the "myth" therefore take precedence in the story; their actions and the consequences being of greater importance, while magic is mentioned and discussed, yet never takes as great a level of importance as the characters. In 'The Forward to the Second Edition' in *The Lord of the Rings*, Tolkien writes a personal address to the reader in which he states the importance of character and story and how they evolved as he wrote:

> Elrond, Gondolin, the High-elves, and the orcs, as well as glimpses that had arisen unbidden of things higher or deeper or darker than [the story's] surface: Durin, Moria, Gandalf, the Necromancer and the Ring. The discovery of the significance of these glimpses and of their relation to the ancient histories revealed the Third Age and its culmination in the War of the Ring.[44]

He also asserts that his 'prime motive was the desire of a tale-teller to try his hand at a really long story that would hold the attention of readers, amuse them, delight

---

[43] Attebery, p. 4.
[44] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*, p. xv.

them, and at times maybe excite them or deeply move them'.[45] Here Tolkien

emphasises his narrative-driven motivations, which take precedence over world

building elements and detailed explanations about magic.

Despite the distinction between enchantment and magic within this same

secondary world, there is little argument for this being a commentary on morality.

Indeed, enchantment as presented via elves seems to be morally just, or at the very

least not corrupt, while magic is said to be cruder and possibly vile, the distinction

is more along the lines of nature versus technology. Humans use a base magic,

and elves use nature's pure enchantment.

The magic in Sanderson's *Elantris* is strongly linked to class. Raoden

himself is a prince who, of all the people affected by the debilitating Shaod

(whereby magic corrupts their physical bodies), is the only one who has the ability

to understand and learn how to both control and fix the magic system.

Even more than being simply class-related, the magic itself is also race-

related; only those who are of Aonic descent will be affected by the Shaod, and

indeed, if the Shaod was not a corrupting force, these same people would instead

be able to use AonDor and would otherwise have been seen to have become gods.

Sarene, who is of noble-class, but not of the Aonic race cannot cast magic: 'she

couldn't draw Aons in the air; she couldn't even get the lines to start appearing

behind her fingers'.[46] Magic, especially that of AonDor, is reserved for a "chosen

few", and everybody else has to either remain content that they do not possess the

ability, or train very hard in order to overcome this natural disability: 'even before

---

[45] Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings*, p. xvi.
[46] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 475.

the Reod, it had taken some Elantrians years to learn AonDor'.[47] Although the

trope of magic being reserved only for people born into the art is something fairly

common in fantasy literature itself, on the whole it usually refrains from

discriminating amongst classes. Sanderson, however, clearly defines it as

something inherent within a class-structure and race based inheritance. In

Elantris, the end indicates that the former status quo is being restored; Raoden has

fixed both the AonDor, and thus the city of Elantris itself. The class-structure of

old is seemingly re-established as the current ruler's corrupt system is torn down:

'Elantris had been revitalised and serfdom proclaimed illegal. Of course, [the

former ruler Iadon's] son did sit on the throne of Arelon, even if that throne was

inside of Elantris now.[48] This does show some level of change, although there is

clearly resistance:

> Raoden had ended up allowing the nobility to keep their titles, though had
>
> had first tried to abolish the entire system. The people wouldn't have it. It
>
> seemed unnatural for there not to be counts, barons, or other lords. So,
>
> Raoden had instead twisted the system to his own ends.[49]

This, in many ways, reflects the notion of monarchy in our primary world, where

power and control are specific to a bloodline, and are passed down as a birth right

rather than something that can be earned with respect and hard work. A person

can marry into a bloodline, but their power is therefore diluted, because they are

not originally of the "chosen few". Sanderson here, however, not only shows that

people desire a class structure, but that it seems to be something that is inherent to

the human psyche. Framing it as "unnatural" indicates that humans feel a need to

---

[47] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 475.
[48] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 613
[49] Sanderson, *Elantris*, p. 613.

have that system in place. Hierarchies are reluctantly maintained by Raoden, though with a sense this system should better reflect the people rather than representing only those in power, hence why he reshapes it. This is clearly individual transformation on the part of Raoden's character, and I would argue that Sanderson's goal here is to reinforce the need for individual change before an entire societal overhaul is possible, especially if that change comes from the top-down. I do not think Sanderson endorses hierarchies per say, but is highlighting that societies tend to rely on them as a crutch rather than taking any serious steps toward building a more equal society.

Pratchett's *Equal Rites* most strongly exemplifies the tackling of social commentary and the author distancing the discussion from the primary world by tying it to their secondary world's magic system. In *Equal Rites* the character Granny Weatherwax 'attacks magical gender prejudice to force a talented girl's admission to the men-only faculty of Unseen University'.[50] In this instance the rights to an equal education, equal opportunities, and workplace equality are all tackled through the medium of the culture around magic within the Discworld's secondary world, while at the same time being a commentary on the same (non-magical) issues in our own primary world. As Janet Brennan Croft points out in her essay:

> on Discworld, witches and wizards occupy totally different niches, are
> trained separately according to traditional concepts of gender-related

---

[50] John Clute, 'Pratchett, Terry', in *The Encyclopedia of Fantasy*, ed. by John Clute and John Grant (London: Orbit, 1997), p. 784.

strengths and weaknesses, and tend to value and excel in different types of work.[51]

What Pratchett ends up with is a split between Witches and Wizards where:

> wizards seem more willing to use magic day-to-day than witches, [yet] both know that magic is subject to specific physical rules; that using too much attracts unwanted attention from the monsters of the Dungeon Dimensions; and that relying too much on magic can scour away one's ethical sense. On Discworld, the truly great witches pride themselves on rarely actually using magic.[52]

The knowledge and skills around magic are something that both males and females have, yet each gender use their knowledge differently and therefore have different values placed on their interaction with it.

> Croft further questions the education of Witches and Wizards, asking:

> What is the significance of co-educational versus single-sex education to issues of gender and power? At heart, the question is: should girls and boys be educated in exactly the same way?[53]

This might very well be the heart of the argument behind Pratchett's gendered magic roles. Is he asking a question about traditional, real world, educational system, yet mirroring it through the Discworld via the lens of magic systems instead? Granny Weatherwax remarks on in *Equal Rites* when she suggests that the magic Wizards practice is:

---

[51] Janet Brennan Croft, 'The Education of a Witch: Tiffany Aching and Hermione Granger, and Gendered Magic in Discworld and Potterworld', in *Mythlore*, 27:3/4, (2009), 129-130.
[52] Croft, p. 130.
[53] Croft, p. 130.

the wrong kind of magic for women […] it's all books and stars and jommetry. […] Witches is a different thing altogether. […] It's magic out of the ground, not out of the sky, and men never could get the hang of it.[54]

As indicated earlier in this thesis, it seems that Weatherwax is declaring that Wizard magic is a form of magic derived from the planets, whereas Witches' magic is nature magic. This is something that appears to have been the distinction between different magic users in our own world's history; men practiced godly magic, and women practiced nature magic. Kieckhefer examines this when he tells us that 'women's natural magic was being interpreted as if it were similar to the demonic magic more often practiced by clerics and at times by other men', which clearly delineates a difference between the magics men and women both used.[55] Either way, we have a clear example of magic within a secondary world being used in different manners by the world's inhabitants, while at the same time, the author of this secondary world is using magic as a social commentary for primary world issues.

If Pratchett had flippantly developed the magic system in the Discworld, leaving it to the realms of 'mystery' for the reader, his commentary may not have come across as strong, nor as effectively as it did. As Croft points out:

one of the most important functions of literature is not to give us pat answers, but to make us think. Fantasy and science fiction in particular encourage the exploration of issues that may be so deeply engrained in our daily lives as to be nearly invisible.[56]

---

[54] Terry Pratchett, *Equal Rites* (New York: New American Library, 1987), p. 8.
[55] Kieckhefer, p. 82.
[56] Croft, p. 140.

Framing gender inequality by highlighting its differences in the Discworld regarding the gendered roles of magic users brings this issue into the light, removing its invisibility. This effectively provides the reader with an exaggerated critique on the real world issue, a "hyper reality" that allows for a critical distance that is not obscured by the details of any particular real case, thereby allowing the reader to think on the issue, rather than take sides with real people.

> These stories make us ask ourselves if it is better to celebrate and privilege differences in ability and innate skills through education tailored to these perceived differences, or to deny any such differences and give the same education to all.[57]

With regards to *Sourcery* (being published after *Equal Rites*), readers get a further insight into the relation between Wizards and magic in a very short passage. As quoted earlier, the eighth son of an eighth son has only one suitable profession, which is to become a wizard. The reader is also told that all of the sons of this wizard will all be powerful wizards themselves, and that his eighth son (the eighth son of an eighth son of an eighth son) is always a Sourcerer, who creates magic himself, rather than simply uses the world's natural store of magic. In this way Pratchett is heavily implying that males on the Discworld are far more attuned to magic and that magic use comes far easier to them than females. The Wizards of the Unseen University, being the guardians or stewards of magic, therefore have a greater sense of their importance, because it is effectively their genetic right. In Pratchett's Lords and Ladies, there is mention of the Witches having once protected the Discworld from the predations of the Elves: 'And there'd been a lot of witches in those days. They'd been able to stop them at every turn, make life in

---

[57] Croft, p. 140.

this world too hot for them. Fought them with iron. Nothing elvish could stand iron', suggesting that there is some balance between how men and women each use magic to defend and protect the world.[58]

The secondary world is then a place where the contemporary social and political issues can be safely discussed by authors. The characters within these worlds can safely embody real world figures, or ideals, without forcibly telling the reader which side of the issue to agree with, while at the same time allowing the reader the opportunity to immerse themselves in the world and alongside the characters, their struggles and the people and cultures around them inside the secondary world. There is strength with Pratchett presenting a clear split between witch and wizard magic on Discworld, for example, as it is not only a commentary on gendered education, and gendered roles told via the stories he tells, but this same commentary is portrayed by the characters that populate the secondary world itself.

The characters believe whole heartedly in their cause, especially in Granny Weatherwax's case in *Equal Rites where* her cause is to prove that the established "old ways" can change, and that women should be allowed the same opportunities where they have the appropriate skills and abilities. In *Sourcery* the wizards all embody the haughty arrogance of men who feel that they are the ones who should be in charge, because this is simply how things have always been. When their system of governance is shaken, this time by a man who has far more power than any of the wizards of the Unseen University themselves, they struggle to adapt to the change, and their arrogance almost costs them everything. Rincewind, a man who is a wizard by name, but bereft of actual magical skill, is the one who saves

---

[58] Pratchett, *Lords and Ladies*, p. 54.

the day, proving that magic is not the method of power, nor the catch-all answer for everything that the wizards, in their arrogance, think it is. The message conveyed to the reader, and the beliefs that the peoples of the Discworld possess are one and the same, and magic as a framework helps to establish this discussion in a fantasy setting. Pratchett does not use the "moral of the story" to get this message across, rather he presents the reader with believable characters who interact with magic in a way that the reader can understand and relate to, and therefore creates characters with whom the reader can empathise, or disagree with, depending on the message he is trying to convey, and also dependant on the reader's own interpretation and values.

Pratchett is not the only practitioner of this method of presenting social commentary, merely the most successful in terms of the authors and secondary worlds in question in this thesis. Sanderson's commentary on class structure and social inequity is also framed around magic, yet is not as directly overt as Pratchett's examination. If real world issues are tackled by the author they must not interfere with the secondary world's own rules. The ideal manner for authors to approach engaging with real world issues would be to first create successful magic systems in fantasy worlds that can then be used as a framework to make these commentaries while at the same time still maintaining the rules, integrity, and internal logic of the magic system. The peoples of the secondary world can still use magic for things, such as conjuring fireballs, but women might only allowed to fulfil certain roles, such as witchcraft, and thus the issue of gender equality becomes a viable facet of the role of magic in this world.

In many contemporary fantasy fictions magic is often depicted as a tool for the characters within the narrative to utilize. Gandalf wields it with skill, for

example, and Tolkien's narrative gives us little explanation into where he gets the power to do so, nor insight into how he manipulates it. Sanderson's Raoden, on the extreme other hand, tells the reader exactly what he is doing, how, and why. My creative piece, *Time Thief*, occupies a space in between these two. The character makes use of magic to overcome an issue, one which is the key source of conflict between her people and their enemy, and the magical tools she uses are introduced. The reader is provided with a mystery about her own magical prowess, much like Tolkien's insistence; however, this does not reflect a mystery about what magic is, merely a mystery as to what her full extent of magical ability might be. In this instance, the reader has already previously been provided with detail on what magic is and where it comes from, now they are witnessing a practical demonstration of that power. Additionally, even though the piece itself was not originally written with this intent, there is a strong case for reading it as a social commentary about historical revisionism, especially negationism, or the denial of historic crimes. For example: Holocaust deniers or academic historians who publish articles to deliberately manipulate and misrepresent historical evidence.

For the purposes of this thesis, I feel that this is a reading of my piece that is extremely apt, whether Bathes would agree or not. The antagonist in *Time Thief* has the express goal to re-write historical events in a manner that benefits their leader, and while in this instance magic is being used to make this change (in this context; this kind of magical interference would result in a fairly definitive and final change to history) in our primary world this change is brought about via manipulation of the truth, destruction of documents, and brainwashing and intimidation tactics. In fact, the antagonist's goal is malicious and self-serving,

much like the goals of real world revisionists who aim to paint themselves in a

better light, try to remove historical events from society's collective memory, or

to generate hatred against a particular group of people where there was previously

no hatred.

Creative Interlude 3

Time Thief

Thala stared into the distance, her gaze unfocused. The afternoon sun was sinking behind the horizon. Visions of times long past ran through her mind. Battles played out in soliloquy. Grand schemes were etched into cobweb and dust. The squalid existence of beggars counter-balanced the sumptuous rich man's feast of life. The Stream of Time magics flowed strongly through this tower, almost a maelstrom. She was always tranquil in the tower, her body soothed. She sat for several hours in silent observation, drinking in the stories. The Vaults of Vashqy were the Chronariads' crowning glory - a testament to her peoples' natural affinity for manipulating time. The library below was alive with history. Codex upon codex inhaled, drawing in events as they occurred. Everything captured in magical text – chronicled for evermore. Everyone's lives recorded in minute detail. Every natural event comprehensively documented. These tomes rested safely on shelves deep inside the Vaults, locked away from meddling hands – those who would use the knowledge for great evil.

Absentmindedly she secreted a few droplets of silica gel from her palm. She rolled the viscous blob between her long graceful fingers until it hardened into an opaque crystal. The tower, and indeed the entire bastion was formed from this same crystalline substance. A construction process that took countless thousands of hours of labour from scores of Chronariad workers. All Chronariad structures were literally built by hand. These crystal buildings shone with a scintillating aura, illuminating the countryside for miles around.

At once the images in Thala's mind shifted. She saw the inner chambers of the library below. An intruder was standing there, about to reach out for a codex. She snapped back into a conscious state and leapt from her stool. The spiral staircase made her dizzy as she ran downward and she paused on the fourth floor. There she found Nessa, one of the tower guards, standing at ease, her short sword leaning against the wall. Thala took her by the elbow and started dragging her to the stairs. Nessa pulled back.

"Hold on, what's the hurry?"

"Intruder in the library!"

"I should raise the alarm."

"No time, just come. NOW!"

The pair rushed down the flights, and a strange sensation crept through Thala's body. She winced as Nessa winked out of existence. Extinguished from history. Her heart was a pit of panic, but all memory of her companion quickly evaporated and Thala continued running. She reached the bottom of the stairs and stumbled through the library's gabled doors. Panting, she cast her vision about.

In the main foyer she spotted the intruder – a fellow Chronariad! Dozens of books floated in the air around her but Thala was unable to see her face. A small obsidian stylus bobbed back and forth between the open pages. The intruder was wearing a hooded cape clasped at the neck by a shining brooch. A livid scar across the back of her hand marked her out as an Envoy of Entropy. *She must be altering the course of chronology*, Thala realised. *Why else would a servant of History's enemy be here?* Her obvious magical prowess suggested that this Envoy would be too powerful to confront head-on, but another option presented itself. Unseen, Thala crept through the aisles, shrouded by books. She reached her

destination and scanned the tomes. Her patience was rewarded and she spied the one she was after. With a deft hand she plucked the book from the shelf. It fell open to the most recent pages and she pulled out her own stylus and began to re-write.

<center>***</center>

Thala stared into the distance, her gaze focusing. The setting sun gave the sky a reddish glow. Visions of times long past jumbled in her mind. Battles in soliloquy. Grand schemes of cobweb and dust. Beggars feasted at the rich man's table. The maelstrom of Time magics flowed strong throughout this tower.

She was usually tranquil here, her body soothed. She sat for a few minutes, restless and squirming on her stool. Something nagged at her thoughts. An itch at the back of her mind. A whisper of a memory.

She stood and made her way downstairs, her subconscious dragging her onward. She paused on the fourth floor and nodded a greeting to Nessa, the level's guard, before continuing. She encountered no-one else on the way and reached the library soon after. She strode through the library's gabled doors and stood in the main foyer. Her eyes narrowed as she cast her vision about, scanning the shelves and the doorway. Nothing seemed out of the ordinary. Her thoughts nagged at her once again and she started pacing the aisles. Without thinking, she reached out and with a deft hand she plucked a codex from the shelves. It fell open to the most recent pages and she gasped at the words that formed before her. She readied her stylus and took up a position by the library doors.

She tapped her foot as she waited, her soft padded toes made barely any

<center>156</center>

sound. The wait was short and she soon found herself standing face-to-face with another Chronariad. The intruder's long neck bore a hooded cape that flowed over her back. Her tall graceful form was hidden within the bulk of the garment. The hood was clasped around her lithe shoulders with a shining brooch. A livid scar across the back of her hand marked her out as an Envoy of Entropy – the enemy of History.

"Stop right there!" Thala ordered. She held her implement hovering above the page. "You are discovered. Surrender now and your punishment will be light. Do anything else and I will strike you from time." She motioned at the open book. "Your choice."

The intruder blinked, stunned that she had been caught so easily.

"I made it here with no problems. Why should I let you stop me now?" She took a step forward and raised her hand. Thala struck the page at speed. The Envoy doubled over, clutching at her chest.

"That's your final warning. Surrender now." Thala was almost growling. Her opponent sneered.

"Never!" She raised her hand once more, but Thala struck the page again. Her nimble hand leapt about, writing and re-writing. Her implement became a blur and the Envoy let out a scream before she winked out of existence. The scream's echo ceased and the library was safe.

Thala replaced the codex and took down the Tome of Remembrance. She made a note in the latest page and returned upstairs to her quiet contemplation. She was satisfied that she had upheld the Chronariad vow to protect History. They called themselves the Matrons of Time for a reason, after all. Why some of her fellow kin would choose to work against this natural order, however, was a

mystery she felt she would never comprehend.

She picked up her stylus with a light touch. Its obsidian hue glinted in the sun as she turned it slowly between her fingers. She paused and tapped the end of the implement against her nose. With a sigh she turned on her stool and gazed out the window. The sun was setting, the dying red rays scintillated as they reflected off one of the Vaults of Vashqy's many towers. A thought struck Thala's mind and she looked down at the tome in her off hand. The pages were still fresh and gilded. Plenty of history had already passed through its pages, yet the tome was barely three decades old. She idly caressed the embossed letters on the cover - a name. Her name. She held her history in her own hand, obsidian stylus poised in the other. She blinked and began to write.

<p style="text-align:center">***</p>

The meadows were damp with morning dew. The air tickled her lungs as she ran, frolicking and leaping through the long grass. If she crouched, she could hide. Her mothers couldn't see her here. They were a short distance away, playing along. Crouching in the grass, chasing and laughing.

"Thaaalaaa! Where are you? We're going to find you and tickle you!"

She giggled and kept her head down. A sweet scented wild flower brushed her face. She blinked the pollen away and heard her mothers' calls stop mid sentence. She parted the blades before her face, squinting to see where they had gone. They were nowhere to be found! She panicked, blinking rapidly. She leapt to her full height and ran. Her voice squeaked as she yelled out their names. She struggled through the grass, almost swimming in its thickness.

Tears streamed down her cheeks as she came to a halt. She'd found them, but something was wrong - they weren't moving! They looked perfectly fine, crouching down in the grass, hidden in a playful stance. Ready to leap out and tickle Thala when they grabbed her. They *weren't moving*. Their chests never rose, never fell. Their eyelids refused to blink. Thala's heart began to race faster. Its rhythm almost knocked her off her feet. She grabbed their arms, tugged their legs, pushed and pulled to no avail. She couldn't rouse, or even move them. She threw her head back to stare at the heavens, half praying for an answer. She stood motionless, eyes wide and jaw quivering. A bird in flight hovered directly overhead. Frozen. Unmoving. Another airborne flock of birds in the distance maintained their position also.

Thala screamed, and everything began moving again. Her mothers leapt to their feet, scooping her up into their arms. Concern trickled from their eyes and they smothered her forehead with kisses. She snuggled into their embrace and balled her eyes up tight, her little head pounding to their heartbeat.

<p style="text-align:center">***</p>

The Envoy of Entropy stood in the library's gabled doorway. She defied Thala's orders. Defied the rites of the Matrons of Time. Thala hoped she'd gained the upper hand - this Envoy clearly had stronger magical prowess. She offered the Envoy the chance to surrender.

"Do anything else and I will strike you from time." She motioned at the book she held open in her hand. "Your choice."

The Envoy blinked and spat some defiant words. She stepped forward,

raising her hand. Thala blinked and the Envoy paused mid-stride. The silent library hummed with soundlessness. She stabbed her stylus down at the page, writing swiftly as she blinked again. The Envoy doubled over, clutching at her chest.

"That's your final warning. Surrender now." Thala was almost growling. Her opponent sneered. As the Envoy raised her hand once more, Thala repeatedly blinked and wrote. To the Envoy's eyes her hand would look like a blur, darting across the page. Her writing complete, she blinked a final time. The Envoy screamed and flickered, winking out of existence. Thala made a note of the encounter in the Tome of Remembrance and made her way back upstairs. Her head swam and she sat back down on her stool. She gazed out the window at the midday sun, and let visions of times long past run through her mind.

<center>***</center>

Early morning birdsong greeted her ears. She half opened her eyes, the sun was too bright this morning. She dragged the blankets over her face and tried to force herself back to sleep. There was a knocking at her door.

"Time to wake up dear," her mother Aulis sang. "And don't try to mess with time, you know how much of a headache that gives you!"

"Just a few more minutes!" she called back. "It's too early!"

"Not early enough, my dear. You'll be late for - "

Thala groaned. She rolled over and pressed her face into her pillow. She blinked and managed to drift off to sleep again. She dreamed of ages long past. History swirling through the Streams of Chronomantic magic. Kings dethroned

and disgraced. Paupers paraded through the streets for their heroism. Droughts and floods. Histories belonging to the Realm of Time and many other Realms beyond. She dreamed until she was rested and awoke to the empty sound of timeless silence. She grinned and blinked again.

" - class! Now hurry up!"

She grabbed her temples and rubbed them. *How long was it that time?* She slunk out of bed and dressed herself. She felt something warm on her lip and pressed a finger to it. *Blood!* It was dripping from her nose. Her head throbbed and a steady flow of blood streamed from her nose. She managed to utter a cracked plea for help before collapsing onto her bed. *Too long* she thought as the world went black.

<center>***</center>

She stopped writing and tapped the end of her stylus. The silence of timelessness enveloped her; more comforting than a warm blanket. She blinked. The bird calls echoed out across the horizon. The setting sun continued its slow retreat. This time of day was always the most peaceful. She rubbed her temples and looked at the page before her. She sighed and spun her stylus in her fingers. She looked at the top of the page and thought. Slowly, she daubed a title. Looped letters and smooth calligraphy: *My Power, My Pain*.

Conclusion

This thesis has explored magic as a fundamental part of immersive fantasy, arguing that in order to create fully realised and believable worlds authors need to present magic in a consistent and coherent fashion. By exploring the importance of magic in the narrative, the significance of magic to world building, the connections between magic in secondary worlds and magic in the real world, the way in which characters interact with magic, and the way in which representations of magic can connect to real world social issues I have demonstrated the symbiotic nature of magic and fantasy and the need for careful thought in its depiction. In conjunction with this critical analysis I have also journeyed through this thesis as a creative writer eager to hone his skills. It is this writer's voice, evident already in the excerpts between chapters, that comes more immediately to the fore in these concluding reflections.

As a writer of fantasy fiction, this thesis has proven to be an invaluable guide to writing about magic in my own secondary world. For the most part, my own magic has been primarily influenced by the Warhammer World, especially regarding breaking down a greater single source of magic into smaller streams that specifically relate to independently different categories of magic. A close reading analysis of some of my work to date, in particular *Time Thief*, shows that prior to coming to terms with the freedom that fantasy fiction offers an author to write about real world issues, I had already engaged with social commentary via my own fiction. It has also become apparent that I follow strongly in Sanderson's wake, being a proponent of fully realised magic systems as an inherent feature of

fantasy, despite having never read any of his work before embarking on this thesis.

Since I have been immersed in Games Workshop's Warhammer World for close to twenty years, it is understandable that their authors' way of presenting magic has defined my own method. Although I have read few of the novels set in the secondary world itself the myriad collection of short stories and 'colour pieces' scattered throughout the rulebooks and armybooks more than adequately paint a picture of the larger world building that was undertaken in writing about the secondary world. As with Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*, the Warhammer World has a rich and detailed world history with focuses on magic-based wars against the forces of Chaos, race-specific clashes with other races and cultures, fully described figures (characters) of political and historic importance, but above all, a fully integrated magic system that is as equally known and understood by the magicians of the secondary world as it is by the readers. Until now, I had always admired the breadth and depth of this fictional undertaking, but have since developed a far greater respect for it.

The characters within the Warhammer World are all fully realised and believable, and despite canonical alterations (ret-cons if you will) between editions of the game's core rules set, all cohesively tied into the life-stories of each other. There are tropes drawn from Tolkien (elves, dwarfs, dragons and orcs for example) but these too are fleshed out in their own right, becoming far more than Tolkien's original representation. The function of world building is, in my view, complete in all aspects, and as I have shown in this thesis, magic plays a key role in drawing all these aspects together.

Terry Pratchett's Discworld has proven to be similar in nature as an influence on my own writing, though now in the new light of the possibility of fantasy fiction as a mode for discussing social issues (such as gender inequality), his works provide me with a new window into the wider cultural impact fantasy can have on our primary world. His secondary world is as fleshed out and believable as the Warhammer World is to me, though now it has a new shade of culture added to it, whereas the Warhammer World still remains more seated in the realms of entertainment. I wish to combine the two with my own fiction, and this thesis has given me the understanding with which to proceed toward that goal.

I have long considered characters to be an important feature in fantasy, and indeed in any fiction, with magic being something explained, but far more in the background of the overall storytelling process. The two need not be mutually exclusive. Brandon Sanderson's *Elantris* has taught me that weaving a protagonist's quest into the reader's understanding of the secondary world's magic system can create both a deeper character study and simultaneously educate the reader on how magic works in that world. There can still be mystery attached to magic that keep the reader engaged with the secondary world, especially in discussing this mystery with other readers, but this should not in itself break the reader's immersion. Nor should the author rely on lengthy exposition to explain elements of world building importance, such as magic, but also history or science. At the same time, I contend that explaining things does not destroy the mystery of the fantasy setting for the reader, rather it includes the reader in the process of building the world in their own minds – giving them the relevant details with which to imagine and believe this secondary world. The author's effort is therefore to maintain consistent and coherent elements, rather than falling back on

deus ex machina, or using magic to "explain away" failed plot points, or to get characters out of situations where the author has no other sense of resolution.

The highlighted gulf between critics and scholars examining the genre of fantasy itself has also been of value to me as a writer. Since no two scholars seem to agree on what fantasy is, I am far more at ease about how fantasy authors also disagree with each other on the definition. Since 2005 I have pondered the apparent conflict between Pratchett and J. K. Rowling following her comments that she 'was "not a huge fan of fantasy" and was trying to "subvert" the genre'.[1] Pratchett's response was that '[e]ver since *The Lord of the Rings* revitalised the genre, writers have played with it, reinvented it, subverted it and bent it to their times'.[2] Any disagreement about what fantasy is, or is not, will always be likely, and with more than half a decade's worth of scholarship on the subject and still no definitive common term, this is not likely to change in the future. This understanding has helped me jettison   fears about being separated from other fantasy authors who adhere to "magic as a mystery" as their defining trope for their secondary world, since I will instead be paired with authors such as Sanderson who relish in writing a fully realised magic system integrated into their world building. In a similar sense, Bathe's *Death of the Author* was once something that gave me pause about inadvertently writing something that could be taken the wrong way. Since I previously overlooked Pratchett's overt discussion of societal issues, and have only recently considered Sanderson's reflections on class commentary, I have a greater understanding about how readers' interpretation can work toward stronger world building, further accepting magic

---

[1] BBC News, 'Pratchett takes swipe at Rowling', in BBC News (2005),
     <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/entertainment/4732385.stm> [accessed 17/10/2015]
[2] BBC News.

as an important feature of the secondary world, both world-wise and culturally for its inhabitants.

The element of sourcebooks adds a further positive dimension to the practice of fantasy fiction, one that I can relate to. As previously discussed, the Warhammer World's expansive world history is largely doled out through the rulebooks and armybooks for the game's various factions. This allows the novels to mention magic and perhaps provide a cursory explanation without getting into too much unnecessary exposition. While I do not think this is entirely ideal for a fantasy setting primarily focused on novels, this does work for a game. In a slightly different vein, the Fighting Fantasy series of adventure gamebooks has its own source material, partly aimed at roleplaying game-centric information, but also, in the case of its book *Titan: The Fighting Fantasy World*, as a tome covering world history and detailing some heroes and villains of particular note.[3] This book drew together much of the world that had been written about by the series' various authors and established them as being part of a single coherent world. While it does not provide a satisfactory explanation about the nature of magic on Titan, it does provide other world building elements and establishes itself as a possible example for my own extended world building for my secondary world. Sourcebooks are a relevant world building technique, but should not make the narrative of the actual novels any weaker. Through fusing the knowledge I have garnered pertaining to blending magic into the narrative and characters, I can hope to produce a world-encyclopaedia such as *Titan*, but as a tome that compliments my own novels.

---

[3] Steve Jackson and Ian Livingstone, *Titan: The Fighting Fantasy World*, ed. by Marc Gascoigne (Middlesex: Penguin Books Ltd, 1986).

Regarding my own creative writing pieces I feel that prior to undertaking this research I had already formed an opinion similar to Sanderson's about the importance of explaining magic. In 'The Pyromancer' I was conscious of not presenting all the rules of magic at once, and even kept some of the detail out of the story. Some of this detail may appear in the expanded narrative of which 'The Pyromancer' forms a part, though it will be more world building than character development. As with Raoden's story-arc in *Elantris*, once the character has gained an understanding of magic, further details do not need to be explained through their eyes: the reader can experience them instead. *Thauramancy* as an experiment in both excessive exposition and world building certainly would need work should it appear in a world-encyclopedia such as *Titan*, but in this thesis it serves the purpose of exemplifying how an author can know all the details of their secondary world and simultaneously tell the reader too much at once. Should the piece be developed as part of a fictional narrative, it would need to be greatly expanded and the character of the wizard would need to feature more prominently for it to lose its expositionary nature. *Time Thief* largely stands alone, although it too presents the reader with wider aspects of magic in my secondary world, as well as other world building information. If I were to re-write this piece I would now research the issue of historical revisionism, especially negationism and uncover what the motivations behind such actions are, so as to better represent this in the piece. Previously I had aimed at avoiding making fantasy-based statements about social or political issues, but I feel now that I have more of an understanding how to weave them into my narratives, especially through tying them to the magic system in my secondary world.

Bibliography

Al-Hakim, Ghayat, *Picatrix: The Goal of the Wise,* ed. by William Kiesel
(Washington: Ouroboros Press, 2002)

Attebery, Brian, *Stories about Stories: Fantasy and the Remaking of Myth* (New
York: Oxford University Press, 2014)

Auden, W. H., 'The Quest Hero' in *Tolkien and the Critics: Essays on J. R. R.
Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Neil David Isaacs and Rose A.
Zimbado (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968)

Bathes, Roland, 'The Death of the Author' in *Twentieth Century Literary Theory:
A Reader*, ed. by K. M. Newton (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1997)

BBC News, 'Pratchett takes swipe at Rowling', in BBC News (2005),
<http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/entertainment/4732385.stm> [accessed
17/10/2015]

Bowker, John, 'Magic' in *The Concise Oxford Dictionary of World Religions*
(Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000),
<http://www.oxfordfreference.com.ezproxy.waikato.ac.nz/view/10.1093/a
cref/9780192800947.001.0001/acref-9780192800947-e-
4438?rskey=rbAA2k&result=5> [accessed 03/04/2015]

Cavatore, Alessio, *Warhammer Armies: Skaven* (Nottingham: Games Workshop
Ltd, 2002)

Chambers, Andy and Bill King, *Warhammer Armies: High Elves* (Nottingham:
Games Workshop Ltd, 1993)

Clark, Stuart, *Thinking With Demons: The Idea of Witchcraft in Early Modern
Europe* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999)

Clute, John and John Grant, eds., *The Encyclopedia of Fantasy*, (London: Orbit, 1997)

Croft, Janet Brennan, 'The Education of a Witch: Tiffany Aching and Hermione Granger, and Gendered Magic in Discworld and Potterworld', in *Mythlore*, 27:3.4 (2009), 129-140

Frazer, James George, Sir, *The Golden Bough: A Study in Magic and Religion* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994)

Fuller, Edmund, 'The Lord of the Hobbits: J. R. R. Tolkien', in *Tolkien and the Critics: Essays on J. R. R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings,* ed. by Neil David Isaacs and Rose A. Zimbado (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968)

Games Workshop Design Studio, *Archaon: The End Times - Volume V* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 2014)

Hartner, Willy, 'Notes On Picatrix' in *Isis,* 56.4 (1965), 438-451

Hume, Kathryn, *Fantasy and Mimesis: Responses to Reality in Western Literature* (New York: Methuen, 1984)

Irwin, W. R., *The Game of the Impossible: A Rhetoric of Fantasy*, (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1976)

Isaacs, Neil D., 'On the Possibilities of Writing Tolkien Criticism', in *Tolkien and the Critics: Essays on J. R. R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Neil David Isaacs and Rose A. Zimbado (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968)

Jackson , Rosemary, *Fantasy: The Literature of Subversion* (London: Methuen, 1981)

Jackson, Steve and Ian Livingstone, *Titan: The Fighting Fantasy World*, ed. by

Marc Gascoigne (Middlesex: Penguin Books Ltd, 1986)

James, Edward and Farah Mendlesohn, *The Cambridge Companion to Fantasy

Literature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012)

Lévi-Strauss, Claude, *The Savage Mind* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press,

1966)

Kieckhefer, Richard, *Forbidden Rites: A Necromancer's Manual of the Fifteenth

Century* (Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1998)

Kisor, Yvette, 'Totemic Reflexes in Tolkien's Middle-Earth', in *Mythlore*, 28:3.4

(2010), pp. 129-140

'Magic' in *Reader's Digest Oxford Complete Wordfinder*, ed. by Sara Tulloch

(London: Reader's Digest Association Limited, 1993), p. 918

Manlove, Colin N., *Modern Fantasy: Five Studies* (Cambridge: Cambridge

University Press, 1975)

Mendlesohn, Farah, *Rhetorics of Fantasy* (Middletown: Wesleyan University

Press, 2008)

Meyer-Spacks, Patricia, 'Power and Meaning in Lord of the Rings' in *Tolkien and

the Critics: Essays on J. R. R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. by. Neil

David Isaacs and Rose A. Zimbado (Notre Dame: University of Notre

Dame Press, 1968)

O'Neil, Dennis, 'Magic and Religion' (2006),

<http://anthro.palomar.edu/religion/rel_5.htm> [accessed 23/04/2015]

Pirinen, Tuomas, *Mordheim* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 1999)

Pramas, Chris, *Warhammer Fantasy Roleplay* (Nottingham: Games Workshop

Ltd, 2004)

Pratchett, Terry, *The Colour of Magic* (London: Colin Smythe Limited, 1983)

— *Equal Rites* (New York: New American Library, 1987)

— *A Hat Full of Sky* (London: Random House, 2004)

— *Lords and Ladies* (London: HarperCollins Publishers Ltd, 1992)

Pratchett, Terry and Stephen Briggs, *The Discworld Companion: An Invaluable Guide For The Discerning Discworld Traveller*, (Glasgow: Victor Gollancz Ltd, 1994)

Priestly, Rick, *Warhammer Armies: Orcs and Goblins* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 1993)

— *Warhammer: Rulebook* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 1996)

Priestly, Rick and Jake Thornton, *Warhammer Orcs & Goblins* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 2000)

Reilly, R. J., 'Tolkien and the Fairy Story' in *Tolkien and the Critics: Essays on J. R. R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Neil David Isaacs and Rose A. Zimbado (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968)

Reynolds, Anthony, *Warhammer Armies: Bretonnia* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 2003)

Reynolds, Anthony and Matthew Ward, *Warhammer Armies: Wood Elves* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd 2005)

Rosegrant, John, 'Tolkien's Dialogue Between Enchantment and Loss', *Mythlore*, 33.2 (2015), 129-140

Sanderson, Brandon, *Elantris* (London: Gollancz, 2011)

— *The Hero of Ages* (London: Victor Gollancz LTD, 2010)

— 'Sanderson's First Law', (2007),

<http://brandonsanderson.com/sandersons-first-law/> [accessed 12/5/2015]

— *The Way of Kings*, (New York: Tom Doherty Associates, LLC, 2010)

Styers, Randall, *Making Magic: Religion, Magic and Science in the Modern World* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004)

Todorov, Tzvetan, *The Fantastic*: *A Structural Approach to a Literary Genre* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1975)

Tolkien, J. R. R., 'Letter 131', in *The Letters of J. R. R. Tolkien*, ed. by Humphrey Carpenter and Christopher Tolkien, (Glasgow: George Allen and Unwin, 1981)

— 'On Fairy Stories', in *Tree and Leaf*, (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1964), 9-73

— *The Lord of the Rings* (London: HarperCollins, 1995)

Vetock, Jeremy, *Warhammer Orcs & Goblins* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 2010)

Ward, Matthew, *Warhammer: The Game of Fantasy Battles* (Nottingham: Games Workshop Ltd, 2010)

Wolf, Mark J. P., *Building Imaginary Worlds* (New York: Routledge, 2012)